

BAB V

KESIMPULAN

Berkaca pada pertanyaan penelitian “**Bagaimana proses demokratisasi AS kepada Afghanistan mempengaruhi eskalasi kekuasaan domestik Taliban (2014 - 2020)**” penelitian ini menggambarkan bagaimana aplikasi demokratisasi di negara dengan sentimen etno-nasionalis, kondisi politik yang lemah serta kultur yang bertolak-belakang seperti Afghanistan dapat menjadi sebuah fenomena yang konfliktual. Dari pembahasan pada bagian sebelumnya yang mengacu pada kerangka analisis demokratisasi oleh Jack Snyder dan *process dynamics* dari Edward Azar, dapat disimpulkan bahwa eskalasi kekuasaan domestik Taliban pada tahun 2014-2020 diakibatkan oleh kelompok Taliban yang dapat “*ride the wave of US democratization*”; yang prosesnya menghasilkan pelemahan institusi pemerintahan, tidak adaptif dan inklusif terhadap kultur masyarakat Afghanistan serta *ideals* dari demokratisasi yang meradangkan aksi kekerasan di wilayah Afghanistan sehingga membuka celah untuk masuknya pengaruh aktor non-demokratis. Argumen tersebut menyediakan jawaban untuk melihat faktor apa saja dalam demokratisasi yang dapat menjadi konfliktual namun juga bagaimana Taliban dapat menggunakannya untuk eskalasi kekuasaannya. Demokratisasi AS membuka ruang untuk terjadinya “*basis for belligerent nationalist coalition*” dengan membentuk kondisi pemerintahan yang nyatanya terus melemah dengan sistem negara yang korup, tersentralisasi dan bergantung pada dukungan internasional sehingga meningkatkan ketidakpuasan terhadap pemerintah dan tumbuhnya sentimen nasionalis secara domestik. Dalam sisi lain,

sistem demokratisasi yang tidak memahami konteks kultural Afghanistan melimitasi efektifitas dari upaya-upaya demokrasi yang tidak beresonansi dengan keinginan dan praktik sosial, hukum dan ekonomi masyarakatnya. Lantas kondisi tersebut membangun kesadaran nasional yang minim dalam masyarakat Afghanistan dan mencetuskan ruang untuk aktor-aktor non-demokratis untuk mendominasi serta minimnya rasa cinta untuk negara sendiri. Ditambah, *ideal* di balik demokratisasi yang tidak konsisten serta condong mengutamakan upaya *counter-terrorism* melimitasi kapabilitas Afghanistan untuk menjadi *mature democracy* sehingga meradangkan aksi kekerasan Taliban yang menjustifikasi peran mereka dalam negara.

Penelitian ini menekankan bahwa demokratisasi AS dilakukan dalam konteks etno-nasionalis dan erat dengan sentimen agama di Afghanistan merupakan hal yang konfliktual dimana demokratisasi membangun kondisi dimana Taliban dapat menegaskan kredensial nasionalis mereka sebagai sarana untuk menyatukan kepentingan yang terfragmentasi yang muncul ke permukaan dalam lingkungan politik yang tidak stabil. Demokratisasi yang memunculkan konflik politik identitas ini, memicu *political attachment* terhadap perbedaan kultural, linguistik, agama dan etnisitas antara kelompok-kelompok dalam Afghanistan yang membangun sentimen buruk terhadap pemerintahan yang hadir. Sehingga, demokratisasi yang AS lakukan membangun kondisi kuat untuk Kelompok Taliban menggunakan ketidakstabilan politik yang terjadi dalam transisi – sebelum demokrasi institusi dan demokrasi penuh telah dibentuk – untuk agenda mereka sendiri. Diiringi dengan konsep *process dynamics*, kondisi

konflikktual tersebut dapat digunakan oleh aktor-aktor non-demokratis dalam membentuk persepsi buruk terhadap pemerintah, membentuk sentimen keji terhadap aktor internasional serta meningkatkan urgensi peran Taliban.

