

Universitas Katolik Parahyangan

Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik

Program Studi Hubungan Internasional Program Sarjana

Terakreditasi Unggul SK BAN-PT No. 2579/SK/BAN-PT/AK-ISK/S/IV/2022[1]

The Case Study of Contradiction between Australia's Domestic Pressure and Commitment towards Indonesia in the Context of Veronica Koman's Activism of Human Rights Violations in West Papua

Skripsi

Oleh
Hanna Fernandus
6091901006

Bandung

2023



Universitas Katolik Parahyangan Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik Program Studi Hubungan Internasional Program Sarjana

Terakreditasi Unggul SK BAN-PT No. 2579/SK/BAN-PT/AK-ISK/S/IV/2022[1]

The Case Study of Contradiction between Australia's Domestic Pressure and Commitment towards Indonesia in the Context of Veronica Koman's Activism of Human Rights Violations in West Papua

Skripsi

Oleh

Hanna Fernandus 6091901006

Pembimbing

Dr. I Nyoman Sudira, Drs., M.Si.

Bandung

2023

Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik Jurusan Hubungan Internasional

Program Studi Hubungan Internasional Program Sarjana



Tanda Pengesahan Skripsi

Nama : Hanna Fernandus Nomor Pokok : 6091901006

Judul : The Case Study of Contradiction between Australia's

Domestic Pressure and Commitment towards Indonesia in the Context of Veronica Koman's Activism of Human Rights

Violations in West Papua

Telah diuji dalam Ujian Sidang jenjang Sarjana Pada Senin, 16 Januari 2023 masukkan tanggal

Dan dinyatakan LULUS

Tim Penguji

Ketua sidang merangkap anggota

Vrameswari Omega W., .SIP., M.Si.(Han)

Sekretaris

Dr. I Nyoman Sudira

Anggota

Adrianus Harsawaskita, S.IP., MA

Mengesahkan,

Dekan Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik

Dr. Pius Sugeng Prasetyo, M.Si

Pernyataan

Saya yang bertandatangan di bawah ini:

Nama : Hanna Fernandus

NPM : 6091901006

Jurusan/Program Studi : Hubungan Internasional

Judul : Case Study Of Veronica Koman's Activism of Human Rights

Violations in West Papua: A Showcase Of Indonesia-Australia's

Unstable Relations

Dengan ini menyatakan bahwa skripsi ini merupakan hasil karya tulis ilmiah sendiri dan bukanlah merupakan karya yang pernah diajukan untuk memperoleh gelar akademik oleh pihak lain. Adapun karya atau pendapat pihak lain yang dikutip, ditulis sesuai dengan kaidah penulisan ilmiah yang berlaku.

Pernyataan ini saya buat dengan penuh tanggung jawab dan bersedia menerima konsekuensi apapun sesuai aturan yang berlaku apabila dikemudian hari diketahui bahwa pernyataan ini tidak benar.

Bandung,

Harma Fernandus

ABSTRAK

Nama : Hanna Fernandus

NPM : 6091901006

Judul : Studi Kasus Kontradiksi Tekanan Domestik dan Komitmen

Australia terhadap Indonesia dalam Konteks Aktivisme

Pelanggaran HAM di Papua Barat oleh Veronica Koman

Tahun 2019 ditandai dengan peningkatan konflik dan demonstrasi yang dipicu oleh insiden rasisme di depan Asrama Mahasiswa Papua, Surabaya. Di tengah ketengangan, aktivisme yang dilakukan Veronica Koman dengan mengekspos pelanggaran Hak Asasi Manusia selama konflik dan demonstrasi berlangsung menarik perhatian Indonesia maupun Australia. Publikasi yang dilakukan Koman akan membuat dia ditetapkan sebagai tersangka provokator dan penyebar hoaks oleh otoritas Indonesia. Meskipun pemerintah Australia menunjukan kepatuhan kepatuhan terhadap permintaan Indonesia untuk menyerahkan Veroncia Komand dalam rangka penanganan kasusnya, politik internal Australia bersikeras sebaliknya dan menuntut Australia untuk tidak hanya melindungi aktivis HAM tersebut tetapi juga mengambil peranan yang lebih aktif dalam konflik Papua Barat. Studi kasus ini ditujukan untuk memahami kontradiksi antara komitmen Australa terhadap Indonesia dan tekanan dari sisi domestik yang menuntut lebih banyak keterlibatan Australia melalui aktivisme Veronica Koman terkair pelanggaran HAM di Papua Barat.

