

## **BAB V**

### **KESIMPULAN**

Penelitian ini memiliki pertanyaan penelitian, yakni: “Apa pertimbangan Uni Eropa dalam merespon pergeseran posisi Turki terkait proses aksesi keanggotaan pada tahun 2017?” Penelitian ini telah mengkaji pertimbangan Uni Eropa dalam merespon pergeseran posisi Turki terkait proses aksesi keanggotaannya pada tahun 2017. Penulis menemukan terdapat dua pertimbangan Uni Eropa dalam memberikan respon berupa penundaan terhadap proses aksesi Turki pada tahun 2017, yakni dikarenakan pertimbangan terkait keadaan internal Turki dan keadaan internal Uni Eropa itu sendiri. Keadaan internal Turki dikaji menggunakan teori perluasan organisasi milik Frank Schimmelfennig. Sementara itu, keadaan internal Uni Eropa dikaji dengan cara memahami sudut pandang dibalik respon tiap lembaga Uni Eropa yang terlibat dalam proses aksesi keanggotaan Turki.

Pertimbangan pertama ialah terkait dengan keadaan internal Turki. Sesuai dengan teori perluasan organisasi milik Frank Schimmelfennig, pertimbangan Dewan Eropa, Parlemen Eropa, dan Komisi Eropa dikelompokan menjadi pertimbangan dari sudut pandang politik keamanan, ekonomi, dan norma yang berlaku. Dalam pertimbangan politik keamanan, ketiga lembaga Uni Eropa tersebut melihat bahwa Turki mampu mengatasi ancaman krisis imigran di Uni Eropa, sehingga proses aksesi keanggotaan Turki patut dipertimbangkan. Namun terkait pertimbangan ekonomi dan norma yang berlaku, ditemukan bahwa telah

terjadi regresi usaha Turki dalam memenuhi *Copenhagen Criteria*. Dalam pertimbangan ekonomi, Uni Eropa melihat bahwa perekonomian Turki belum cukup kuat untuk menghadapi tekanan persaingan pasar Uni Eropa. Sementara dalam pertimbangan normatif, tindakan pemerintah Turki dinilai belum sesuai dengan lima nilai vital Uni Eropa, yakni penghormatan terhadap hak asasi manusia, kebebasan, demokrasi, kesetaraan, dan supremasi hukum.

Pertimbangan kedua ialah terkait dengan keadaan internal Uni Eropa yang memperlihatkan bahwa tiap lembaga memiliki respon berbeda. Ketiga lembaga Uni Eropa yang berperan dalam proses aksesi keanggotaan Turki memberikan respon yang berbeda-beda. Tiga lembaga Uni Eropa tersebut yaitu Dewan Eropa, Parlemen Eropa, dan Komisi Eropa. Penulis menemukan bahwa tiap lembaga Uni Eropa memiliki sudut pandang dan preferensinya masing-masing dibalik respon yang mereka ambil dalam menanggapi pergeseran posisi Turki.

Dewan Eropa bertugas untuk mewakili kepentingan masing-masing negara anggota terkait dengan proses aksesi keanggotaan. Respon Dewan Eropa dalam menanggapi pergeseran posisi Turki ialah berjanji untuk tetap memproses aksesi keanggotaan Turki, serta berkomitmen untuk membantu negara tersebut dalam memenuhi Copenhagen Criteria. Hal tersebut dikarenakan Dewan Eropa memiliki kepentingan strategis terhadap Turki, yakni menggunakan Turki sebagai pihak yang mengatasi ancaman krisis imigran di Uni Eropa. Respon berupa janji dilanjutkannya proses aksesi keanggotaan tersebut digunakan oleh Dewan Eropa untuk menjaga komitmen Turki.