Pada akhirnya, dinamika di balik kondisi tersebut menjadi resep untuk terbangunnya eskalasi kekuasaan di Taliban yang sukses menggunakan pre-kondisi demokratisasi untuk mengajukan agenda, kapabilitas dan ketergantungan terhadap kelompok non-demokratis. Penelitian ini melihat pola yang tak berhenti atau sesuai teori Edward Azar menggambarkan kondisi yang sporadis dan akan terus berlarut dimana upaya demokratisasi menghasilkan kondisi yang konflikktual, kondisi konflikktual tersebut memberi pijakan bagi Taliban dan sebagai cara untuk menangani kekuasaan Taliban upaya demokratisasi diterapkan lagi dan lagi. Kondisi tersebut membentuk pola yang mengundang kesempatan terus-menerus dan menjadi *feeding-ground* bagi kelompok Taliban gunakan dalam mencapai objektif dan diseminasi ide-ide kelompoknya. Sehingga, kondisi konflikktual dari demokratisasi menjadi sorotan yang penelitian ini temukan menarik dimana upaya yang berambisi dan bertujuan konstruktif seperti demokrasi dapat menjadi senjata bagi kelompok ekstrimis seperti Taliban.

DAFTAR PUSTAKA

- Abdullah Fayez Bataineh, *Delivery Of USAID Aid To Afghanistan, 2001-2017*, (Wayne State University, 2017), pp. 8-10, https://digitalcommons.wayne.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2915&context=oa_dissertations
- A. Farid Tookhy, “Legislature and Legislative Elections in Afghanistan: An Analysis”, (United States Institute of Peace, 2020), pp. 3-4, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep25402>
- Afghanistan Study Group, “A Pathway for Peace in Afghanistan”, United States Institute for Peace, February 2021, p. 32, https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/2021-02/afghanistan_study_group_final_report_a_pathway_for_peace_in_afghanistan.pdf
- Ahmad Murid Partaw, “Democratization in Afghanistan: Challenges and Opportunities”, (University of South Florida, 2017), pp. 2-5, <https://www.longdom.org/open-access/democratization-in-afghanistan-challenges-and-opportunities-36290.html>
- Akbari, Ahmad Faisal, “The Relationship Between Democracy and War in Afghanistan”, (SSRN, January 15, 2022), <https://ssrn.com/abstract=4013811>
- Akmal Dawi, “Taliban Seeking 110,000-Strong Army After 6 Months in Power“, (Voa News, 2022), diakses pada 16 Desember 2022, <https://www.voanews.com/a/taliban-seeking-110-000-strong-army-after-6-months-in-power-/6442084.html>
- Alan Bryman, “Social Research Methods:”, 4th ed. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 380.
- Alex Thier & Scott Worden, “Political Stability in Afghanistan: A 2020 Vision and Roadmap”, (United States Institute of Peace, 2017), pp. 4-6, <https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/2017-07/sr408-political-stability-in-afghanistan-a-2020-vision-and-roadmap.pdf>
- Alex Ward, “Trump is sending more than 3,000 troops to Afghanistan“, (Vox, 2017), diakses pada 9 Desember 2022, <https://www.vox.com/world/2017/9/19/16227730/trump-afghanistan-3000-troops-mattis>
- Ali Jalali, “Forging Afghanistan’s National Unity Government”, (United Institute of Peace, 2015), pp. 3, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep20198>
- Anchita Borthakur & Angana Kotokey, “Ethnicity or Religion? The Genesis of the Taliban Movement in Afghanistan”, (Asian Affairs, 2020), pp. 824, <https://doi.org/10.1080/03068374.2020.1832772>

