CHAPTER IV

CONCLUSION

The main purpose of this research is to find the reason why economic inequality is increasing in India, especially after the 1991 Economic Reforms. Grounding the analysis on theories and concepts provided in Chapter I and using data elaborated in Chapter II and III, the author finds several reasons and it can be concluded as follows:

First, the fact that India was once a low-income country, India now has evolved into one of the fastest growing economies in the world. This change is triggered by India's shift in economic orientation to a more market-oriented one from previously a socialist economy. The change of orientation explained in Chapter II happened through the process of imitation where India learned from its Western counterpart and altered the way of its economic management. It is safe to say that India's rapid pace of development can be associated with the 1991 Economic Reforms, since only after the reforms India experienced such tremendous economic growth. India's GDP has sextupled since 1990, with merely US\$ 507 billion in 1990 but skyrocketing to US\$ 2.85 trillion in 2018. This magnificent increase shows that the economic reform has delivered a massive success to India's dwindling economy due to the balance of payment crisis.

-

¹⁶⁷ "India: GDP in Constant 2010 US\$", The World Bank, accessed on June 30, 2019, https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.MKTP.KD?locations=IN

However, it is not appropriate to measure the success of policy from one indicator only. GDP might be the simplest indicator to gauge the quantity of growth, but not to measure the quality and whether the development is enjoyed by all layers of society. India is the real example for this; with an amazing GDP increase, it suffers an all-time high economic inequality, a prove that particular policies aimed at economic development might have some unwanted consequences. To make it different from other researches that also discuss the same matter, this thesis focus on the economic inequality face by each income group and the afterwards repercussions as the result of inequality.

Second, as India experiences an all-time high economic inequality, the affluent are getting richer and the poor are let to suffer. The author uses several indicators to prove this claim, which includes the Gini coefficient, share of national income captured by each income group, amount of spending for food per income group, and amount of spending for education per income group. The result shows that India experienced a hike in its Gini coefficient and the affluent capture more wealth percentage right now rather than they were twenty years ago prior to the reforms. Since the wealthy are only getting richer, they can utilize all that money to afford better education and be free from starvation. On the other hand, the destitute can only rely on an insignificant pay check and poor social welfare provided by the Indian Government, which is not sufficient at all to maintain a healthy and productive life.

Third, the root cause of the inequality lies beneath the 1991 Economic Reforms. The reforms change the direction of India's economy to a more liberal

one, which also affects policy making in India. The relations between policy change in India and economic inequality are as follows:

- 1. The reforms demanded budget cuts in all public sectors, including the agriculture sector. Cuts in agriculture sector become significant since 60% of Indians rely on agriculture to make a living. Thus, even the slightest change could affect a lot of people. Cuts in agriculture expenditure resulted in reduction of farmer subsidies and any other pro-farmer policies. Not only that, to make sure India's agriculture products remain competitive in the market and to not destroy the market, the Indian Government make the minimum price so low to the point it does not cover the production cost. As expected, it makes the farmers must deal with the declining income.
- 2. On the other hand, non-farming workers (especially in the service sectors such as finance, banking, information technology, and consultancy service) enjoy a tremendous income growth due to unprecedented foreign direct investment inflow to India as result of India's market openness. This sectoral bias is problematic since only a small percentage of individuals in India benefit from this trend shift. Only those who are equipped with university degree and skill set could access this opportunity and unfortunately only small amounts of individuals in India have the luxury of affording tertiary education.
- 3. That phenomenon happened also because the Government of India curbs the provision of basic social service, including education. The Indian Government's budget for education remains at less than 3.5% of its GDP

and that budget is majorly allocated for elementary education (while actually tertiary education is what is needed for a social mobilization). To fill that gap, the private sector comes in and build more private universities, with a very high price tag which makes it inaccessible for most Indian citizens, exacerbating the education disparity.

4. The glorified privatization that allows entrepreneurs to play a significant part in India's economy only worsen the inequality. The Indian Government gives license for business to operate, including the license to operate public sectors. Thus, it can be said that the private entrepreneurs obtained money and benefitted from public matters, making others pay to them. Central Government also made some business deals and special projects agreement with the rich, making the money circulation lies only within the rich and does not trickle down to the poor.