Parlemen Eropa bertugas untuk memberikan tanggapan dan rekomendasi respon lanjutan apa yang nantinya akan diambil oleh Dewan Eropa dan Komisi Eropa kepada negara calon anggota, tentunya berdasarkan pada pendapat warga negara Uni Eropa mengenai proses aksesi. Respon Parlemen Eropa dalam menanggapi pergeseran posisi Turki ialah memberi rekomendasi untuk membekukan proses aksesi keanggotaan Turki dikarenakan menurunnya usaha negara tersebut dalam memenuhi *Copenhagen Criteria*. Parlemen melihat bahwa dukungan dari warga Uni Eropa terkait usaha integrasi penuh Turki ke dalam Uni Eropa melemah. Bahkan, warga negara Uni Eropa cenderung mengutuk tindakan pemerintah Turki pasca upaya kudeta yang terjadi di negara tersebut pada tahun 2016. Hal tersebut membuat Parlemen Eropa cenderung merekomendasikan pembekuan proses aksesi keanggotaan Turki dibandingkan melanjutkannya.

Komisi Eropa bertugas untuk memastikan negara anggota mematuhi semua ketentuan Uni Eropa, serta mengkonklusikan pendapat Dewan Eropa dan rekomendasi Parlemen Eropa terkait proses aksesi keanggotaan suatu negara ke dalam suatu posisi yang bersifat mencakup kepentingan kedua lembaga tersebut. Respon berbeda antara Dewan Eropa dan Parlemen Eropa kemudian diposisikan secara hati-hati oleh Komisi Eropa, sehingga ditemukan “jalan tengah” yang dapat mencakup keinginan kedua lembaga tersebut. Oleh sebab itu, untuk mengakomodir keinginan Dewan Eropa dan Parlemen Eropa, Komisi Eropa memilih untuk menanggapi pergeseran posisi Turki dengan cara melakukan penundaan terhadap proses aksesi keanggotaan hingga batas waktu yang tidak ditentukan.

Penelitian mengenai respon Uni Eropa terhadap pergeseran posisi Turki berupa penundaan proses aksesi keanggotaan pada tahun 2017 ini menemukan bahwa terdapat dinamika yang menyebabkan terjadinya penundaan tersebut. Penundaan proses keanggotaan Turki bukan hanya berdasarkan pada isu agama ataupun islamophobia, seperti yang dahulu dicurigai oleh Presiden Erdogan.

## DAFTAR PUSTAKA

### **Buku**

- Bal, Idris. *Turkey's Relations with the West and the Turkic Republics: The Rise and Fall of the Turkish Model: The Rise and Fall of the Turkish Model*, (Abingdon: Routledge, 2017).
- Bjarnason, Magnus. *The Political Economy of Joining the European Union: Iceland's Position of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010).
- Creswell, John W. *Research Design: Pendekatan Metode Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Campuran* (Penerbit Pustaka Pelajar, 2016), terjemahan dari *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*, 4th Edition (Sage Publication, Inc., 2014).
- Davis, James W. Threats and promises: The pursuit of international influence. (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2000).
- Gulo, W. *Metodologi Penelitian*, (Jakarta: Grasindo, 2000).
- Locke, Spirduso, & Silverman. *Proposals that work: A Guide for planning dissertations and grant proposals* (2013), dalam John W. Creswell, *Research Design: Pendekatan Metode Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Campuran* (Penerbit Pustaka Pelajar, 2016), terjemahan dari *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*, 4th Edition (Sage Publication, Inc., 2014).
- Smartt, Ursula. *Media & Entertainment Law*, (London: Routledge, 2014).
- Tatham, Allan F. *Enlargement of the European Union* (Netherlands: Kluwer Law International, 2009).
- Verney, Susannah. *Turkey's Road to European Union Membership: National Identity and Political Change*, (London: Routledge, 2013).
- Zamzam, Fakhry *Aplikasi Metodologi Penelitian*, (Yogyakarta: Deepublish Publisher, 2012).