- Anna Larson, “Deconstructing Democracy in Afghanistan”, (Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit, 2011), pp. 8-13, <https://www.refworld.org/pdfid/4dbfc8c72.pdf>
- Anna Larson, “Democracy in Afghanistan: Amid and Beyond Conflict”, (United States Institute of Peace, 2021), pp. 2, <https://www.usip.org/publications/2021/07/democracy-afghanistan-amid-and-beyond-conflict>
- Anna Larson, “Perspective on Democracy and Democratization in Afghanistan”, (Middle East Institute, 2012), Diakses pada 27 November 2022, <https://www.mei.edu/publications/perspectives-democracy-and-democratization-afghanistan>
- Anthony H. Cordesman, “Afghanistan at Transition: Lessons of the Longest War”, (CSIS Report, March 2015), pp. 159, https://csis-website-prod.s3.amazonaws.com/s3fs-public/legacy_files/files/publication/150319_Afghan_Transition.pdf
- Anthony H. Cordesman, “Reshaping U.S. Aid to Afghanistan: The Challenge of Lasting Progress”, (Center for Strategic & International Studies, 2022), <https://www.csis.org/analysis/reshaping-us-aid-afghanistan-challenge-lasting-progress>
- Arie Perliger, “Why the United States Failed in Afghanistan Despite Being a Military Superpower”, (Scroll, January 27 2021), Diakses pada 29 November 2022, <https://scroll.in/article/1003231/why-the-united-states-failed-in-afghanistan-despite-being-a-military-superpower>
- Ashley Jackson, “Life under the Taliban Shadow Government”, (Overseas Development Institute, 2018), pp. 20, <https://cdn.odi.org/media/documents/12269.pdf>
- Ashley Jackson, “The Taliban’s Fight for Hearts and Minds”, (Foreign Policy, 2018), diakses pada 16 Desember 2022, <https://foreignpolicy.com/2018/09/12/the-talibans-fight-for-hearts-and-minds-afghanistan/>
- Ashley Jackson and Rahmatullah Amiri, “Insurgent Bureaucracy: How the Taliban Makes Policy”, (United States Institute for Peace, 2019), pp. 12-14, https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/2021-08/pw_153-insurgent_bureaucracy_how_the_taliban_makes_policy.pdf
- Ashok Behuria, Yaqoob Ul Hasan & Sanya Saroha, “US-Taliban Talks for Afghan Peace: Complexities Galore”, (2019), pp. 126-137, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09700161.2019.1595483>
- A Shurke, “Democratization of a Dependent State: The Case of Afghanistan”, (Michelsen Institute, 2007), pp. 13-16, <https://gsdrc.org/document-library/democratization-of-a-dependent-state-the-case-of-afghanistan/>

- Bertelsmann Stiftung, “Bertelsmann Stiftung Transformation Index 2020 Country Report”, (2020), https://bti-project.org/fileadmin/api/content/en/downloads/reports/country_repor_2020_AFG.pdf
- Benjamin Jensen, “How the Taliban did it: Inside the ‘operational art’ of its military victory”, (Atlantic Council, 2021), diakses pada 17 November 2022, <https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/blogs/new-atlanticist/how-the-taliban-did-it-insi-De-the-operational-art-of-its-military-victory/>
- Bilqese Daud, “Project Taliban: Anti-Pashtun Initiative?”, (The Diplomat, 2021), diakses pada 30 November 2022, <https://thediplomat.com/2021/07/project-taliban-an-anti-pashtun-initiative/>
- British Broadcasting Channel, “Who are the Taliban?”, (August 2021), <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-south-asia-11451718>
- British Broadcasting Channel, “Afghanistan: What has the conflict cost the US and its allies?”, (BBC, 2021), diakses 15 Juni 2022, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-47391821>
- British Broadcasting Channel, “Afghanistan: Who’s who in the Taliban Leadership”, (BBC, 2021), diakses pada 17 November 2022, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-58235639>
- Carlos Gervasoni, “Hybrid Regimes within Democracies: Fiscal Federalism and Subnational Rentier States”, (Cambridge University Press, 2018), pp. 35-38, <https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/abs/hybrid-regimes-within-democracies/subnational-democracy-index/D7D6D0EDB948DB2A92F62895EB9EB204>
- Catherine Lutz & Sujaya Desai, “US Reconstruction Aid for Afghanistan: The Dollars and Sense”, (Watson Institute for International Studies, 2017), <https://watson.brown.edu/costsofwar/files/cow/imce/papers/2015/US%20Reconstruction%20Aid%20for%20Afghanistan.pdf>
- Chiara Torell, “21 killed and 33 injured in suicide bombing at Kabul mosque, 17 Aug”, (Relief Web, 2022), diakses pada 8 Desember 2022, <https://reliefweb.int/report/afghanistan/21-killed-and-33-injured-suicide-bombing-kabul-mosque-17-aug>
- Claudio Franco and Antonio Giustozzi, “Revolution in the Counter-Revolution: Efforts to Centralize the Taliban’s Military Leadership”, (Central Asian Affairs 3, 2016), pp. 249-286.
- Cora Sol Goldstein, *The Afghanistan Experience: Democratization by Force*, (Parameters 42, no. 3, 2012), doi:10.55540/0031-1723.3054.
- Council on Foreign Relations, “1991-2021: The U.S. War in Afghanistan”, (2022), diakses pada 3 November 2022, <https://www.cfr.org/timeline/us-war-afghanistan>