Kata Kunci: *Relative Deprivation*, Veronica Koman, Papua Barat, Australia, Kebijakan Luar Negeri

ABSTRACT

Name : Hanna Fernandus

NPM : 6091901006

Title : The Case Study of Contradiction between Australia's Domestic

Pressure and Commitment towards Indonesia in the Context of Veronica Koman's Activism of Human Rights Violations in West

Papua

Year 2019 marked the uprising conflicts and riots from West Papuans triggered by the racism incident in front of a Papuan Students' Dormitory, Surabaya. Amidst the tension, Veronica Koman's activism on the exposure of human rights violations during the conflicts and riots received a significant traction from Indonesia and Australia. Koman's publication would later make her declared a suspect of provocation and hoax producer by the Indonesian authority. While the Australian government showed conditional compliance to Indonesia's request to handing over Veronica Koman to process her case, the domestic politics of Australia pressured otherwise and demanded Australia not only to protect the human rights activist but also to be more involved in the West Papua conflict. This case study aimed to explain the contradiction of Australia's commitment to Indonesia and the domestic pressure demanding more Australia involvement in the West Papua conflicts through Veronica Koman's activism of human rights violations in West Papua

Keywords: Relative Deprivation, Veronica Koman, West Papua, Australia, Foreign Policy

PREFACE

Praise be to God Almighty because of His guidance and blessings the

researcher can finish the undergraduate thesis titled "The Contradiction between

Australia's Domestic Pressure and Commitment towards Indonesia in the Context

of Veronica Koman's Activism of Human Rights Violations in West Papua." The

history, grievances, and aspirations of West Papuans in hoping for a better welfare

have been enduring the protracted conflict shall not be forgotten and reflected in

the learning of human rights and peace.

The researcher hopes this undergraduate thesis provide to be useful for

fellow researcher or readers who are currently researching or showing interest in

further learning of the topic researcher. This undergraduate thesis still consists of

imperfections and flaws, therefore critiques and constructive inputs towards the

writing of this thesis are very welcome.

Bandung, January 4th, 2023

Hanna Fernandus

iii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my parents, who have helped me to come this far with my education and became my motivation to keep moving on

To my thesis supervisor, Drs. I Nyoman Sudira, Drs., M.Si, who has contributed to my curiosity towards the conflict and human rights violations in West Papua

To two very dear friends of mine, who have accompanied me throughout the journey of writing this thesis and are willing to hear my ideas and struggles patiently

And to the West Papuans striving for the betterment of their welfare, and to the human rights activists, defenders, and groups who continue to sacrifice for the greater cause

LIST OF CONTENTS

ABSTRAK	i				
ABSTRACTii					
PREFACEiii					
ACKNOWLEDGMENTSiv					
LIST OF CONTENTSv					
GLOSSARY	viii				
1. CHAPTE	CR I: INTRODUCTION1				
1.1.	Background1				
1.2.	Problem Identification6				
1.3.	Research Limitations7				
1.4.	Research Question7				
1.5.	Research Objectives7				
1.6.	Research Benefits7				
1.7.	Research Methods8				
1.8.	Literature Review10				
1.8.1.	Social Activism and Democracy in the Discourse of National				
	Interest10				
1.8.2.	Human Rights and West Papua11				
1.8.3.	Indonesia-Australia Cooperation13				
1.9.	Theoretical Framework14				
1.10.	Structure of Analysis				

2.	CHAPTE	CR II: VERONICA KOMAN'S ACTIVISM OF THE WEST			
	PAPUA	HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS AND AUSTRALIA'S			
	RESPONSE TO HER CASE19				
	2.1.	Introduction to the West Papua Conflict19			
	2.1.1.	Territorial Dispute and Changes Since Dutch Colonialism19			
	2.1.2.	Core and Complexity of Conflict in West Papua22			
	2.1.3.	Internationalisation of West Papua Conflict31			
	2.2.	Veronica Koman's Activism in West Papua Conflict34			
	2.2.1.	Advocacy and Campaigns in West Papua Conflict34			
	2.2.2.	The 2019 Incident in Papuan Students Dormitory, Surabaya			
		35			
	2.3.	Australia and the West Papua Conflict44			
	2.3.1.	West Papua Conflict in the Domestic Politics of Australia44			
	2.3.2.	Australia's Commitment to Indonesia Regarding West Papua			
		Conflict			
	2.3.3.	Australia's Response to Veronica Koman's Activism51			
3.	СНАРТЕ	CR III: VERONICA KOMAN'S ACTIVISM AS			
	REPRESENTATION OF CONTRADICTING DOMESTIC PRESSURE				
	AND ALIG	STRALIA'S COMMITMENT TO INDONESIA 54			