In a nutshell, the reason why India faces unprecedented economic inequality is because the policies enacted during the Economic Reforms only benefits the rich and strip the poor off of the capacity to mobilize socially. Economic inequality that happened in India is not limited by geographical limitation since it hits India as a whole and stratify its society. Hiding in the mask of economic development, economic inequality is perceived as a by-product of growth and it is normal to experience one. This normalization is also the reason why the Indian Government never take it seriously, thinking that the current situation is justified. And as for final words, it can be said that as long as these policies are continued being

implemented, it will be very hard to reduce the rampant inequality in India and seeing an equally prosperous India is a long way to go.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books

- Berg, Bruce L. Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences, 4th Edition. California: Pearson Education Company. (2001): p. 35
- Chandra, Bipan, Mukherjee, Mridula, and Mukherjee, Aditya. India Since Independence. New Delhi: Penguin Books India. (2008): p. 26
- Creswell, John W. Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches, the 4th Edition. California: Sage Publication. (2014): p. 109
- Hurd, Ian. The Oxford Handbook of International Relations. Oxford University Press. (2008): p.300
- Jackson, Robert and Sorensen, George. Introduction to International Relations Theories and Approach 3rd Edition. Oxford University Press. (2006): p.164
- Khilnani, Sunil. The Idea of India. New Delhi: Penguin Books India. (2012): p.81-82
- Kotwal, Ashok, Ramaswami, Bharat, and Wadhwa, Wilima. Economic Liberalization and Indian Economic Growth: What's the Evidence. Journal of Economic Literature. (2018): p. 1160.
- Onuf, Nicholas, Kubalkova, Vendulka, and Kowert, Paul. Constructivism: A User's Manual: International Relations in a Constructed World. New York: Routledge. p.60

Journals

- Acharyya, Rajat. Trade Liberalization, Poverty, and Income Inequality in India. *INRM Policy Brief No. 10.* (2006): p.3-4.
- Ahluwalia, Montek. India's Economic Reforms: Achievements and Next Steps. Asian Economic Policy Review. Vol. 14. (2019): p. 48
- Ahluwalia, Montek. Economic Reforms in India since 1991: Has Gradualism Worked?, The Journal of Economic Perspectives. Vol 16. No. 3. (2002): p.1-10, 77-79.
- Aiyar, Swaminathan S.A. Twenty-Five Years of Indian Economic Reform. Policy Analysis Cato Institute. No. 803. (2016)

- Alam, Khabirul and Halder, Ujjwal Kummar. The Emergence and Impact of Privatization of Higher Education: Indian Overview. Journal of Education and Development. Vol. 6 No. 12. (2016): p. 148.
- Amutha, D and Juliet, M. The Role of the Service Sector in the Indian Economy. St. Mary's College of California. (2017): p. 4.
- Bank, World. Stabilization and Fiscal Empowerment: The Twin Challenges Facing India's States. World Bank's Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Unit South Asia Region. Vol. I. (2004): p.9
- Chauhan, Rajesh K. Regional Estimates of Poverty and Inequality in India 1993-2012. Springer Science + Business Media. (2016): p. 1249-1296
- Das, Katrick. India: From License and Inspection Raj to the Triumph of Reforms. The IUP Journal of Managerial Economic. Vol. IX. No. 04. (2011): p. 7.
- Dutt, Amitaya Krishna. Uncertain Success: The Political Economy of Indian Economic Reforms. Journal of International Affairs. Vol. 51. No. 01. (1997): p. 71
- Fujita, Koichi. Green Revolution in India and Its Significance in Economic Development: Implications for Sub-Saharan Africa. Centre for Southeast Asian Studies Kyoto University. p. 6-9
- Gandhi, Aditi and Walton, Michael. Where Do India's Billionaire Get Their Wealth?. Economic and Political Weekly. Vol. 47 No. 40. (2012): p. 12
- Gehring, Keith. Economic Growth and Income Inequality in India. Indian Journal of Economics and *Business*. (2016): p.5.
- Harlalka, Minu. Wages by Education in India: Some Basic Facts. International Journal of Management and Research and Review. Vol. 02 No. 05. (2012): p. 874.
- Hotze, Timothe, Pita, Morales. Analyzing India's Democratic Combination of Growth and Poverty Reduction. Journal of Business and Educational Leadership, Volume 4, No.1. (2013): p. 12-21.
- Joshi, Vijay. Macro-Economic Stabilization in India, 1991- 1993 and Beyond. Economic and Political Weekly. Vol. 2. No. 49. (1993): p. 2662.
- Kuevibulvanich, Kanit. Trade Liberalization and Wealth Inequality. *Job Market Paper*. (2016): p. 4.