- Crisis Group Asia Report, “Afghanistan: The Future of the National Unity Government”, (International Crisis Group, April 2017), pp. 2-5, <https://www.crisisgroup.org/asia/south-asia/afghanistan/285-afghanistan-future-national-unity-government>
- Daniel Egel & Peter Glick, “Assessing the Stabilizing Effects of Development Programming: A Review of USAID’s Evolution Efforts in Afghanistan”, (RAND National Security Research Division, 2016), pp. 23-26, https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/working_papers/WR1100/WR1106/RAND_WR1106.pdf
- David Kinsella & David L. Rousseau, “Democracy and Conflict Resolution”, (The Sage Handbook of Conflict Resolution), pp. 481, <https://web.pdx.edu/~kinsella/offprints/shcr09.proof.pdf>
- David Zucchini, “Collapse and Conquest: The Taliban Strategy That Seized Afghanistan”, (New York Times, 2021), diakses pada 26 November 2022, <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/08/18/world/asia/taliban-victory-strategy-afghanistan.html>
- Deve Afet, “Afghanistan: Challenges and Perspectives until 2020”, (European Parliament Policy Department, 2017), pp. 19-23, [https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2017/578033/EXPO_STU\(2017\)578033_EN.pdf](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2017/578033/EXPO_STU(2017)578033_EN.pdf)
- Dieter Fuchs & Edeltraud Roller, “Conceptualizing and Measuring the Quality of Democracy: The Citizens Perspective”, (Cogitatio, 2018), pp. 22-32, <https://www.cogitatiopress.com/politicsandgovernance/article/view/1188/1188>
- Dr. Antonio Giustozzi, “Afghanistan: Taliban’s organization and structure”, (LandInfo, 2017), pp. 12, https://landinfo.no/asset/3589/1/3589_1.pdf
- Dr. Antonio Giustozzi, “Afghanistan: Taliban’s Intelligence and the intimidation campaign”, (LandInfo, 2017), pp. 5-9, https://landinfo.no/asset/3590/1/3590_1.pdf
- Edward D. Mansfield & Jack Snyder, “Democratic Transitions, Institutional Strength, and War”, (International Organization at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 2002), pp. 299-300, <https://library.fes.de/libalt/journals/swetsfulltext/13833235.pdf>
- Edward D. Mansfield & Jack Snyder, “Electing to Fight: Why Emerging Democracies go to War”, (MIT Press, 2005), pp. 8-9, <http://www.columbia.edu/itc/journalism/stille/Politics%20Fall%202007/readings%20weeks%206-7/Jack%20Snyder%20--%20Why%20Democracies%20Fight.pdf>
- Edward E. Azar, “The Management of Protracted Social Conflict: Theory and Cases”, (Darmoth, 1990), pp. 15.

- Edward E. Azar & Nadia Farah, "The structure of inequalities and protracted social conflict: A theoretical framework, *International Interactions*", 7:4, pp. 317-335, DOI: 10.1080/03050628108434558
- Edward E. Azar, Paul Jureidini, Ronald McLaurin, "Protracted Social Conflict; Theory and Practice in the Middle East", *Journal of Palestine Studies* (1978) 8 (1): pp. 41–60, <https://doi.org/10.2307/253610>
- Erik Paaneen, "Stalling Democracy in the Middle East: Failures of US Foreign Policy or the Absence of Democratic Culture?", (Linne University Kalmar Vajox Sweden, 2022), <https://www.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A1628477&dsid=7387>
- Evagoras C. Leventis, "Protracted Social Conflict Analysis and Cyprus: An Assessment", *The Cyprus Review* Vol. 19 Fall 2007, pp. 42.
- "Fact Sheet: Announcing the Presidential Initiative for Democracy Renewal", The White House, December 2021, Accessed on 1 March 2022, <https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/statements-releases/2021/12/09/fact-sheet-announcing-the-presidential-initiative-for-democratic-renewal/>
- Florian Weigand, "Why Did the Taliban Win (Again) in Afghanistan?", (*London School of Economics Public Policy Review*, 2022, pp. 5, <http://doi.org/10.31389/lseppr.54>
- Frances Z Brown, "Aiding Afghan Local Governance: What Went Wrong?", (Carnegie Endowment, 2021), diakses pada 16 Desember 2022 <https://carnegieendowment.org/2021/11/08/aiding-afghan-local-governance-what-went-wrong-pub-85719>
- "Freedom in the World: Afghanistan", (Freedom House, 2020), diakses pada 16 November 2022, <https://freedomhouse.org/country/afghanistan/freedom-world/2020>
- Geoffrey Swenson, "Why U.S. Efforts to Promote the Rule of Law in Afghanistan Failed", (*International Security*, 2017), pp. 114–132, https://doi.org/10.1162/ISEC_a_00285.
- George W. Bush, *Decision Points*, (New York: Crown Publishing Group, 2010), pp. 205.
- Gilles Dorronsoro, "The Taliban's Winning Strategy in Afghanistan", (Carnegie Endowment, 2009), pp. 5-7, https://carnegieendowment.org/files/taliban_winning_strategy.pdf
- Gilles Dorronsoro, "Who Are the Taliban?", (Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 2009), <https://carnegieendowment.org/2009/10/22/who-are-taliban-pub-24029>
- Hanif Sufizada, "Minerals, drugs and China: How the Taliban might finance their new Afghan government", (*The Conversation*, 2021), diakses pada 6 Desember 2022,