	3.1. Aspirational Deprivation of West Papua54		
		3.1.1.	Value Expectations54
		3.1.2.	Value Capabilities55
		3.1.3.	Value Opportunities56
		3.1.4.	Intensity of Relative Deprivation59
		3.1.5.	Veronica Koman's Activism as a Response to the
			Aspirational Deprivation in West Papua60
	3.2.	Externa	al Factor of Australia's Commitment to Indonesia62
		3.2.1.	Australia's Compliance to Indonesia's Rulings over
			Veronica Koman's Case63
		3.2.2.	Factor of Political Stability65
		3.2.3.	Factor of Substantial Legitimacy67
	3.3.	Interna	l Factor from Domestic Interest Groups Opposing
Australia's Commitment to Indonesia69			
		3.3.1.	Differentiating Interest Groups of Australia in West Papua
			Conflict
		3.3.2.	Political Contributions of the Pro-Free West Papua
			Movement Interest Groups in Australia71
		3.3.3.	Veronica Koman's Continued Activism with Free West
			Papua Movement in Australia72
4.	CHA	APTER IV	V: CONCLUSION
	4.1.	Veron	ica Koman's Activism in the West Papua Conflict74

4.2.	Australia's Contradictory Foreign Policy and Domestic Demand		
	in West Papua Conflict	74	
BIBILO	GRAPHY	76	

GLOSSARY

ACFID Australian Council For International Development

AFP Australian Federal Police

AMP Asrama Mahasiswa Papua

ASPI Australian Strategic Policy Institute

BPS Badan Pusat Statistik

C-24 United Nations Special Committee on Decolonization

FWPM Free West Papua Movement (this term specifically applies

to pro-independence/separatist movement of West Papua

HDI Human Development Index

ICP International Coalition for Papua

LPDP Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan

MRP Majelis Rakyat Papua

MRPB Majelis Rakyat Papua Barat

NGOs Non-Governmental Organisations

OAP Orang Asli Papua

OHCHR Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for

Human Rights

OPM Organisasi Papua Merdeka

PNG Papua New Guinea

TPNPB/TPN Tentara Pembebasan Nasional Papua Barat

ULMWP United Liberation Movement for West Papua

UNHCR United Nations Human Rights Council

UNHRC United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNTEA United Nations Temporary Executive Authority

UN United Nations

UNPO Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Chapter I provides a brief introduction to the case of Veronica Koman's human rights activism and Australia's response towards the case. The response from Australia contradicts the domestic politics of Australia pressuring otherwise. From the issue explained, a qualitative theoretical framework of the impact or role of Koman's case towards Australia is formulated. The framework created is intended to answer how Koman's case highlighted the contradiction between Australia's foreign policy commitment towards Indonesia and the domestic politics demanding polar-opposite actions.

1.1. Background

The issue of West Papua's independence is one of the humanitarian issues in Indonesia that has not yet reached a resolution. The problem in West Papua concerns the recognition of the territory's independence as an independent state, similar to the East Timor issue. Various phenomena can be found in the midst of the conflict between Indonesia and the West Papua region in the process of resolving issues, ranging from dialogue between figures, development and economic approaches, armed conflict, to violence by law enforcement officers. At the domestic level, support and criticism of the West Papua issue emerged from elements of civil society such as Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs),

¹Richard Chauvel, "Australia's Strategic Environment: The Problem of Papua." Agenda: A Journal of Policy Analysis and Reform 11, no. 1 (2004): 39–52. http://www.jstor.org/stable/43199264.

academics, movement groups, and others. At the international level, West Papua has long attracted the attention of international organisations such as the UN, Human Rights Watch, and Amnesty International. One of the countries that also pays attention to the issue of West Papua is Australia, a neighbour country of Indonesia.

Australia is one of the countries that has been engaged in long-term cooperation with Indonesia. Due to its close proximity with each other, the countries have been engaged in economic diplomacy, being one of the earliest official economic trading partners after Indonesia's independence and providing support to the newly independent country.² Both countries are also engaged in cultural cooperation, holding various cultural exchange programs such as Australia-Indonesia Muslim Exchange Program, Australia-Indonesia Youth Exchange Program, and more exchange programs. often correlated with education.³ Another form of cooperation between the two countries is the Australia-Indonesia Centre, established in 2014. AIC was composed of universities from Australia and Indonesia and aimed to promote research for various purposes. In the security sector, there have been two major agreements signed by the two countries: first was the Australia-Indonesia Security Agreement signed on December 18th, 1995, while the second was the Lombok Treaty signed in 2006, followed by the signing of Joint Understanding in 2014.