### **Dokumen Resmi**

- European Commission, “Communication from the Commission to The European Parliament and The Council: Enlargement Strategy and Main Challenges 2011-2012,” 10 Desember 2011.
- European Commission, “Commission Staff Working Document Turkey 2015 Report: Communication from The Commission to The European Parliament, The Council, The European Economic and Social Committee and The Committee of the Regions,” 10 November 2015.
- European Commission, “Commission Staff Working Document Turkey 2016 Report: Communication from The Commission to The European Parliament, The Council, The European Economic and Social Committee and The Committee of the Regions,” 9 November 2016.
- European Commission, “Key findings of the 2016 report on Turkey,” 9 November 2016.

- European Commission - Directorate-General for Communication, *Enlargement: Extending European Values and Standards to More Countries* (Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2015).
- European Union, "Ankara Association Agreement," disahkan di Ankara, Turki pada 12 September 1963.
- European Union, "European Security Strategy: A Secure Europe in a Better World," disahkan di Brussel, Belgia pada Desember 2003.
- European Union, "European Union Development Co-operation in Indonesia," Agustus 2007.
- European Union, "Presidency Conclusions of Helsinki European Council," disahkan di Helsinki, Finlandia pada 11 Desember 1999.
- European Union, "Presidency Conclusions of Luxembourg European Council," disahkan di Luxembourg pada 13 Desember 1997.
- Republic of Turkey – Ministry of Foreign Affairs – Directorate for EU Affairs, *Chronology of Turkey- European Union Relations 1959 - 2015* (Ankara: Publications Office of Republic of Turkey – Ministry of Foreign Affairs – Directorate for EU Affairs, 2015).

### **Artikel Jurnal**

- Copeland, Nic. "EU Accession Procedure," *Library Briefing of the European Parliament*, 26 Maret 2013, hlm. 1-2.
- Manners, Ian James. "The normative ethics of the European Union," International Affairs, London, 1944, hlm. 151-152.
- Marcinkowski, Christoph. "European Union with Turkey: The Possible Impact of Turkey's Membership on the European Union," *ProQuest Journal*, Vol. 1, Iss. 3, April 2010, hlm. 536.
- Neary, J. Peter. "Foreign Direct Investment and the Single Market," The Manchester School, Vol. 70 Issue. 3, hlm. 2.
- Rofii, M. Sya'roni. "Potret Diplomasi Turki Menuju Keanggotaan Tetap Uni Eropa," *Interdependence Journal Hubungan Internasional*, Vol. 5 No. 2, Mei-Agustus 2017, hlm. 89.
- Schimmelfennig, Frank. "NATO, the EU, and Eastern Europe, Theoretical Perspectives and Empirical Findings on Eastern Enlargement," Darmstadt, 1998, hlm. 4. Dipresentasikan pada *the Third Pan-European International Relations Conference and Joint Meeting with the International Studies Association* di Vienna, 16-19 September, 1998.
- Yesilada, Birol A. "Turkey's Candidacy for UE's Membership," *Middle East Journal*, Vol. 56, No. 1 (Winter, 2002), hlm. 100-101.

### **Artikel Berita**

- Anadolu Agency, "Dewan Eropa: Eropa butuh Turki, begitu juga sebaliknya," diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs <https://www.aa.com.tr/id/headline-hari/dewan-eropa-eropa-butuh-turki-begitu-juga-sebaliknya/1065720>
- BBC News, "President Erdogan tells BBC: EU wastes Turkey's time," *BBC.com*, 12 Juli 2017, diakses pada 3 September 2018, melalui situs <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-40577216>