<https://theconversation.com/minerals-drugs-and-china-how-the-taliban-might-finance-their-new-afghan-government-167169>

- Jack Snyder, “From Voting to Violence: Democratization and Nationalist Conflict”, pp. 1-486, https://adambrown.info/p/notes/snyder_from_voting_to_violence
- Jacqueline L. Hazelton, “The U.S. Couldn’t Build Afghanistan a Democracy. That Rarely Works”, (The Washington Post, 2021), diakses pada 16 November 2022, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/2021/08/31/us-couldnt-build-afghanista-n-democracy-that-rarely-works/>
- James Dobbins, Jason Campbell, “DDR in Afghanistan: Disarming, Demobilizing, and Reintegrating Afghan Combatants in Accordance with a Peace Agreement”, (RAND Corporation, 2020), pp. 4, https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE300/PE343/RAND_PE343.pdf
- Jennifer Brick Murtazashvili, “The Collapse of Afghanistan”, (Journal of Democracy John Hopkins University Press, Volume 33 January 2022), pp. 40-54, <https://www.journalofdemocracy.org/articles/the-collapse-of-afghanistan/>
- Jessica Donati, “Taliban-led Attacks in Afghanistan Hit 10 Year High”, (The Wall Street Journal, 2020), diakses pada 2 November 2022, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/taliban-led-attacks-in-afghanistan-hit-10-year-high-11580446861>
- Jessica Donati & Habib Khan Totakhil, “Taliban Broaden Their Reach in Villages Across Afghanistan”, (The Wall Street Journal, 2017), diakses pada 27 November 2022, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/taliban-broaden-their-reach-in-villages-across-afghanistan-1494235804>
- JF Sopko, “Private Sector Development and Economic Growth: Lessons from the U.S. Experience in Afghanistan”, Special Inspector General for Afghanistan Reconstruction, 2018, pp. 71-73, <https://www.sigar.mil/pdf/lessons-learned/SIGAR-21-46-LL.pdf>
- JF Sopko, “What We Need to Learn: Lessons from Twenty Years of Afghanistan Reconstruction”, (Special Inspector General for Afghanistan Reconstruction, 2021), p. 16, <https://www.sigar.mil/pdf/lessons-learned/SIGAR-21-46-LL.pdf>
- John Creswell, “Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches”, 2nd edition, (2002), pp. 208.
- Jon Gambrell, “Mapping the Afghan War, While Murky, Points to Taliban”, (AP News, April 2021), diakses 1 Maret 2022, <https://apnews.com/article/taliban-middle-east-3ef479b1de676f00dd16dc8dcf6fd0e>
- Kelly Magmem, “Securing a Democratic World: The Case Study for Democratic Values-Based U.S. Foreign Policy”, (Center for American Progress (CAS), 2018), <https://www.americanprogress.org/article/securing-democratic-world/>

