

Chapter V

Conclusion

In this chapter the author will conclude and answer the research. The author will have 2 conclusions. The first is how NATO's intervention created polarization or fragmentation in Libya. The second is how NATO's intervention increased the number of violence in Libya.

The first conclusion is, NATO's intervention created polarization or fragmentation in Libya. The polarization happened when NATO's intervention opened new opportunities for rebels. This polarization happened in 3 cases the first is the fragmentation between the interim government and militias, the second is between groups as how there were more groups form after Libya liberated, and lastly there were even internal fragmentation inside the militias and other groups. NATO's intervention empowered the rebels as how NATO gathered rebels to fulfill their interest. This mindset stayed within the mind of rebels until Libya was liberated. When NTC was still weak it was easier for the rebels to rise to fulfill their interests as their justification. NATO's intervention altered the incentives and opportunities of political actors in Libya. Rebels in Libya did not want to be disarmed due to their own insecurity and they did not trust NTC when they were not powerful. NATO's opportunistic intervention which had a goal to bring a new regime, forced NTC who were not ready to become the sole power in Libya. This impacted on how when NTC



was not ready there were more protest coming to NTC and GNC. There were more groups form when Libya was liberated. These groups built their own authorities to pursue their goals and to guard their territory, particularly when they were still insecure with the legacy of Gaddafi in Libya. There were also groups who were fragmented internally since they believed they had other groups who could fulfill their interests, rather than staying in their own group.

The second conclusion is NATO's involvement has a negative impact in increasing the number of violence in Libya. NATO's supports for rebels empowered the rebels capability in the arm supplies and also NATO in the past supported their interests. The major obstacle in Libya when Gaddafi died was disarming the militias in Libya. The militias had power to attack other groups when they did not meet their interests. Due to the lack legitimacy of NTC it was easier for rebels also to do attacks and to do violence. The number of violence in Libya happened as how there were more conflicts among groups, militias and also Islamist groups. There were more incidents happened such as Benghazi attacks, and the existence of Operation Libya Dawn and Dignity. In the time of revolution the rebels might have the similar goal which was to bring Gaddafi down. However these aims did not last long, rebels and militias started to pursue new goals when NTC was weak to stop these militias. When their goals were not met they did violence to groups who did not meet their interests.



Bibliography

Books

- Bartos, Otomar J., and Paul Wehr. *Using Conflict Theory*. Cambridge: Camridge University Press, 2002.
- Bassiouni, M. Cherif. Libya: From Repression to Revolution. Boston: Martinus Nijshoff Publishers, 2013
- Brown, Michael E. *The International Dimensions of Internal Conflict*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1996.
- Campbell, Horace. *Global NATO and the Catastrophic Failure in Libya*. New York: Monthly Review Press, 2013.
- Campbell, Horace. NATO's Failure in Libya: Lessons for Africa. Africa Institute of South Africa, 2012.
- Cole, Peter, and Brian McQuinn. *The Libyan Revolution and Its Aftermath*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2015.
- Creswell, John. W. A Framework Design in Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Approaches. Second. London: Sage Publication, 2003.
- Freedman, Amy L. The Internationalization of Internal Conflicts: Threatening the State. Oxon: Routledge, 2014.
- Engelbrekt, Kjell, Marcus Mohlin, and Charlotte Wagnsson. *The NATO Intervention in Libya: Lessons Learned from the Campaign*. New York: Routledge, 2014.
- Galtung, Johan. Peace by Peaceful Means. Oslo: International Peace Research Institution, 1996.
- Galtung, Johan. Theories of Conflict: Definitions, Dimensions, Negations, Formations. New York: Dept of Sociology, Columbia University, 1958.
- Garland, Landend. 2011 Libyan Civil War. Delhi: White Word Publication, 2012.
- Gebrewold, Belachew. Anatomy of Violence, Understanding the Systems of Conflict and Violence in Africa. Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2009.
- Heitmeyer, Wilhelm, and John Hagan. *International Handbook of Violence*. Vol. 1. Dordecht: Kluwer Academic Publisher, 2003.
- Lobell, Steven E., and Philip Mauceri. *Ethnic Conflict and International Politics*. New York: PALGRAVE MACMILLAN, n.d.
- Merkel, Woflgang, and Sonja Grimm. War and Democratization: Legality, Legitimacy and Effectiveness. New York: Routledge, 2009.
- Mueller, Karl P. Precision and Purpose: Air Power in Libyan Civil War, 2015.
- Nye, Joseph S. Understanding International Conflicts; An Introduction to Theory and History. Longman, 2003.
- Pack, Jason. The 2011 Libyan Uprisings and the Struggle for the Post-Qadhafi Future. New York: Palgrave Macmillan US, 2013.

- Ramsbotham, Oliver, Tom Woodhouse, and Hugh Miall. Contemporary Conflict Resolutions. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2005.
- Simons, Geoff. Libya: The Struggle for Survival. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 1996.

