

## **Chapter IV**

### **Conclusion**

In answering the question “How is the politics of citizenship affecting the security of stateless and refugee communities in Indonesia during the Covid-19 pandemic?”, the key finding of this research is that the politics of citizenship was proven to provide grounds for exclusion in the security protection of refugees in Indonesia during the pandemic.

Multiple accounts and official statements from government officials show that the stateless persons and refugees in Indonesia during the pandemic were proven to be treated unequally on the basis of their citizenship, or lack thereof. The protection from human security threats provided by Indonesia as a state and a security provider was still mostly aimed towards their own citizens, not accounting stateless persons and refugees in various cases.

This further proves that the current system we have regarding citizenship unintentionally undermines human rights as the politics of citizenship create a group of people who are citizens therefore with rights, and a group of people who are not citizens and therefore without rights. It was proven that their political identity still affected the rights they could claim. Their citizenship status still became a source of consideration in how much protection they could get, and it also affected their position on the government’s priority list.

Stateless communities and refugees were already in a state of insecurity to begin with, but this lack of citizenship further boosted their vulnerability to security threats. The writer argues that the lack of citizenship became the root cause of their inability to claim protection and security protection from the state they are residing in. Without the right to rights, they can only depend on humanitarian aid from non-governmental organizations and a government without any legal obligation for the fulfillment of all their needs.

Although equal treatment of persons disregarding their citizenship is ideal, it is not realistic and it may be impossible to execute as seen in this case. States have the option of not signing the international conventions and protocols which would legally bind them to treat citizens and refugees or stateless persons with full equality. Indonesia as a non-signatory state is accepting these communities but they are not bound to give more than the basic human rights they are capable of providing. Indonesia has no legal obligation to treat stateless persons and refugees as they would treat their own citizens. Throughout the pandemic the government was struggling to provide for its own citizens, and they have their own vulnerable populations to handle as well. The government had no choice but to create prioritization and to protect their own citizens first.

Instead of solely questioning why the government's prioritization and treatment was based on citizenship status, it is also important to realize that our current citizenship system is what enabled this exclusion in the first place. The case of the pandemic is only shining light on the deep systematic issue these communities face. As long as stateless persons and refugees still exist, the current system should be analyzed further

to prevent the lack of a citizenship becoming a source of threat and grounds for exclusion of the protection of this vulnerable population.

It was the lack of political membership that became a barrier to security as stateless persons and refugees as semi-citizens became unentitled to the security and service that individuals with functioning citizenships would be entitled to.

Although the Indonesian government does not have any legal obligations towards these communities, it is important for the state to ensure their security for the sake of the security of their own citizens. These communities are located in Indonesia and are interacting with their citizens. By protecting stateless persons and refugees from the pandemic, the Indonesian government will be protecting their own citizens as well.

Further research should be conducted for a variety of concerns. In Indonesia, the bureaucracy and administration limits of the handling of stateless persons and refugees should be further analyzed. The case of the pandemic has shown that inconsistencies on protocols are evident and there is a level of uncertainty on which government bodies are responsible for protecting stateless persons and refugees, and what they are legally allowed to do.

Research on the conditions of stateless persons and refugees in Indonesia could also be further developed. The writer found numerous inconsistencies between data from government bodies and non-government organizations, as well as inconsistencies between public statements made by officials compared to refugee accounts.

Current data on stateless persons are still limited, further undermining their protection. With more information on stateless persons and refugees, the system of their handling in Indonesia could be further analyzed to further understand root issues and what can be done to solve them.