- Kelsey O'Brien, "Cooperative Agreements and Foreign Aid: Examining USAID's Involvement in the Afghanistan Reconstruction Effort", (*Public Contract Law Journal*, Vol. 46, 2017), pp. 623-642, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26419544>.
- Kevin Russel & Nicholas Sambanis, "Stopping the Violence but Blocking the Peace: Dilemmas of Foreign-Imposed Nation Building After Ethnic War", (Cambridge University Press, 2021), pp. 127, <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0020818321000266>
- Leoni Connah, "US intervention in Afghanistan: Justifying the Unjustifiable?", (*South Asia Research* Volume: 41 issue: 1), pp. 73-79, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0262728020964609>.
- Lise Waldek, "Endemic violence in Afghanistan: a Socio-cultural Perspective", (*Journal of Policing, Intelligence and Counter Terrorism*, 2018), pp. 19, <https://doi.org/10.1080/18335330.2018.1473630>
- Maria Gloria Polimeno, "The peacebuilding puzzle: political order in post conflict states", (Cambridge University Press, 2017), pp.265, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13510347.2017.1386178>
- Marian L. Lawson, Susan B. Epstein, "Democracy Promotion: An Objective of U.S. Foreign Assistance", (Congressional Research Service Report, January 2019), pp.4-6. <https://sgp.fas.org/crs/row/R44858.pdf>
- Markus Holdo, "Post-Islamism and fields of contention after the Arab Spring: feminism, Salafism and the revolutionary youth", (*Third World Quarterly*, 2017), pp. 1800-1815, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2016.1233492>
- Matthew Alan Hill, "Democracy Promotion and Conflict-Based Reconstruction: The United States & Democratic Consolidation in Bosnia, Afghanistan & Iraq", (Routledge, 2013), pp. 37-40, <https://www.routledge.com/Democracy-Promotion-and-Conflict-Based-Reconstruction-The-United-States/Hill/p/book/9780415749565>
- Matthew Alan Hill, "Exploring US Democracy Promotion in Bosnia and Afghanistan: A 'Cookie-Cutter' Approach", (Routledge, 2018), pp. 98-124.
- Md Nazrul Islam & Md Saidun Islam, "Islam and Democracy: Conflicts and Congruence", (Multidisciplinary Digital Publishing Institute, 2017), pp. 1- 19, <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel8060104>
- Mehdi J. Hakimi, "Democracy and the Rule of Law in Afghanistan: A Cautionary Tale", (*The Fletcher Forum of World Affairs*, February 2022), <https://ssrn.com/abstract=4040389>
- Mohammad Younus & Aisha Shahzad, "Democracy in Afghanistan and External Actors", (*Journal of Arts and Social Sciences*, 2020), pp. 58, <https://jass.pk/10.46662/jass-vol7-iss1-2020/6.pdf>

- Muhammad Tariqa & Nabeela Khalid, "The Resurgence of Taliban in Afghanistan: Future Prospects of Peace and Stability", (International Journal of Innovation, 2020), pp. 804, https://www.ijicc.net/images/Vol_14/Iss_8/151012_Tariq_2021_E1_R.pdf
- Mujib Mashal, Fahim Abed and Fatima Faizi, "Afghanistan Votes for Parliament Under Shadow of Taliban Violence", (New York Times, October 2018), diakses pada 1 Maret 2022, <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/10/20/world/asia/afghanistan-election-vote.html>
- Niels Terpstra, "Rebel governance, rebel legitimacy, and external intervention: assessing three phases of Taliban rule in Afghanistan", (Taylor & Francis, 2020), pp. 1155, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09592318.2020.1757916>
- Oliver Ramsbotham, "The Analysis of Protracted Social Conflict: A Tribute to Edward Azar," (Review of International Studies 31, No. 1, 2005), pp. 1-126, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40072074>
- Olle Tornquist, "Power, Conflict and Democracy: An Analytical Framework", PCJ Journal Vol. 1, pp. 19-23, <https://media.neliti.com/media/publications/362-EN-power-conflict-and-democracy-the-analytical-framework.pdf>
- Osman Mohammed Afzal, "Sub-Nationalism and Nationalism: The Dilemma of Power and Ethnicity in Afghanistan", (Budapest National University of Public Service, 2022), DOI: 10.4236/blr.2022.132026.
- Paul D. Miller, "Non-"Western" Liberalism and the Resilience of the Liberal International Order", (The Washington Quarterly, 2018), pp. 137-153, <https://doi.org/10.1080/0163660X.2018.1485354>
- Paul D. Senese, "Democracy and Maturity: Deciphering Conditional Effects on Levels of Dispute Intensity", (International Studies Quarterly, 1999), pp. 483-502, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2600939>
- Peter Bergen with Katherine Tiedemann, "Talibanistan: Negotiating the Borders Between Terror, Politics, and Religion", (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 39-40.
- Peter Harris & Ben Reilly, "Democracy and Deep Rooted Conflict: Options for Negotiators", (International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance, 1998), pp. 19-21.
- Richard Ghiasy, Jiayi Zhou & Henrik Hallgren, "Afghan's Private Sector: Status and Ways Forward", (Stockholm International Peace and Research Institute, 2015), pp. 7-8, https://www.sipri.org/sites/default/files/2016-04/SIPRI_Afghanistans-Private-Sector_Report-2015.pdf

