

## Chapter VI

### Conclusions and Recommendations

#### 6.1 Conclusions

Research on the management of CRM and official complaint channels in Provincial Government of Jakarta is intended to answer the research question: *How does Jakarta Smart City manage Citizen Relation Management (CRM) in the Provincial Government of Jakarta?*

Based on the findings and results of the analysis in this research, the researcher concluded that the management of CRM has been managed well. This is in accordance with the CiRM Oriented E-Government Maturity Model which gives 4 dimensions and 13 factors which is used as a reference to analysis:

1. Organization
  - a. Citizen Oriented Culture, all reports by citizens resolved in accordance with the regulatory framework. Maximum of 7 days to responded and resolved the reports.
  - b. Top Management Support, all head of SKPD, UKPD, and BUMD promotes and monitor the use of CRM as tools of coordination and for provide certainty of time to citizens that reports.

- c. Strategy and Policy, all operational of official complaint channels and CRM also the sustainability and the long term plan have to be written on regulatory framework.

All factors will related to one and other on Organization dimensions because the services and application must be executed with regulatory frameworks that bind not only the services and application but also the civil servants and the agencies on Provincial Government of Jakarta. It can be concluded that organization wise that included the culture, top management support, and strategy and policy has been well formed.

## 2. Interaction

- a. Communication Channels, with the flexibility official complaint channels has been added into 12 channels to expand the reach of citizens reports both from Online and Offline based channels.
- b. Public Officer Compliance, with most of CRM account held by PPSU staffs that actively engage and use the application to followed up and resolved the reports the number of account is massive, while head of SKPD, UKPD, and BUMD supervise the works.
- c. Number of Complaint, with the number of reports and complaint made by citizens still quite a lot, also prove

citizens participate on reporting problems in their neighborhood with various reason and done this voluntarily.

- d. Response, with the reports that resolved by civil servants or officials, some of citizens stated that they are quite satisfied with the results of the resolved complaints or reports.

All factor supporting each other for the interaction made through the official complaint channels and CRM. However, number of citizen participate and accessed the service need to be improved and further development in some parts.

### 3. Online Services

- a. Ease of Use, with all official complaint channels both of online and offline based expected to make citizens easier on reporting problem on their neighborhood.
- b. System Features, system features that available on Qlue, tracking ticket number for citizens to track from [pengaduanwarga.jakarta.go.id](http://pengaduanwarga.jakarta.go.id), and also other features in CRM created in such systematically by the JSC to made civil servants and officials to followed up and resolved reports and complaint easier and faster.
- c. Integration, from official complaint channels and CRM integrate and mirroring on the system, where all reports

and complaints from all channels directly appeared on CRM and waiting to be followed up and resolved by civil servants or officials.

Also From all factors in Online Services dimension, Jakarta Smart City has been done quite a hard work to make everything in CRM can run smoothly and systematically works really well.

#### 4. Citizens Insight

- a. Citizen Requirement Analysis, Monitoring and Evaluation held citizen satisfaction surveys last year to gain suggestion, input, and feedbacks from citizens about official complaint channels.
- b. Knowledge Sharing, Transition carried out from CROP to CRM also can be said run smoothly although there is a drawbacks of long transition time. With familiarization of current official complaint channels and CRM socialization and technical guidance held about once a month to problem solve troubles occurred by CRM users.
- c. Performance Measurement, with evaluation from CRM happened in stages and also discussed on Town Hall meeting with the governor. With the Governor Regulation that also bind about performance measurement of reports that followed up and resolved through CRM.

From all factors in Citizen Insight dimension can be concluded that JSC still listening to all suggestion and feedbacks from both of citizen about the official complaint channels and civil servants or officials about the CRM, they JSC will consider improvement and actions will be taken.

## **6.2 Recommendations**

From the findings and results of the analysis in this research, the researcher can recommend a number of suggestions as follows:

1. Perform socialization, campaign, and promotes all of the 12 official complaint channels for citizens to complaints and reports all problem in their neighborhood. The number of citizen participation can be improved so the number of reports also can be increased.
2. Execute the plan to rebranding the official complaint channels and CRM must be carried out to inform citizens that the official complaint channels and CRM still works, better by the systems, and also guaranteed by the regulatory framework that binds the services based on interview with The Head of Communication Division JSC.
3. Perform more collaboration act with Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO), Start-ups, Forums, and Community in

Jakarta once in a while in a year to create bigger impact on reports and complaints made by citizens.

4. Continuously publishes achievements that made through followed up and resolved reports by civil servants or officials, in order to let citizens know that the official complaint channels is still works until now.

# Bibliography

## Books Reference

Adam, John; Khan, Hafiz T. A.; and Raeside, Robert. *Research Methods for Business and Social Science Student*. New Delhi: SAGE Publications India, 2014.

Anderson, Dennis; Wu, Robert, et. Al. *E-Government Strategy, ICT and Innovation for Citizen Engagement*. New York: Springer, 2015.

Buttle, Francis and Maklan, Stan. *Customer Relationship Management: Concepts and Technologies*. New York: Routledge, 2015.

Creswell, John W. *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publication, 2014.

Denhardt, Janet V. and Denhardt, Robert B. *The New Public Service: Serving, Not Steering*. New York: M.E. Sharpe, 2007.

Hughes, Owen E. *Public Management and Administration*. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003.

Hood, Christopher. *A Public Management For All Seasons?*. Royal Institute of Public Administration 1991.