## Bibliography

- “About Statelessness.” IBELONG Campaign to End Statelessness. Accessed June 1, 2023. <https://www.unhcr.org/ibelong/about-statelessness/>.
- Achiron, Marilyn, and Radha Govil. *Nationality and Statelessness: A Handbook for Parliamentarians*. Geneva: UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), 2014.
- Bahar Özvarış, Şevkat, İlker Kayı, Deniz Mardin, Sibel Sakarya, Abdulkarim Ekzayez, Kristen Meagher, and Preeti Patel. “Covid-19 Barriers and Response Strategies for Refugees and Undocumented Migrants in Turkey.” *Journal of Migration and Health* 1-2 (2020): 100012. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmh.2020.100012>.
- Bloom, Tendayi, and Lindsey Kingston. “Chapter 7: The Weaponization of Citizenship: Punishment, Erasure, and Social Control.” Essay. In *Statelessness, Governance, and the Problem of Citizenship*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2021.
- Boll, Alfred Michael. *Multiple Nationality and International Law*. Leiden: M. Nijhoff, 2007.
- Burki, Talha. “Statelessness in the COVID-19 Pandemic.” *The Lancet* 397, no. 10284 (2021): 1529–30. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0140-6736\(21\)00901-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0140-6736(21)00901-6).
- Cohen, Elizabeth F. *Semi-Citizenship in Democratic Politics*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Creswell, John W., and John W. Creswell. *Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design: Choosing among Five approaches*. SAGE Publications, 2013.

- “Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.” OHCHR. Accessed June 11, 2023. <https://www.ohchr.org/en/instruments-mechanisms/instruments/declaration-right-and-responsibility-individuals-groups-and>.
- “Ditjen Imigrasi: Hingga Agustus 2021 Terdapat 13.343 Pengungsi Dan Pencari Suaka Dari Luar Negeri Di Indonesia.” Direktorat Jenderal Imigrasi, October 28, 2021. <https://www.imigrasi.go.id/id/2021/10/28/ditjen-imigrasi-hingga-agustus-2021-terdapat-13-343-pengungsi-dan-pencari-suaka-dari-luar-negeri-di-indonesia/>.
- Duffield, Mark, and Nicholas Waddell. “Securing Humans in a Dangerous World.” *International Politics* 43, no. 1 (2006): 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.1057/palgrave.ip.8800129>.
- “Extending Social Protection to Migrant Workers, Refugees, and Their Families: Guide for Policymakers and Practitioners.” Extending Social Protection to Migrant Workers, Refugees, and their Families: Guide for Policymakers and Practitioners, November 8, 2021. [https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/labour-migration/publications/WCMS\\_826684/lang--en/index.htm](https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/labour-migration/publications/WCMS_826684/lang--en/index.htm).
- “Figures at a Glance.” UNHCR Indonesia. Accessed June 1, 2023. <https://www.unhcr.org/id/en/figures-at-a-glance>.
- Gatra, Sandro. “Cerita Anies Di Balik Vaksinasi Untuk Ratusan Pencari Suaka Di Jakarta.” Kompas.com, October 7, 2021. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2021/10/07/14430331/cerita-anies-di-balik-vaksinasi-untuk-ratusan-pencari-suaka-di-jakarta?page=all%5C>.
- Gatra, Sandro. “Pengungsi Asing Di Kalideres Sulit Terapkan Protokol Pencegahan Covid-19.” KOMPAS.com, July 24, 2020.

<https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/07/24/21133341/pengungsi-asin-g-di-kalideres-sulit-terapkan-protokol-pencegahan-covid-19>.

Heidinger, Ellen. "Overcoming Barriers to Service Access: Refugees' Professional Support Service Utilization and the Impact of Human and Social Capital." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 24, no. 1 (2022): 271–312. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-022-00939-0>.

"Human Development Reports | United Nations Development ...," n.d. Accessed April 18, 2022.

Indonesia fact Sheet - 2022 - UNHCR. Accessed July 9, 2023. <https://www.unhcr.org/id/wp-content/uploads/sites/42/2022/04/Indonesia-Fact-Sheet-February-2022-FINAL.pdf>.

Indonesia, CNN. "DKI Sudah Mulai Vaksinasi Covid-19 Pencari Suaka." nasional, September 24, 2021. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20210925044605-20-699244/dki-sudah-mulai-vaksinasi-covid-19-pencari-suaka>.

Indonesia, CNN. "Surati Menkes, Anies Usul Vaksin Covid Buat WNA Pencari Suaka." nasional, August 9, 2021. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20210809214903-20-678467/surati-menkes-anies-usul-vaksin-covid-buat-wna-pencari-suaka>.

Inglehart, Ronald F., and Pippa Norris. "The Four Horsemen of the Apocalypse: Understanding Human Security." *Scandinavian Political Studies* 35, no. 1 (2012): 71–96. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9477.2011.00281.x>.