- Ruchi Kumar, "From Road Tax to Courts: The Taliban's Attempt to State Building", (Aljazeera, 2018), diakses pada 23 November 2022, <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/8/26/from-road-tax-to-courts-the-talibans-attempts-at-state-building>
- Sajid Iqbal, "International Intervention and State-building in Afghanistan", (Journal of Security and Strategic Analyses, 2019), pp.95, <https://doi.org/10.57169/jssa.v5i1.102>
- Sean Carberry, "Afghans Confront Sensitive Issue of Ethnicity", National Public Radio, (NPR, 2013), <https://www.npr.org/2013/05/08/179079930/afghans-confront-senstive-issue-of-ethnicity>
- Sean Kane, "Talking with the Taliban: Should the Afghan Constitution be a Point of Negotiation?", (United States Institute of Peace, 2015), diakses pada 16 November 2022, <https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/SR356-Talking-with-the-Taliban-Should-The-Afghan-Constitution-Be-a-Point-of-Negotiation.pdf>
- Sean M. Lynn-Jones, "Why the United States Should Spread Democracy", Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs, Harvard Kennedy School, March 1998, Diakses pada 16 Februari 2022, <https://www.belfercenter.org/publication/why-united-states-should-spread-democracy>
- Seth G. Jones, "Afghanistan's Future Emirate? The Taliban and the Struggle for Afghanistan", (Combating Terrorism Center, 2020), pp. 5-7, <https://ctc.westpoint.edu/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/CTC-SENTINEL-112020.pdf>
- Sharifullah Dorani, "America In Afghanistan Foreign Policy And Decision Making From Bush To Obama To Trump", (2019), pp. 306-318.
- Shoaib Sharifi and Louise Adamou, "Taliban threaten 70% of Afghanistan, BBC finds", (British Broadcasting Channel, 2018), <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-42863116>
- Special Instructor for Afghanistan Reconstruction (SIGAR), "Afghan Reconstruction Quarterly Report", (SIGAR, 2014), pp. 58-62, <https://www.sigar.mil/pdf/quarterlyreports/2014-10-30qr.pdf>
- Special Instructor for Afghanistan Reconstruction (SIGAR), "Afghan Reconstruction Quarterly Report", (SIGAR, 2016), pp. 22-28, <https://www.sigar.mil/pdf/quarterlyreports/2016-10-30qr.pdf>
- Special Instructor for Afghanistan Reconstruction (SIGAR), "Afghan Reconstruction Quarterly Report", (SIGAR, 2017), pp. 48-50, <https://www.sigar.mil/pdf/quarterlyreports/2017-10-30qr.pdf>

- Special Instructor for Afghanistan Reconstruction (SIGAR), “Afghan Reconstruction Quarterly Report”, (SIGAR, 2018), pp. 43-44, <https://www.sigar.mil/pdf/quarterlyreports/2018-10-30qr.pdf>
- Special Instructor for Afghanistan Reconstruction (SIGAR), “Afghan Reconstruction Quarterly Report”, (SIGAR, 2019), pp. 33, <https://www.sigar.mil/pdf/quarterlyreports/2019-10-30qr.pdf>
- Special Instructor for Afghanistan Reconstruction (SIGAR), “Afghan Reconstruction Quarterly Report”, (SIGAR, 2020), pp. 9-12, <https://www.sigar.mil/pdf/quarterlyreports/2020-10-30qr.pdf>
- Special Instructor for Afghanistan Reconstruction (SIGAR), “What We Need to Learn: Lessons from Twenty Years of Afghanistan Reconstruction”, (SIGAR Quarterly Report, 2021), pp. 1-2, <https://www.sigar.mil/pdf/lessonslearned/SIGAR-21-46-LL.pdf>
- Subrat Kumar Ratha, “Withdrawal of U.S. Military Engagement and The Erosion of Liberal Democratization: An Afghan Perspective”, (Journal of Government and Political Issues Volume 2, Issue 1, March 2021), pp. 24-25, <https://journal.mengeja.id/index.php/JGPI/article/view/31/31>
- Syed Muzamil, “Ethnic Conflict In Afghanistan Adds Fuel To The Fire In The Region”, (The Friday Times, 2022), diakses pada 27 November 2022, thefridaytimes.com/2022/03/21/ethnic-conflict-in-afghanistan-adds-fuel-to-the-fire-in-the-region/
- “Taliban Militant Kill Dozens at Afghanistan Intelligence Base”, (BBC, 2019), diakses pada 1 Maret 2022, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-46957955>
- Tanya Mehra & Matthew Wentworth, “The Rise of the Taliban in Afghanistan: Regional Responses and Security Threats”, (Den Haag, 2021), <https://icct.nl/publication/the-rise-of-the-taliban-in-afghanistan-regional-responses-and-security-threats/>
- The Economist Intelligence Unit, “Democracy Index 2020 A Year of Democratic Setbacks and Popular Protest”, (The Economist, 2020), diakses pada 1 Maret 2022, <https://www.in.gr/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/Democracy-Index-2020.pdf>
- Theo Farrell, “Unbeatable: Social Resources, Military Adaptation, and the Afghan Taliban”, (Texas National Security Review, 2018), pp. 58-75, <https://doi.org/10.15781/T22B8VW1N>
- Theo Farrell and Michael Semple, “Ready for Peace? The Afghan Taliban after a Decade of War”, (The Royal United Services Institute, 2017), pp. 2-4, https://static.rusi.org/201701_bp_ready_for_peace.pdf
- Thomas Barfield, “Afghanistan's Ethnic Puzzle: Decentralizing Power Before the U.S. Withdrawal”, (Council on Foreign Relations, 2011), pp. 54-58, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23041776>