- Kotz, David M., McDonough, Terrence. Global Neoliberalism and the Contemporary Social Structure of Accumulation. Cambridge University Press. (2008): p.4.
- Mishra, Ashok. K. Agriculture and Rural Development in India since 1947. American Journal of Agricultural Economics. Vol. 92. Issue 4. (July 2010): p. 1256
- Nayar, Baldev Raj. Political Structure and India's Reforms of the 1990s. Pacific Affair. Vol. 71 No. 03. (1998): p.10
- Nayar, Deepak. India Unfinished Journey Transforming Growth into Development. Modern Asian Studies. Volume 40. (United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press). (2006). p.797-832.
- Pal, Parthapratim and Ghosh, Jayati. Inequality in India: A Survey of Recent Trends. DESA Working Paper. No. 4. (2007): p. 18.
- Parameswari, Bala. Abolition of Zamindari System and Its Impact on Agriculture. Imperial Journal of Interdisciplinary Research. Vol. 02. Issue 4. (2016): p. 1-2.
- Pazri, Tinaz. Is India Becoming More Liberal? Globalization, Economic Liberalization, and Social Values. Journal of Global Initiatives. Vol 13 No. 01. (2018): p.116
- Rama, Kusumba Seetha. Agrarian Change from Above and Below. Om Publications Faridabad. (2001): p.7
- Rao, M. Govinda. Tax Reform in India: Achievements and Challenges. Asia Pacific Development Journal. Vol. 07. No. 02. (2000): p. 68
- Satija, Kalpana C. Economic Reforms and Social Justice in India. International Journal of Social Economics. Vol 36. No. 09. (2009): p. 946
- Sebby, Kathryn. The Green Revolution of the 1960s and Its Impact on Small Farmers in India. The Environmental Studies Program at the University of Nebraska- Lincoln. (2010): p. 4
- Siggel, Eckhard. Poverty Alleviation and Economic Reforms in India. Progress in Development Studies 10, Volume 3. Sage Publications. (2010): p. 247- 259.
- Singh, Navjit. Indian Agriculture: Before and After Economic Reforms. European Journal of Business and Management. Vol. 03 No. 04. (2011): p. 293.

- Srivastava, S.K and Chand, Ramesh. Tracking Transition in Calorie- Intake among Indian Households: Insights and Policy Implications. Agricultural Economic Research Review. Vol.30 No. 01. (2017): p. 27.
- Wendt, Alexander. Collective Identity Formation and the International State. American Political Science Review. Vol. 88. (1994): p. 385-398

Reports

- Alvaredo, Facundo, Chancel, Lucas, Piketty, Thomas, Saez, Emanuel, and Zucman, Gabriel. 2018 World Inequality Report. p. 46.
- Banga, Rashmi and Das, Abhijit. Twenty Years of India's Liberalization: Experiences and Lessons. Centre for WTO Studies of UNCTAD. (2012): p. 9.
- Cerra, Valerie and Saxena, Sweta Chaman. What Caused the 1991 Currency Crisis in India?. IMF Working Paper. (2000): p.5
- Chancel, Lucas, Piketty, Thomas. 2017. Indian Income Inequality 1922- 2015: From British Raj to Billionaire Raj?. *World Working Paper Series. Vol.11*. p.4-5.
- Grebmer, Klaus V., Bernstein, Jill, Patterson, Fraser, and Sonntag, Andrea. 2018 Global Hunger Index. Welthungerlife Germany Dublin. (2018): p. 13
- Institute, The World Bank. Introduction to Poverty Analysis. (August 2005): p. 97
- Interest, In the Public. How Privatization Increases Inequality Report. (2016)
- Kanbur, Ravi, Rhee, Changyong, and Zhuang, Juzhong. Inequality in Asia and The Pacific: Trends, Drivers, and Policy Implications. Asian Development Bank. New York: Routledge. (2014): p. 7.
- Shorrocks, Anthony, Davies, James, and Lluberas, Rodrigo. Credit Suisse Global Wealth Report 2018. (2018): p. 42.
- Unit, United Nations Development Strategy and Policy Analysis. Concepts of Inequality, Development Issues No.1. (2015)