- BBC News, "Turkey profile – Timeline," *BBCNews.com*, diakses pada 16 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-17994865>
- BBC News, "Turkey slams EU officials in row over Netherlands campaigning," 14 Maret 2017, diakses pada 10 Oktober 2018, melalui situs <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-39264536>
- BBC News, "Turkey's Erdogan calls Dutch authorities 'Nazi remnants'," *BBC.com*, 11 Maret 2017, diakses pada 10 Oktober 2018, melalui situs <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-39264536>
- DW, "Majority of European Parliament votes to freeze EU membership talks with Turkey," 24 November 2016, diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs <https://www.dw.com/en/majority-of-european-parliament-votes-to-freeze-eu-membership-talks-with-turkey/a-36503988>
- Reuters, "Defiant Erdogan attacks EU, backs restoring death penalty," *Reuters.com*, diakses pada 25 April 2019, melalui situs <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-turkey-security-anniversary-idUSKBN1A10E7>
- The Guardian, "Recep Tayyip Erdoğan: We know Dutch from Srebrenica massacre," *TheGuardian.com*, 14 Maret 2017, diakses pada 10 Oktober 2018, melalui situs <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/mar/14/turkish-sanctions-bizarre-as-netherlands-has-more-to-be-angry-about-dutch-pm>

### **Website Resmi**

- Delegation of the European Union to Turkey, "Regular Reports on Turkey," diakses pada 10 April 2019, melalui situs <https://www.avrupa.info.tr/en/regular-reports-turkey-744>
- Delegation of the European Union to Ukraine, "Parliament wants to suspend EU accession negotiations with Turkey," diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs [https://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/ukraine/59614/parliament-wants-suspend-eu-accession-negotiations-turkey\\_en](https://eeas.europa.eu/delegations/ukraine/59614/parliament-wants-suspend-eu-accession-negotiations-turkey_en)
- European Commission, "President Jean-Claude Juncker's State of the Union Address 2017," 14 September 2017, diakses pada 27 Agustus 2018, melalui situs [http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\\_SPEECH-17-3165\\_en.htm](http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_SPEECH-17-3165_en.htm)
- European Commission, "Turkey : Customs Unions and preferential arrangements," diakses pada 16 Maret 2019, melalui situs [https://ec.europa.eu/taxation\\_customs/business/calculation-customs-duties/rules-origin/customs-unions/turkey-customs-unions-preferential-arrangements\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/taxation_customs/business/calculation-customs-duties/rules-origin/customs-unions/turkey-customs-unions-preferential-arrangements_en)
- European Commission, "Single Market for Goods," diakses pada 17 Maret 2019, melalui situs [https://ec.europa.eu/growth/single-market/goods\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/growth/single-market/goods_en)
- European Council and the Council of European Union, "European Council, 17-18 March 2016 and EU-Turkey Statement, 18 March 2016," diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/meetings/european-council/2016/03/17-18/>

- European Council and the Council of European Union, “Meeting of the EU heads of state or government with Turkey, 29/11/2015,” diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/meetings/international-summit/2015/11/29/>
- European Council and the Council of European Union, “Meeting of the EU heads of state or government with Turkey, 29/11/2015,” diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/meetings/international-summit/2015/11/29/>
- European Council and the Council of European Union, “Meeting of the EU heads of state or government with Turkey, 07/03/2016,” diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/meetings/international-summit/2016/03/07/>
- European Council and the Council of European Union, “Remarks by President Donald Tusk following the EU-Turkey leaders' meeting in Varna,” diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2018/03/26/remarks-by-president-donald-tusk-after-the-eu-turkey-leaders-meeting/>
- European Council and the Council of European Union, “Remarks by President Donald Tusk on the European Council meetings and the Leaders' Agenda,” diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2017/10/20/tusk-final-remarks-european-council/>
- European Parliament, “European Parliament resolution of 13 March 2019 on the 2018 Commission Report on Turkey,” diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-8-2019-0200\\_EN.pdf?redirect](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-8-2019-0200_EN.pdf?redirect)
- European Parliament, “European Parliament resolution of 14 April 2016 on the 2015 report on Turkey,” diadopsi pada 14 April 2016, diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-8-2016-0133\\_EN.html?redirect](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-8-2016-0133_EN.html?redirect)
- European Parliament, “European Parliament resolution of 9 July 2016 on the strategic priorities for the Commission Work Programme 2017,” diadopsi pada 6 Juli 2016, diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-8-2016-0312\\_EN.html](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-8-2016-0312_EN.html)
- European Union, “European Commission,” diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs [https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/institutions-bodies/european-commission\\_en#overview](https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/institutions-bodies/european-commission_en#overview)
- European Union, “European Council,” diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs [https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/institutions-bodies/european-council\\_en](https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/institutions-bodies/european-council_en)
- European Union, “European Neighbourhood Policy and Enlargement Negotiations: From 6 to 28 Members,” diakses pada 17 September 2018, melalui situs [https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/policy/from-6-to-28-members\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/policy/from-6-to-28-members_en)