Jones, Richard Wyn. *Security, Strategy, and Critical Theory*. Boulder, Col.: Rienner, 2009.

Kaneti, Marina. "Seeing Citizenship: Singularity, Multiplicity, Complexity in Times of Crisis." *Citizenship Studies* 26, no. 4–5 (2022): 512–24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621025.2022.2091233>.

- Kesby, Alison. "The Right to Have Rights as Citizenship." *Citizenship, Humanity, and International Law*, 2012, 67–91. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199600823.003.0004>.
- Kingston, Lindsey. *Fully Human: Personhood, Citizenship, and Rights*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2019.
- Kingston, Lindsey. "The Politics of Citizenship in Immigrant Cities." *Geopolitics*, vol. 22, no. 2, Apr. 2017, pp. 375-398, doi: 10.1080/14650045.2016.1269045.
- "Kisah Pengungsi Di Indonesia: 'Kami Ingin Bertahan Hidup, Itulah Kenapa Kami Di Indonesia.'" *BBC News Indonesia*. Accessed June 10, 2023. <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-53109217>.
- Krause, Keith, and Michael C. Williams. *Critical Security Studies: Concepts and Strategies*. London: Routledge, 2016.
- Lasswell, Harold Dwight. *Politics: Who Gets What, When, How*. Cleveland: World Publishing Company, 1970.
- Linklater, Andrew. "Critical Theory and World Politics," 2007. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203960905>.
- Maas, Willem. "Multilevel Citizenship." *The Oxford Handbook of Citizenship*, 2017, 643–68. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780198805854.013.28>.
- Massey, Hugh. *UNHCR and "De Facto" Statelessness*. Geneva: UNHCR, Division of International Protection, 2010.
- Maullana, Irfan. "Saat Para Pencari Suaka Dari Berbagai Negara Terima Suntikan Vaksin Covid-19 Di Jakarta Halaman All." *KOMPAS.com*, October 7, 2021. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2021/10/08/06572901/saat-para-pencari-suaka-dari-berbagai-negara-terima-suntikan-vaksin-covid?page=all>.



“Migrants & Refugees - Indonesia.” Migrants & Refugees Section, December 23, 2020. <https://migrants-refugees.va/country-profile/indonesia/>.

“Penerbitan Kartu Tanda Penduduk Berbasis Nomor Induk Kependudukan Nasional.” Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil. Accessed June 11, 2023. <https://kependudukancapil.jakarta.go.id/>.

“Pengungsi Asing Di Indonesia Selama Pandemi: ‘Mereka Menolak Saya Dan Mengatakan Vaksin Hanya Untuk WNI.’” BBC News Indonesia. Accessed June 10, 2023. <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-58068808>.

Peraturan Presiden Republik Indonesia Nomor 125 Tahun 2016 tentang Penanganan Pengungsi dari Luar Negeri

“Preventing Statelessness.” UNHCR Indonesia. Accessed June 11, 2023. <https://www.unhcr.org/id/en/preventing-statelessness>.

Razali, Rodziana Mohamed, and Christoph Sperfeldt. “Statelessness in ASEAN: Causes and Responses to a Protracted Problem.” *Human Rights and ASEAN*, 2021, 183–210. [https://doi.org/10.1142/9789811229503\\_0011](https://doi.org/10.1142/9789811229503_0011).

“Refugee Status Determination.” UNHCR. Accessed June 1, 2023. <https://www.unhcr.org/what-we-do/protect-human-rights/protection/refugee-status-determination>.

“Ribuan Pengungsi Di Indonesia Sulit Akses Fasilitas Umum Karena Tak Punya Bukti Vaksinasi.” VOA Indonesia, March 11, 2022. <https://www.voaindonesia.com/a/ribuan-pengungsi-di-indonesia-sulit-akses-fasilitas-umum-karena-tak-punya-bukti-vaksinasi/6480533.html>.

Safran, William. “Citizenship and Nationality in Democratic Systems: Approaches to Defining and Acquiring Membership in the Political Community.”

International Political Science Review 18, no. 3 (1997): 313–35.  
<https://doi.org/10.1177/019251297018003006>.