Official Document

- India, Ministry of Human Resource Development of Government of. 2016. All India Survey on Higher Education 2015- 2016. p. 11.
- India, Open Government Data Platform of Government of. 2018. GDP of India and Major Sectors of Economy, Share of Each Sector to GDP and Growth of GDP and Other Sectors on Economy 1951-52 Onward. Accessed on June 10, 2019. https://data.gov.in/catalog/gdp-india-and-major-sectors-economy-share-each-sector-gdp-and-growth-rate-gdp-and-other
- India, University Grant Commission. 2017. University Grant Commission: Statewise List of Private Universities as on 18.09.2017. Accessed on June 22, 2019. https://www.ugc.ac.in/oldpdf/Private%20University/Private%20University%20 Consolidated%20List%20Private%20Universities%20as%20on%2019.09.2017.pdf
- The Indian Government. 1949. The Constitution of India. The Seventh Schedule. Article 246. New Delhi

Digital Source

- 10 Facts on Illiteracy in India that You Must Know. Oxfam India. Accessed on June 19, 2019. https://www.oxfamindia.org/featuredstories/10-facts-illiteracy-india-you-must-know
- Atal Bihari Vajpayee's Policies Helped Scripted High Growth in 2003- 08. The Economic Times India. Accessed on July 27, 2019. https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/vajpayees-policies-helped-script-high-growth-in-2003-08/articleshow/65432798.cms?from=mdr
- Bank, The World. Employment Service: India. Accessed on June 11, 2019. https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.SRV.EMPL.ZS?locations=IN
- Bank, The World. *GDP Growth (Annual Percentage)*. Accessed September 17, 2018. https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.MKTP.KD.ZG?end=2017&start =1961&view=chart
- Bank, The World. India's GDP Growth (Annual). Accessed on May 24, 2019. https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.MKTP.KD.ZG?end=2017&locations=IN&start=2009

- Bank, The World. India: GDP in Constant 2010 US\$". Accessed on June 30, 2019. https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.MKTP.KD?locations=IN
- Bank, The World. India's Poverty Profile. Accessed on May 31, 2019. http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/infographic/2016/05/27/india-s-poverty-profile
- Beniwal, Hemant. Cost of Higher Education in India- Infographic and Calculator. The Financial Liberates. Accessed on June 22, 2019. https://www.tflguide.com/cost-of-higher-education-in-india-calculator-infographics/
- Bhattacharya, Pramit. Which are the top sectors that generate employment in India?. Mint. Accessed on June 10, 2019. https://www.livemint.com/Politics/7XXmUWyxkSEGKoWXJqUuHM/Whichare-the-top-sectors-that-generate-employment-in-India.html
- Biwas, Soutik. Is India's Middle Class Actually Poor?. BBC. Accessed on May 24, 2019. https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-41264072
- Budget Allocation for Agriculture in India through the Years. Business Insider India. Accessed on June 11, 2019. https://www.businessinsider.in/budget-allocation-for-agriculture-in-india/articleshow/67778088.cms
- Chakravarty, Manas. The Class Divide in Indian Education System. Mint. Accessed on May 30, 2019, https://www.livemint.com/Opinion/DuRPMPSqaaqCDLoNMgRAbL/The-class-divide-in-Indian-education-system.html
- Crabtree, James. The Staggering Rise of India's Super Rich. The Guardian. Accessed on June 21, 2019. https://www.theguardian.com/news/2018/jul/10/the-staggering-rise-of-indias-super-rich
- Data, Prosenjit. How Atal Bihari Vajpayee's Economic Policies Paved Way for India's Growth. The Business Today India. Accessed on July 27, 2019. https://www.businesstoday.in/current/economy-politics/atal-bihari-vajpayee-economic-policies-reforms/story/281364.html
- Dubey, Muchkund, Pankaj, Ashok, and Mitra, Susmita. Still Too Many Children Out of School. The Hindustan Times. Accessed on May 30, 2019. https://www.thehindu.com/opinion/op-ed/still-too-many-children-out-of-school/article24857149.ece
- Dutta, Prabhash K. Five Decisions by Atal Bihari Vajpayee that Changed India. The India Today. Accessed on July 25, 2019.