-

²Tim Harcourt, "Years of Living Prosperously – Economic Diplomacy between Indonesia and Australia," Australian Embassy Indonesia (Australian Embassy in Indonesia), accessed September 29, 2022, https://indonesia.embassy.gov.au/jakt/AR15_006.html.

³Australian Embassy in Indonesia, "Exchanges," indonesia.embassy.gov.au, accessed September 29, 2022, https://indonesia.embassy.gov.au/jakt/exchanges.html.

Although Indonesia and Australia have engaged in multiple cooperation, conflict still arose between the countries. Preceding the Lombok Treaty, conflict particularly took root in political and security matters such as the abrogation of 1995 Security Agreement post-Timor Leste independence. The abrogation was initiated by Feisal Tandjung, Indonesia's Coordinating Minister for Political and Security Affairs, who declared that the termination was based on Australia's inconsistency between their actions towards East Timor and the agreement signed.⁴ Another significant conflict was also the phone tapping incident, where Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono's phone calls were allegedly intercepted by the Australia Defence Signals Directorate, a part of the Australian government agency, in 2009 and was only exposed in 2013 by whistleblower Edward Snowden. 56 The incident caused a backlash from the Indonesian government, including public protest from government officials and the withdrawal of the Indonesian Ambassador to Australia, Nadjib Riphat Kesoema in November 2013. The Prime Minister of Australia at the time, Tony Abbott, refused to give a formal apology and stated to the parliament that the country 'should not be expected to apologise for reasonable intelligence-gathering activities.' 7 Relations between

_

⁴Imron Cotan, "'Indonesia - Australian Relations: East Timor, Bali Bombing, Tsunami and Beyond," Embassy of The Republic of Indonesia (Wayback Machine, March 1, 2005), https://web.archive.org/web/20100107014127/http://www.kbricanberra.org.au/speeches/2005/050301e.htm.

⁵Henry Belot, "Indonesia and Australia: Deteriorating Diplomacy," The Diplomat, November 26, 2013, https://thediplomat.com/2013/11/indonesia-and-australia-deteriorating-diplomacy/.

⁶theguardian.com, "The Slides That Show Australian Attempts to Monitor Yudhoyono's Phone," The Guardian, November 18, 2013, https://www.theguardian.com/world/interactive/2013/nov/18/slides-australian-yudhoyono-phone-indonesia.

⁷Lenore Taylor, "Tony Abbott: No Explanation, No Apology to Indonesia for Spying," The Guardian, November 19, 2013, https://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/nov/19/tony-abbott-no-apology-explanation-indonesia-spying.

both countries returned to normal when Kesoema was sent to Australia again in May 2014.8

The Australian government officially took a pro-Indonesian stance in responding to the issue of West Papua, supporting the government's interest in keeping the territory as its own. Australia's pro-Indonesian stance on the issue of West Papua was confirmed in the Indonesia-Australia Security Agreement or the 2006 Lombok Treaty when the Australian government started accepting refugees from West Papua under the reasoning that the group "will face persecution if returned to the country of origin" due to Indonesian military violence. 9 The President of Indonesia at the time, Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, criticised Australia's actions as a violation of Indonesia. Australia, on the other hand, regards the refugee issue as a state principle and claims to comply with international law. 10 This dispute set a precedent for the establishment of the Lombok Treaty as a bilateral security agreement between the two countries. In article 2 of the Lombok Treaty, the two countries agreed to respect each other's sovereignty and territorial integrity, and "not to support or participate in activities that constitute a threat to, ownership or territorial integrity of another country, including the use of the territory of the country concerned for similar activities including separatism." 11 The use of the word separatism in the agreement

-

⁸ Aditia Maruli Radja, "Indonesian, Australian Ties Normalize after Ambassador's Return to Canberra," Antara News, June 2, 2014, https://en.antaranews.com/news/94277/indonesian-australian-ties-normalize-after-ambassadors-return-to-canberra.

⁹Rowan Day, "West Papua and the Australia-Indonesia Relationship: A Case Study in Diplomatic Difficulty," *Australian Journal of International Affairs* 69, no. 6 (May 2015): pp. 670-691, https://doi.org/10.1080/10357718.2015.1052730.