Kumar, V. and Reinartz, Werner. *Customer Relationship Management: Concept Strategy, and Tools*. Berlin: Springer, 2018.

Lune, Howard and Berg, Bruce L. *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences*. Harlow: Pearson Education Limited, 2017.

Osborne, David and Gaebler, Ted. *Reinventing Government: How the Entrepreneurial Spirit Is Transforming the Public Sector*. Reading, Massachusetts: Addison-Wesley, 1992.

Perry, James L. *Democracy and The New Public Service*. Indiana, 2006.

Silalahi, Ulber. *Metode Penelitian Sosial Kuantitatif*. Bandung: Refika Aditama, 2015.

## Encyclopedia, Article, and Journals Reference

Schellong, Alexander. "Citizen Relationship Management" *Encyclopedia of Digital Government*. 2007.

Atul Parvatiyar and Jagdish N. Sheth. *Customer Relationship Management: Emerging Practice, Process, and Discipline*. Journal of Economic and Social Research 3(2) 2001, 2002 Preliminary Issue, 1-34. Pg. 5

Shan-Ling Pan, Chee-Wee Tan, and Eric T.K. Lim. *Customer relationship management (CRM) in e-government: a relational perspective*. Decision Support Systems 42 (2006) Elsevier B.V. Singapore. 2004. Pg. 238.

Yu-Tso Chen, Chuang-Chiao Huang, and Hsin-Yu Yu. *Combining the Features of ICT and Citizen Relationship Management to Enhance the Governmental Administration: An I-Kenting System as a Practice*. International Journal of Social Science and Humanity, Vol. 7, No. 8, August 2017. Pg. 559.

Carla Wheeler and Jim Baumann. *Small Town Big Dreams*. Esri.com. 2015. Pg. 49.

Anita Wulansari and Apol Pribadi Subriadi. *Developing Citizen Relationship Management (CiRM) Oriented E-Government Maturity Model*. IPTEK, Journal of Engineering, Vol. 3, No. 1,

Badan Pusat Statistik. *Berita Resmi Statistik: Perkembangan Indeks Pembangunan Teknologi Informasi dan Komunikasi (IP-TIK)*. 15 December 2017. Pg. 4.



## **Regulations Reference**

Governor Regulation No. 409 of 2016 about Performances Allowance  
Governor Regulation No. 128 of 2017 about Implementation of Handling  
Public Complaints Through the Application of Citizen Relation Management  
Governor Regulation No. 39 of 2019 about The Amendment to Governor  
Regulation No. 127 of 2017 about Implementation of Handling Public  
Complaints Through the Application of Citizen Relation Management

## **Website or Webpage Reference**

<http://wartakota.tribunnews.com/2018/12/07/tampung-aduan-warga-jakarta-smart-city-bangun-citizen-relation-management> or  
<http://bit.ly/JSCBangunCRM> , accessed on 4<sup>th</sup> February 2019, 5:01 P.M.  
<https://tirto.id/aplikasi-qlue-tak-lagi-diutamakan-oleh-anies-cED2> or  
<http://bit.ly/Quetidakdiutamakan> accessed on 5<sup>th</sup> February 2019, 3:37 P.M.  
<https://twitter.com/JSCLoung?lang=en> , infographics data from Jakarta  
Smart City, published on twitter, accessed on 5<sup>th</sup> February 2019, 3:40 P.M.  
<https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/response>, accessed on 15<sup>th</sup>  
June 2019, 5:26 P.M.  
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/response>, accessed on 15<sup>th</sup>  
June 2019, 5:30 P.M.  
<https://www.instagram.com/jsclounge/>, infographics data from Jakarta Smart  
City, published on Instagram, accessed on 1<sup>st</sup> August 2019, 2:50 A.M.  
<http://pengaduanwarga.jakarta.go.id/>, infographics data from Jakarta Smart  
City, published on the website, accessed on 1<sup>st</sup> August 2019, 2:56 A.M.  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YJsM4GeKwEw>, Town Hall Meeting  
March 27<sup>th</sup> 2019, accessed on 1<sup>st</sup> August 2019, 3.24 A.M.  
<https://jakarta.bps.go.id/statictable/2017/01/24/91/3-1-2-jumlah-penduduk-dan-rasio-jenis-kelamin-menurut-kabupaten-kota-di-provinsi-dki-jakarta-2015.html> or  
<http://bit.ly/BSPProvinsiDKIJakarta> , accessed on 1<sup>st</sup> August  
2019, 11:05 P.M.  
<https://id.techinasia.com/perkembangan-jakarta-smart-city>, accessed on 2<sup>nd</sup>  
August 2019, 00.12 A.M.  
<https://www.liputan6.com/tekn/read/2892771/pengguna-diteror-qlue-berbagi-tips-melapor-dengan->

[aman?related=dable&utm\\_expid=.9Z4i5ypGQeGiS7w9arwTvQ.1&utm\\_referrer=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.liputan6.com%2Fteknoread%2F2892771%2Fpengguna-diteror-qlue-berbagi-tips-melapor-dengan-aman](https://www.liputan6.com/teknoread/2892771/pengguna-diteror-qlue-berbagi-tips-melapor-dengan-aman?related=dable&utm_expid=.9Z4i5ypGQeGiS7w9arwTvQ.1&utm_referrer=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.liputan6.com%2Fteknoread%2F2892771%2Fpengguna-diteror-qlue-berbagi-tips-melapor-dengan-aman) or <http://bit.ly/PenggunaDiterorQlueBerbagiTips> , accessed on 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2019, 6.18 P.M.