Journals, Documents

- "ACLED All Africa." Armed Conflict Location and Event Data Project. Accessed November 15, 2016. http://www.acleddata.com/data/version-6-data-1997-2015/.
- "Armed Groups in Libya: Typology and Roles." *Small Arms Survey*, 2012. http://www.smallarmssurvey.org/fileadmin/docs/H-Research_Notes/SAS-Research-Note-18.pdf.
- Blanchard, Christopher M. "Libya: Unrest and US Policy." Congressional Research Service, March 2011.
- Blanchard, Christopher M., and Jim Zanotti. "Libya: Background and U.S. Relations." *Congressional Research Service*, February 2011. http://fpc.state.gov/documents/organization/158525.pdf.
- Chivvis, Christopher S., Keith Crane, Peter Mandaville, and Jeffrey Martini. "Libya's Post-Qaddafi Transition: The Nation-Building Challenge." *RAND Publication*, October 22, 2012. https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/research_reports/RR100/RR129/RAND RR129.pdf.
- Chivvis, Christopher S., and Jeffrey Martini. "Libya After Qaddafi: Lessons and Implications for the Future." *RAND Publication*, 2014. http://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/research_reports/RR500/RR577/RAND RR577.pdf.
- Cole, Peter, and Wolfram Lacher. "Politics by Other Means." Small Arms Survey, October 2014. http://www.smallarmssurvey.org/fileadmin/docs/F-Working-papers/SAS-SANA-WP20-Libya-Security-Sector.pdf.
- Boghard, Erica D., and Constantino Psichedda. "Allies and Airpower in Libya," 2012.
- Daadler, Ivo H., and James G. Stavidris. "NATO'S Victory in Libya: The Right Way to Run an Intervention." *Journal of Foreign Affairs* 91 (2012).
- Darwisheh, Housam. "Trajectories and Outcomes of the 'Arab Spring': Comparing Tunisia, Egypt, Libya, and Syria." *Institute of Developing Economies*, March 2014. http://www.ide.go.jp/English/Publish/Download/Dp/pdf/456.pdf.
- Finnuci, Francesco. "Libya: Military Actors and Militias." Global Security. Accessed October 16, 2016. http://www.globalsecurity.org/military/library/report/2013/libyan-militias finucci.pdf.
- Fitzgerald, Mary. "Mapping Libya's Factions." Middle East and North Africa Programme at the European Council on Foreign Relations. Accessed November 15, 2016. http://www.ecfr.eu/page/-/Libya maps combined.pdf.

- Gartenstein-Ross, Daveed, and Nathaniel Barr. "Dignity and Dawn: Libya's Escalating Civil War." *ICCT Research Paper*, February 2015. https://www.icct.nl/download/file/ICCT-Gartenstein-Ross-Barr-Dignity-and-Dawn-Libyas-Escalating-Civil-War-February2015.pdf.
- Gretler, Jeremiah. "Operation Odyssey Dawn (Libya): Background and Issues for Congress." *Congressional Research Service*, March 30, 2011. https://www.fas.org/sgp/crs/natsec/R41725.pdf.
- Hasler, Stefan. "Explaining Humanitarian Intervention in Libya and Non-Intervention in Syria," 2012.
- "Libya: Militias, Tribes and Islamists." LAND Info, December 19, 2014. http://www.landinfo.no/asset/3025/1/3025_1.pdf.
- North Atlantic Treaty Organization. "Operation Unified Protector Final Mission Stats," November 2, 2011. http://www.nato.int/nato_static_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf_2011_11/20111108_11 1107-factsheet up factsfigures en.pdf.
- -----. "Operation Unified Protector NATO-Led Arms Embargo against Libya,"
 October 2011.
 http://www.nato.int/nato_static_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf_2011_10/20111005_11
 1005-factsheet arms embargo.pdf.
- -----. "Operation Unified Protector Protection of Civilians and Civilian Populated Areas & Enforcement of the No Fly Zone," October 2011. http://www.nato.int/nato_static/assets/pdf/pdf_2011_07/20110708_110708-map OUP Libya.pdf.
- "Operation Unified Protector: Command and Control." North Atlantic Treaty Organization. Accessed September 22, 2016. http://www.nato.int/nato_static/assets/pdf/pdf_2011_03/unified-protector-arms-embargo-factsheet.pdf.
- "Operation UNIFIED PROTECTOR NATO Arms Embargo Against Libya." North Atlantic Treaty Organization. Accessed September 22, 2016. http://www.nato.int/nato_static/assets/pdf/pdf_2011_03/unified-protector-arms-embargo-factsheet.pdf.
- "Operations in Libya: Ninth Report of Session 2010-12." House of Commons Defence Committee London, 2012.
- "Report of the Secretary-General on the United Nations Support Mission in Libya." United Nations Security Council, November 22, 2011. http://www.securitycouncilreport.org/atf/cf/%7B65BFCF9B-6D27-4E9C-8CD3-CF6E4FF96FF9%7D/Libya%20S%202011%20727.pdf.
- Siebens, James, and Benjamin Case. "The Libyan Civil War: Context and Consequences." *THINK International and Human Security*, 2012. http://www.thinkihs.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/10/Siebens-Case-LibyaSReport-2012.pdf.
- "The Battle For Libya: Killings, Disappearances, and Tortures." Amnesty International, 2011.