¹¹Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. "Agreement between Australia and the Republic of Indonesia on the Framework for Security Cooperation."

emphasises the importance of the issue of separatism, one of the issues about West Papua, in the relations between the two countries. ¹² This treaty was followed by the signing of Code of Conduct (COC) or Joint Understanding in 2014. This cooperation also includes the application of the use of intelligence and information power that does not threaten the interests of the two countries, as well as strengthening cooperation in intelligence and other security sectors. ¹³

While the Australian government is expected to fulfil their commitment to the treaty, Veronica Koman's 2019 activism on human rights violations in West Papua stirred unrest within Australia's domestic politics. As the Indonesian government issued an arrest warrant for the activist, Koman remained in Australia by self-exile. However, Australian authorities refused to hand over Veronica Koman as of present and did not impose any restriction or probation on her. ¹⁴ Specifically, Australia stated that only when a Red Notice from the Interpol was issued do they comply with Indonesia's request through the AFP; in addition, they also confirmed firmly that they would not question the Indonesian authority's proceedings of Koman's case. Contrary to Australia's conditional compliance and reluctance to be involved in the case deeply, the domestic side of Australia

.

https://www.info.dfat.gov.au/Info/Treaties/treaties.nsf/AllDocIDs/ADA704593CAE4466CA25723 100100881 (accessed March 4th 2022)

¹²Ibid.

¹³Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, "Joint Understanding on a Code of Conduct between the Republic of Indonesia and Australia in Implementation of the Agreement between the Republic of Indonesia and Australia on the Framework for Security Cooperation ('the Lombok Treaty')," dfat.gov.au (Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade), accessed March 4, 2022, https://www.dfat.gov.au/geo/indonesia/code-of-conduct-indonesia-and-australia-on-the-framework-for-security-cooperation.

¹⁴Marni Cordell and Ben Doherty. "Australia refuses to rule out handing over Sydney lawyer who advocates for West Papuans to Indonesia." The Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/sep/17/australia-refuses-to-rule-out-handing-over-sydney-lawyer-who-advocates-for-west-papuans-to-indonesia (accessed March 2nd 2022)

demanded otherwise. Australia was expected to break its silence on the West Papua conflict and be more involved in ensuring the human rights protection of West Papuans and activists. In addition, the FWPM in Australia managed to gather sympathy from Australia citizens who rallied and protested during the 2019 conflict uprising.

1.1. Problem Identification

In conducting their commitment towards Indonesia, Australia's foreign policy should have received support from Australia's domestic politics. This reflected the principle of two-level game theory of international relations a nation negotiated on both international and domestic levels. ¹⁵ The negotiated decision should have not been disputed by both levels as the negotiations were aimed to comply with interests in both levels and yield a win-win result. However, there was a discontent among the domestic interest groups regarding the West Papua conflict which the groups demanded to be channelled to Australia's foreign policy towards Indonesia. The discontent was emphasised by Koman's continued activism in Australia following the 2019 riots of West Papua Conflict. On the other hand, Australia officially refused to change their stance on upholding the commitment with Indonesia. The nation only expressed their concern on the human rights violations in West Papua, but did not address the matter directly towards Indonesia.

_

¹⁵ Robert D. Putnam, "Diplomacy and Domestic Politics: The Logic of Two-Level Games," International Organization 42, no. 3 (1988): 427–60, https://www.jstor.org/stable/2706785.

1.2. Research Limitations

The research covers the case of Veronica Koman's activism related to the human rights violation in West Papua Conflict in 2019, which became a part of Indonesia and Australia's national interest and consequently showcased the instability of the two countries' bilateral relations. The unit of analysis in the research is the external and internal factors shaping Australia's commitment towards Indonesia as the nation's foreign policy.

1.3. Research Question

How did Veronica Koman's activism of human rights in West Papua created contradiction between Australia's foreign policy commitment and domestic political pressure?

1.4. Research Objectives

- 1. To explore how social movement emerged because of relative deprivation.
- To explain why Australia's foreign policy is contradictory to the existing domestic political demands.

1.5. Research Benefits

The research was aimed to understanding Veronica Koman's cause of activism in relation to the relative deprivation experienced by OAP, correlating her activism to the uprising of FWPM in Australia, 2019, and understanding

Australia's choice to conduct a foreign policy of commitment towards Indonesia. The researcher hoped that this thesis provided more insight within the similar topics.