- https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/5-decisions-by-atal-bihari-vajpayee-that-changed-india-1316783-2018-08-17
- Economy, The Global. India: Trade Openness. Accessed on May 13, 2019. https://www.theglobaleconomy.com/India/trade openness/
- Education Spend Rose to 4.6% of GDP, Target 6%: Javadekar. The Economic Times India. Accessed on June 21, 2019. https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/industry/services/education/education-spend-rose-to-4-6-of-gdp-target-6-javadekar/articleshow/68245671.cms?from=mdr
- Forum, World Economic. The Inclusive Development Index 2018. Accessed on May 21, 2019. http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_Forum_IncGrwth_2018.pdf
- Fund, International Monetary. How the IMF Promotes Global Economic Stability. Accessed on July 3, 2019. https://www.imf.org/en/About/Factsheets/Sheets/2016/07/27/15/22/How-the-IMF-Promotes-Global-Economic-Stability
- Fund, International Monetary. IMF Conditionality. Accessed on July 24, 2019, https://www.imf.org/en/About/Factsheets/Sheets/2016/08/02/21/28/IMF-Conditionality
- Fund, International Monetary. India's Strong Economy Continues to Lead Global Growth. Accessed on May 21, 2019. https://www.imf.org/en/News/Articles/2018/08/07/NA080818-India-Strong-Economy-Continues-to-Lead-Global-Growth
- Fund, International Monetary. The IMF Lending. Accessed on July 3, 2019. https://www.imf.org/en/About/Factsheets/IMF-Lending
- Furceri, Davide. Does Opening Financial Markets Lead to More Inequality?. Accessed on September 1, 2018. https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2015/11/does-opening-financial-markets-lead-to-more-inequality/
- Hunger in India. India Food Banking Network. Accessed on May 27, 2019. https://www.indiafoodbanking.org/hunger
- Income inequality gets worse: India's top 1% bag 73% of the country's wealth, says Oxfam. The Business Today India. Accessed on May 14, 2019. https://www.businesstoday.in/current/economy-politics/oxfam-india-wealth-report-income-inequality-richests-poor/story/268541.html

- Inder Kumar Gujral Dead, but His Doctrine Still Relevant. The Economic Times India. Accessed on July 25, 2019. https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/inder-kumar-gujral-dead-but-his-doctrine-still-relevant/articleshow/17433487.cms
- India and Foreign Companies, LLP. Government of India Minister of Corporate Affairs. Accessed on May 13, 2019. http://www.mca.gov.in/MinistryV2/indianandforeigncompaniesllps.html
- India: Import Tariff. International Trade Administration of US Department of Commerce. Accessed on May 13, 2019. https://www.export.gov/article?id=India-Import-Tariffs
- India's Poverty Profile. The World Bank. Accessed on May 31, 2019. http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/infographic/2016/05/27/india-s-poverty-profile
- India's 100 Richest People. Forbes. Accessed on June 23, 2019. https://www.forbes.com/india-billionaires/list/#tab:overall
- Jha, Abhishek. Rs 6,000 is 6% of a small farmer's annual income, according to NSSO data. The Hindustan Times. Accessed on June 20, 2019. https://www.hindustantimes.com/india-news/rs-6-000-is-6-of-a-small-farmer-s-annual-income-according-to-nssdata/storyrddMw0hk6cSbxjo7E1GyKK.html
- Kapoor, Amit and Yadav, Chirag. The Good, the Bad, and the Ugly of Narendra Modi's Economic Legacy. The Quartz India. Accessed on July 28, 2019. https://qz.com/india/1525196/modis-economic-report-card-before-indias-2019-elections/
- Kumar, Vikas. Reassessing Deve Gowda. The Hindu. Accessed on July 24, 2019. https://www.thehindu.com/opinion/op-ed/reassessing-devegowda/article24039844.ece
- Mondal, Puja. Twelve Important Components of Green Revolution in India. accessed on April 8, 2019. http://www.yourarticlelibrary.com/green-revolution/12-important-components-of-green-revolution-in-india-2/20951/
- Nations, The United. Sustainable Development Goal 10: Reduce Inequality Within and Among Countries. Accessed on July 4, 2019. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/sdg10
- National Congress, India. Dr. Manmohan Singh. The Office of Prime Minister of India. Accessed on April 23, 2019. https://www.pmindia.gov.in/en/former_pm/dr-manmohan-singh-2/