- "The Benghazi Attack of September 11, 2012." Judicial Watch, January 22, 2013. https://www.judicialwatch.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/08/121624110-JW-Benghazi-Report-1.pdf.
- "United Nations Resolution 1973." United Nations Security Council, 2011. http://www.nato.int/nato_static/assets/pdf/pdf_2011_03/20110927_110311-UNSCR-1973.pdf.
- "United Nations Resolutions 1970." United Nations Security Council, 2011. https://www.icc-cpi.int/NR/rdonlyres/081A9013-B03D-4859-9D61-5D0B0F2F5EFA/0/1970Eng.pdf.
- Vira, Varun, Anthony H. Cordesman, and Arleigh A. Burke. "The Libyan Uprising: An Uncertain Trajectory." *CSIS*, n.d.
- Wehrey, Frederic. "Ending Libya's Civil War: Reconciling Politics, Rebuilding Security." *Carneige Endowment for International Peace*, September 2014. http://carnegieendowment.org/files/ending libya civ war.pdf.
- Witter, David. "Libyan Islamic Fighting Group (LIFG)." Institute for the Study War.

 Accessed October 17, 2016.

 http://www.understandingwar.org/sites/default/files/FactSheet LIFG.pdf.

Websites

- Asser, Martin. "The Muammar Gaddafi Story." *BBC News*. Accessed June 14, 2016. http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-12688033.
- Council, Security. "Security Council Approves 'No-Fly Zone' over Libya, Authorizing 'All Necessary Measures' to Protect Civilians, by Vote of 10 in Favour with 5 Abstentions." *United Nations*, March 17, 2011. http://www.un.org/press/en/2011/sc10200.doc.htm.
- "Deputy Head of Libya's NTC Quits after Protests." *Reuters*, January 22, 2012. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-libya-benghazi-protests-idUSTRE80L0CX20120122.
- "Evolution of the Frontlines in Libya." North Atlantic Treaty Organization, 2011. http://www.nato.int/nato_static_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf_2011_09/20110922_11 0922-libya-frontlines.pdf.
- "Gaddafi's Forces Battle for Brega." *Aljazeera News*. Accessed September 19, 2016. http://www.aljazeera.com/news/africa/2011/03/2011331142051984358.html.
- Gritten, David. "Key Figures in Libya's Rebels." *BBC News*, August 25, 2011. http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-12698562.
- "Guide to Key Libyan Militias." *BBC News*, January 11, 2016. http://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-19744533.
- Kafala, Tarik. "Gaddafi's Quixotic and Brutal Rule." *BBC News*, n.d. http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-12532929.
- Labott, Elise. "As Libyan Plans Unfold, NTC Chairman Offers Thanks." *CNN.com*, September 2, 2011. http://edition.cnn.com/2011/WORLD/africa/09/01/libya.paris.meeting/.

- "Libya Crisis: Profile of NTC CHair Mustafa Abdul Jalil." *BBC News*, August 22, 2011. http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-14613679.
- "Libya: How Opposing Sides Are Armed." *BBC News*, August 23, 2011. http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-12692068#.
- McMillan, Steven. "NATO's Intervention in Libya a Premeditated Geostrategic Operation." *Global Research*. Accessed August 20, 2016. http://www.globalresearch.ca/natos-humanitarian-intervention-in-libya-a-premeditated-geostrategic-operation/5482662.
- Mokhefi, Mansouria. "Gaddafi's Regime in Relation to the Libyan Tribes." *Aljazeera News*, March 2011.
- "National Transitional Council Libya." NTC. Accessed October 20, 2016. http://ntclibya.org/.
- "NATO and Libya (Archived)." NATO, 2015. http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/topics 71652.htm.
- "NATO Ends Military Operations in Libya." *The Guardian*, October 31, 2011. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/oct/31/nato-ends-libya-rasmussen.
- "NATO Libya Attacks." Accessed September 12, 2016. https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/17o1NI6zYSPb_B-cN5NnWWMjVG1k3GFLKNPB-4qDEoW8/edit?hl=en_US&authkev=CPeKiPMB#gid=8.
- "No-Fly Zones Explained." *North Atlantic Treaty Organization*, April 1, 2011. http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natolive/news 71959.htm.
- "NTC Declares 'Liberation of Libya." *Aljazeera News*, October 24, 2011. http://www.aljazeera.com/news/africa/2011/10/201110235316778897.html.
- "Statement by the NATO Secretary General on the Liberation of Libya." *North Atlantic Treaty Organization*, October 23, 2011. http://www.nato.int/cps/en/SID-724B5525-F968EF0E/natolive/news 79828.htm.
- "Statement on Libya." North Atlantic Treaty Organization, June 8, 2011. http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news_75177.htm.
- "Unemployment, Youth Total (% of Total Labor Force Ages 15-24) (Modeled ILO Estimate)." Worldbank. Accessed March 20, 2016. http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.UEM.1524.ZS.
- United Nations General Assembly. "United Nations General Assembly, Implemeting the Responsibility to Protect," n.d. http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/63/677.
- United Nations Security Council. "United Nations Security Council Resolution 1973," n.d.