1.6. Research Methods

Qualitative research approach is an interpretive and naturalistic approach to research, emphasising on the observation and analysis of a phenomenon within its natural environment. ¹⁶ The approach is aimed towards understanding and interpreting a phenomenon within a specific context. Qualitative research approach focuses on the interpretation of behaviour or social interaction of actors, while requiring a depth of understanding and certain awareness in the process of interpretation. In qualitative research, the researcher acts as an instrument of research and positions themselves in the condition or context where the phenomenon exists. ¹⁷¹⁸ Research with this approach requires data in the form of words, sentences, texts, phrases, statements, and does not usually require numerical data. ¹⁹

_

¹⁶Norman K. Denzin and Yvonna S. Lincoln, *Handbook of Qualitative Research* (Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, 1994), p. 1.

¹⁷Umar Suryadi Bakry, *Metode Penelitian Hubungan Internasional* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2019), p. 18-20.

¹⁸Fiona Devine, "Qualitative Methods," in Vivien Lowndes, David Marsh, and Gerry Stoker, *Theory and Methods in Political Science*, 4th ed. (London: Palgrave, 2017), p. 197–98.

¹⁹Michael Q. Patton dan Michael Cochran, *A Guide to Using Qualitative Research Methodology* (Geneva: Medicins Sans Frontieres, 2002), p. 2.

This research uses the case study method, a method of analysis which puts a singular case as the main object of analysis.²⁰ Analysis focuses intensively on the complexity of the case, which is composed of various aspects and issues.²¹ This method is exploratory in nature and does not have control over the object of analysis. The result of using this method depends on the researcher's ability to integrate and interpret the phenomenon studied.²² Analysis of the case uses interpretative analysis method, a method of analysis which discovers the in-depth meaning of a social process and emphasises on meanings. This analysis method creates cause-effect questions and results as the main recurring theme for the research.²³

The first step to researching in a case study is forming a research framework utilised to explore data. Research framework specifies which data is needed by researchers to conduct a study. The next step after forming a theoretical framework is gathering raw data from various sources through verification process (cross-reference, triangulation) and following the proper and legal procedures. Raw data are systematically analysed and interpreted using a theoretical framework in order to explain research findings. Lastly, the results and

-

²⁰Andrew Bennett, "Case Study Methods: Design, Use, and Comparative Advantages," in Detlef Sprinz and Yael Wolinsky, *Cases, Numbers, Models: International Relations Research Methods* (Michigan: The University of Michigan Press, 2002), p. 29.

²¹Geza Kardos and K.O. Smith, "On Writing Engineering Cases," *Proceedings of ASEE National Conference on Engineering Case Studies*, March 1979.

²²Izak Benbasat, David Goldstein, and Melissa Mead, "The Case Research Strategy in Studies of Information System," dalam *MIS Quarterly*, Vol. 11 No. 3 (1987), p. 372.

²³Umar Suryadi Bakry, *Metode Penelitian Hubungan Internasional* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2019), p. 264-265

interpretations are concluded to show the significance of the case study in similar topics.²⁴

1.7. Literature Review

1.7.1. Social Activism and Democracy in the Discourse of National Interest

Social activism (or movement) is deeply rooted in the feelings of solidarity and identity. Sidney Tarrow's "Power in Movement: Social Movements and Contentious Politics" (2011) explored the roots of social movements and proposed the premise that feelings of solidarity and identity ultimately determine the prevalence of social movement. Due to the nature of social movement, movements that are based on religious or ethnic identities are easier to gain sympathy and organise compared to the categorical imperative of social class. Social movements are also prone to the general attribution of negative sentiments as a product of framing by opposition, even more so when identity is easier defined by religion or ethnicity rather than class structure.

Element of social activism is reflected in democracy, often a part of a country's international politics. Strobe Talbott in "Democracy and National Interest" (1996) argues that countries promote or make democracy as a part of their international politics manoeuvre if it is crucial to their national interests. Interests may not be limited only to economic development but also security and

10

²⁴Yves-Chantal Gagnon, *The Case Study as Research Method: A Practical Handbook* (Quebec, Kanada: Presses de l'Universite du Quebec, 2010), p. 7-9.

reassurance of long-term cooperation; however, the goal of democracy must be balanced with other interests of the country promoting it. For the recipient country, the long process of democratisation can expose a set of risks, particularly risks such as economic stagnation, crisis of power, and potential violence. Just as underdeveloped countries have potential to undergo democratisation, a democratic developing country, on the other hand, is not completely immune to undemocratic practices either. Christian Fuchs in "Nationalism, Communication, Ideology" in "Communication and Capitalism "(2020) described fascism as an extension of nationalism and authoritarianism, and how fascist movements in various levels (individual, group, institution, or society) may exist even within a democratic society. These tendencies are cultivated through the identification of enemies or threat to the society, and the justification of dealing with the enemies pragmatically, often with militaristic and violent means. This extension of nationalism and authoritarianism forgoes the class structure, heavily identifies with the "friend-enemy" scheme, and emphasises on the "us" or comunal element of a nation. In addition, the attribution of the "friend-enemy" scheme not only applies to domestic parties, but also foreign parties as well.