Siegelberg, Mira L. *Statelessness: A Modern History*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2020.

Sperfeldt, Cristoph. “Legal Identity and Statelessness in Southeast Asia.” *Asia Pacific Issues: East-West Center*, no. 147 (2021).

Stack, Trevor, and Rose Luminiello. “Chapter 1: Citizenship and Political Community in Four Questions.” Essay. In *Engaging Authority: Citizenship and Political Community*. Rowman & Littlefield, 2021.

“Statelessness around the World.” *IBELONG Campaign to End Statelessness*. Accessed June 11, 2023.  
<https://www.unhcr.org/ibelong/statelessness-around-the-world/>.

The Jakarta Post. “Silent Struggle of Refugees in Indonesia.” *The Jakarta Post*. Accessed July 9, 2023.  
<https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2019/10/31/the-silent-struggle-of-refugees-in-indonesia.html>.

The Refugee Convention, 1951 - UNHCR - The UN Refugee Agency. Accessed June 10, 2023.  
<https://www.unhcr.org/sites/default/files/legacy-pdf/4ca34be29.pdf>.

Thunder, David. “Correction to: The Ethics of Citizenship in the 21st Century.” *The Ethics of Citizenship in the 21st Century*, 2021.  
[https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-50415-5\\_10](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-50415-5_10).

“Trafficking in Persons in Conflict Situations: The World Must Strengthen Prevention and Accountability.” *OHCHR*, July 29, 2022.  
<https://www.ohchr.org/en/statements/2022/07/trafficking-persons-conflict-situations-world-must-strengthen-prevention-and>.

Under the radar and under protected - UN human rights office. Accessed June 11, 2023.

[https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/Documents/Issues/Children/BirthRegistration/PlanInternational1\\_birthRegistration.pdf](https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/Documents/Issues/Children/BirthRegistration/PlanInternational1_birthRegistration.pdf).

UNHCR - Monthly Statistical Report (March 2021). Accessed May 31, 2023.

<https://www.unhcr.org/id/wp-content/uploads/sites/42/2021/04/Monthly-Statistical-Report-March-2021.pdf>.

“UNHCR in Indonesia.” UNHCR Indonesia. Accessed June 1, 2023.

<https://www.unhcr.org/id/en/unhcr-in-indonesia>.

“UNHCR Indonesia - Pengungsi Di Indonesia.” UNHCR Indonesia. Accessed June 1,

2023. <https://www.unhcr.org/id/>.

United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. “What Is a Refugee?” UNHCR, n.d. Accessed April 18, 2022.

United Nations Statelessness Conventions: An introduction. Accessed June 11, 2023.

[https://law.unimelb.edu.au/\\_\\_data/assets/pdf\\_file/0009/3800754/UNConventions\\_factsheet\\_Sept\\_2020.pdf](https://law.unimelb.edu.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0009/3800754/UNConventions_factsheet_Sept_2020.pdf).

“Universal Declaration of Human Rights.” United Nations. United Nations. Accessed

March 5, 2022.

<https://www.un.org/en/about-us/universal-declaration-of-human-rights>.

Van Hout, Marie Claire, Charlotte Bigland, and Nina Murray. “Scoping the Impact of

Covid-19 on the Nexus of Statelessness and Health in Council of Europe Member States.” *Journal of Migration and Health* 4 (2021): 100053.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmh.2021.100053>.

Van Waas, Laura, and Ottoline Spearman. "The Life-or-Death Cost of Being Stateless in a Global Pandemic." *International Journal of Refugee Law* 32, no. 3 (2020): 498–501. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ijrl/eeaa029>.

Waisová, Šárka. "Human Security — the Contemporary Paradigm?" *Perspectives*, no. 20 (2003): 58–72. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23615865>.

Wardah, Fathiyah. "Cegah Perebakan Covid-19, Indonesia Vaksinasi Pengungsi Asing Di Beberapa Daerah." VOA Indonesia, October 12, 2021. <https://www.voaindonesia.com/a/cegah-perebakan-covid-19-indonesia-vaksinasi-pengungsi-asing-di-beberapa-daerah/6267738.html>.