- Thomas Barfield, “Afghans Political History: Prospects for Peaceful Opposition”, (Conciliation Resources, 2018), https://rc-services-assets.s3.eu-west-1.amazonaws.com/s3fs-public/5_Barfield_Incremental-Peace-in-Afghanistan-16-20.pdf.
- Thomas Crothers, “U.S. Democracy Promotion During and After Bush:”, (Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 2017), pp. 3-12, https://carnegieendowment.org/files/democracy_promotion_after_bush_final.pdf
- Thomas H. Johnson, “Afghanistan’s 2018 Wolesi Jirga Elections: Chaos, Confusion and Fraud”, (Journal of Asian Security and International Affairs, 2020), pp. 61-63, <https://doi.org/10.1177/2347797020906635>
- Tom Gerald Daly, “The Alchemist: Questioning our Faith in Court as Democracy-Builders”, Cambridge University Press, 2017, <https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/abs/alchemists/core-concept-democratisation/EFAEBA554EF7AA994F09E18506CA5413>
- Thomas H. Johnson, Matthew Dupree & Wali Shaaker, “Taliban narratives: The use and power of stories in the Afghanistan conflict”, (Oxford University Press, 2017), pp. 16-18.
- Vakkas Dogantekin, “US doesn’t seek to impose democracy in Afghanistan”, Anadolu Agency, September 2020, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/politics/us-doesn-t-look-to-impose-democracy-on-afghanistan/1971454>
- Vinay Kaura, “Understanding the Complexities of the Afghan Peace Process, (Observer Research Foundation”, 2018), pp. 7-9, https://orfonline.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/ORF_Occasional_Paper_151_Afghanistan.pdf
- Vision of Humanity, “Global Peace Index”, Diakses pada 1 October 2022, <https://www.visionofhumanity.org/maps/#/>
- Waseem Khokar, Tahir Jamil & Qamar Abid Hussain, “Post 9/11 Trends: Bush to Obama to Trump (Multilateralism and Peace Initiatives in Afghanistan)”, (Global Political Review, 2021), pp. 29, [https://doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2021\(VI-I\).04](https://doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2021(VI-I).04).
- Whit Mason, “The Rule of Law in Afghanistan: Missing in Action”, (Cambridge University Press, 2011), pp. 147-148, <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511760082>
- W. Lawrence Neuman, “Basics of Social Research: Qualitative & Quantitative Approaches, 3rd ed.”, (Essex: Pearson Education Limited, 2014), pp. 133-139.
- World Bank, “Poverty Reduction in Afghanistan: Despite Economic Growth, Widening Inequality”, (World Bank, 2020), diakses pada 4 Desember 2022,

<https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/poverty/publication/poverty-reduction-in-afghanistan-despite-economic-growth-widening-inequality>

Y Ibrahimi, "Afghanistan's Political Development Dilemma: The Centralist State Versus a Centrifugal Society. *Journal of South Asian Development*", (2019), pp. 40-61.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0973174119839843>