1.7.2. Human Rights and West Papua

The issue of human rights in domestic and international politics gains a significant position within the discourse. Mehtab Manzar in "Human Rights and International Politics", International Politics, Concepts, Theories, and Issues (2012), explored how the concept of human rights developed historically. Manzar

argued a particular point on how the fulfilment of human rights is relative to the culture within a society. One of the examples used to support this argument is the introduction of the West-oriented human rights concept to the Asian region, which was received with negative critiques due to its unrealistic and contradictory nature to the development in the region. Subsequently, fulfilment of human rights through intervention may not also yield the desired result. Kofi Annan through his writing "Reflections on Intervention" in International Politics: Enduring Concepts and Contemporary Issues (2017) brought an interesting point on responding to human rights issues. Annan suggested that in order to yield a desired result while responding to human rights issues, a precise and concise diplomacy supported by adequate force and sense of fairness or justice is needed. Although the point heavily applied to the international organisation United Nations, the same principle was believed to be applicable to each nation member. Narrowing down the issue of human rights to the West Papua region, Florensia Lantang and Edwin M.B. Tambunan in "The Internationalisation of West Papua Issue and Its Impact on Indonesia's Policy To The South Pacific Region" (2020) explained how the mainstreaming of human rights violation issues by pro-West Papua independence activists through social media affected Indonesia's foreign policy. The increasing attention towards the issue shifted Indonesia's foreign policy approach from ignorance of the issue to a more initiative approach; security and economic development is no longer emphasised as the sole perspective in perceiving West Papua conflict, but also from the cultural and educational perspective.

1.7.3. Indonesia-Australia Cooperation

On the relations of Indonesia and Australia, the two countries have participated in multiple cooperation in different sectors, one of the prominent sectors being security. Evan A. Laksmana in "Reinforcing Indonesia-Australia defence relations: The case for maritime Recaliberation (2018) explained how the Indo-Australian cooperation did not necessarily cover possible outcomes or entirety of a sector. As an example, there was never a definitive explanation on the mutual strategic interests possessed by both countries other than the maritimerelated sector. At the same time, Laksamana acknowledged the "anti-foreign intervention" sentiment from Indonesia and recommended that Indonesia minimise non-security cooperations, in particular democracy and human rights issues or discourse. Particularly about West Papua, the relations between Indonesia and Australia has been described as contradictory and complex. Rowan Day in "West Papua and the Australia-Indonesia Relationship: A Case Study in Diplomatic Difficulty" (2015) described the different perspectives between Indonesia and Australia on human rights issues and how the difference created instability and deteriorated bilateral relations. ²⁵ Day stated that the support of Australia towards the Timor Leste self-determination option constructed a negative impression from Indonesia of the country. In addition, the negative impression was exacerbated by the Australian government's decision to accept 43 refugees from West Papua, prompting Indonesia to respond formally through the

-

²⁵Rowan Day, "West Papua and the Australia-Indonesia Relationship: A Case Study in Diplomatic Difficulty," *Australian Journal of International Affairs* 69, no. 6 (August 5, 2015): 670–91, https://doi.org/10.1080/10357718.2015.1052730.

governmental institutions and informally through the civil society. In response to Australia's acceptance of the refugees, Indonesia officially retracted the delegation of Indonesia for Australia and decided to "re-evaluate" the bilateral cooperation commenced by Indonesian President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono. The Indonesian public gave a negative response towards the Australian government's decision, which prompted political instability in Indonesia.