- European Union, “European Neighbourhood Policy and Enlargement Negotiations: Turkey,” diakses pada 2 September 2018, melalui situs <https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/countries/detailed-country-information/turkey>
- European Union, “European Parliament,” diakses pada 13 Juli 2019, melalui situs [https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/institutions-bodies/european-parliament\\_en](https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu/institutions-bodies/european-parliament_en)
- Global Fire Power, “Turkey Military Strength,” diakses pada 17 Juli 2018, melalui situs [https://www.globalfirepower.com/country-military-strength-detail.asp?country\\_id=turkey#overview](https://www.globalfirepower.com/country-military-strength-detail.asp?country_id=turkey#overview)
- Presidency of the Republic of Turkey, “European Union Should Question Its Manner and Integrity,” 15 Juli 2016, diakses pada 23 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/45519/european-union-should-question-its-manner-and-integrity>
- Presidency of the Republic of Turkey, “It is Political Indecency to Force Turkey to Terminate Its Negotiations for Full Membership to the EU,” Mei 2017, diakses pada 26 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/83348/it-is-political-indecency-to-force-turkey-to-terminate-its-negotiations-for-full-membership-to-the-eu>
- Presidency of the Republic of Turkey, “President Erdogan Addresses CFR,” 23 September 2014, diakses pada 17 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/3249/president-erdogan-addresses-cfr>
- Presidency of the Republic of Turkey, “The EU has been Stalling Turkey Since 1963,” 16 Maret 2017, diakses pada 26 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/73439/president-erdogan-attends-joint-broadcast-on-cnn-turk-and-kanal-d>
- Presidency of the Republic of Turkey, “Today’s Sick Man is the European Union”, 23 Maret 2017, diakses pada 26 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/74629/bugunun-hasta-adami-artik-avrupa-birligidir>
- Presidency of the Republic of Turkey, “Turkey Accession to the EU: Turkey is a Strong Country Now, It will not Come to Your Door Begging for Accesion,” 24 Januari 2015, diakses pada 17 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/3389/turkeys-accession-to-the-eu-turkey-is-a-strong-country-now-it-will-not-come-to-your-door-begging-for-accession>
- Presidency of the Republic of Turkey, “Turkey is Key not Only Political but also Economic Stability of the EU,” 31 Oktober 2014, diakses pada 23 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/32421/turkiye-abnin-sadece-siyasi-degil-ekonomik-istikrarinin-da-anahtaridir>
- Presidency of the Republic of Turkey, “Turkey is the Most Adjusted Country to the Acquis,” 23 Maret 2019, diakses pada 17 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/3300/turkey-is-the-most-adjusted-country-to-the-acquis-of-the-eu>
- Presidency of the Republic of Turkey, “Turkey will Share the Burden, not Become One,” 6 Januari 2015, diakses pada 23 Maret 2019, melalui situs <https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/32421/turkiye-abnin-sadece-siyasi-degil-ekonomik-istikrarinin-da-anahtaridir>

<https://www.tccb.gov.tr/en/news/542/35557/turkiye-avrupa-birligine-yuk-olmaya-degil-yuk-almaya-geliyor>

Republic of Turkey – Ministry of Foreign Affairs, “Why does Turkey want to become an EU Member?” diakses pada 17 Maret 2019, melalui situs <http://www.mfa.gov.tr/questions.en.mfa#>