- National Congress, India. Socialism of Jawaharlal Nehru and Indian National Congress. Accessed on July 2, 2019. https://www.inc.in/en/congress-sandesh/politics/socialism-of-jawaharlal-nehru-and-indian-national-congress
- Organization, World Trade. Trade Percentage of GDP: India. Accessed on May 13, 2019. https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NE.TRD.GNFS.ZS?locations=IN
- Rahil. Top Achievements of Manmohan Singh as India's Prime Minister. The Wire India. Accessed on July 27, 2019. https://www.theindianwire.com/politics/achievements-manmohan-singh-asprime-minister-71408/
- Roffelsen, Cees. How Nehru Shaped India Development. The Medium. Accessed on March 25, 2019. https://medium.com/@ceesroffelsen/how-nehru-shaped-indias-development-4df38535bf98
- Roy, Abjijit. The Middle Class in India: from 1947 to the Present and Beyond. Education about Asia Journal. Vol. 23, No.1. (2018): p. 34.
- Shah, Sneha. India Pips China in FDI Inflows for the First Time in 20 Years. The Economic Times India. Accessed on May 13, 2019. https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/economy/indicators/india-pips-china-in-fdi-inflows-for-the-first-time-in-20-years/articleshow/67281263.cms
- Sharma, Megha. India's 1991 BOP Crisis- A Quick Revision to the Past. The Medium. Accessed on April 10, 2019. https://medium.com/@megha0111/indias-1991-bop-crisis-a-quick-revision-to-the-past-68df10f81a0b
- Statistics of Children in India. Child Rights and You. Accessed on May 30, 2019. https://www.cry.org/statistics-on-children
- This is How Much A Software Engineer Can Earn in India. The Economic Times India. Accessed on June 20, 2019. https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/jobs/this-is-how-much-a-software-engineer-can-earn-in-india/articleshow/66165836.cms?from=mdr
- Toppr. Indian Economy 1950- 1990, The Land Reforms. Accessed on April 4, 2019. https://www.toppr.com/guides/economics/indian-economy-1950-1990/land-reforms/
- Varma, Subodh. 8.4 cr Indian Children Don't Attend School: Census Data. The Times of India. Accessed on May 30, 2019. https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/8-4cr-Indian-children-dont-attend-school-Census-data/articleshow/54473779.cms

- Viswanathan, Balaji. What Exactly Happened to the Indian Economy in 1991 in Layman's Terms?. The Medium. Accessed on April 8, 2019. https://medium.com/@balajivis/what-exactly-happened-to-the-indian-economy-in-1991-in-laymans-terms-c61ec3565c64
- Prime Minister of India. India's Election Official Website. Accessed on July 28, 2019. http://www.elections.in/government/prime-minister.html
- Yadav, Yogendra. A Plague of Promises: What the Modi Economy Has Done to Farmers. The Caravan India. Accessed on June 11, 2019. https://caravanmagazine.in/agriculture/what-modi-economy-done-farmers