1.8. Theoretical Framework

Social movement is analysed with the Relative Deprivation (RD) Theory conceptualised by Ted Robert Gurr. He defined relative deprivation as the tension developing from the discrepancy between value expectations and value capabilities collectively perceived by a group, which prompts the group to use violence. RD contains three indicators to determined how a group is subjected to the feeling of deprivation: value expectations, value capabilities, and value opportunities. Value expectations is defined as "goods and conditions of life to which people believe they are rightfully entitled." Value capabilities is defined as "goods and conditions they think they can get and keep with their current abilities." Value opportunities is defined as "availability of course of action to attain desired expectations." These values are considered "relative" due to the existence of another group serving as the benchmark, or comparison, to the deprived group's condition. Gurr then specified RD into three model, in which one---the aspirational deprivation---- is used for the purpose of the analysis. Aspirational deprivation model is utilised when the value expectations rise within

a group, but not followed with "con-comitant change" in value capabilities. As a result, there is a dissatisfaction and anger from the group who recognise their inability to obtain the rising expectations or standards. Response to RD is determined by its intensity, Gurr noted, with long term and huge disparity increasing potential violent response.²⁶

In order to explain the contradiction between foreign policy and domestic pressure, the researcher utilised two concepts. To analyse commitment as a form of foreign policy, the researcher adapted a part of the Democratic Peace theory of Zeev Maoz and Bruce Russett. Maoz and Russett theorised that one of the reasons pressuring nations to cooperate or maintain peace is political stability.²⁷ When a nation has a stable and durable political system, it lacks incentives to externalise domestic discontent into conflict with foreign countries. Reluctance to trigger conflict with another nation is also correlated to the partner nation's political situation and substantial legitimacy. Firstly, a partner nation with stable politics would have a large population of it supporting the nation's decision, including when the nation mentioned engages in a conflict or experiences tensions with other nations. Secondly, a partner nation's substantial legitimacy concerns the acknowledgement and support of a nation's perspective and decision, which can be deemed as legitimate if it has undergone recognised proceedings or acknowledged or backed up by other actors with appropriate legal positions. These two factors of political stability create a deterrence to other nations,

_

²⁶ Ted Robert Gurr, Why Men Rebel (New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group, 1970), 22–58. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315631073.

²⁷ Bruce Martin Russett and Et Al, *Grasping the Democratic Peace : Principles for a Post-Cold War World* (Princeton N.J: Princeton University Press, 1993), 23.

particularly those of the same democratic nature, who may push for conflict. Adapting these principles, the researcher formulated that (1) commitment to peaceful foreign policy showed reluctance to trigger conflict, (2) the united support due to a partner nation's stable politics is unfavourable when conflict arises, and (3) commitment to foreign policy means acknowledging the substantial legitimacy a partner nation has.

Related to the domestic discontent mentioned in the first concept, the second concept, political support, concerned the interest groups in the domestic aspect of foreign policy. Grossman and Helpman defined political support as a part of the election-voter scheme of domestic politics. ²⁸ They theorise that political support often emerge based on primitive preference over campaign contributions and voter well-being. In the process, government processed the groups in the election-voter scheme and put different weights. Interest groups with more political contributions are likelier to receive more priority or focus that those with little to no contributions. Political contribution specifically comes as the ability to contribute in terms of numbers (votes, supporters) or benefits. The differences in political contribution, then, determined the course of foreign policy a nation takes. Adapting these principles, the researcher formulated that (1) political support towards a cause potentially emerge from primitive factors, (2) numbers and benefits offered by interest groups prompted a nation to pursue certain foreign policy behaviours, and (3) each interest group is treated differently based on their political contribution to the domestic politics.

_

²⁸ Gene M. Grossman and Elhanan Helpman, "Protection for Sale," *The American Economic Review* 84, no. 4 (1994): 833–50, https://www.jstor.org/stable/2118033.

With the concepts formulated, the researcher established a framework in which the first concept is categorised as the external factor pushing for commitment, while the second concept is categorised as internal factor of contradiction within domestic politics. The theory of RD is used not only to explain activism and social movement, but also to complement the two concepts explaining foreign policy.

1.9. Structure of Analysis

Chapter I "Introduction" provides a brief introduction to the case of Veronica Koman's human rights activism and Australia's response towards the case. The response from Australia contradicts the domestic politics of Australia pressuring otherwise. From the issue explained, a qualitative theoretical framework of the impact or role of Koman's case towards Australia is formulated. The framework created is intended to answer how Koman's case highlighted the contradiction between Australia's foreign policy commitment towards Indonesia and the domestic politics demanding polar-opposite actions.

Chapter II "Veronica Koman's Activism Of The West Papua Human Rights Violations And Australia's Response To Her Case" discusses the details of West Papua Conflict, which include the history, core and complexity of the conflict, and the internationalisation of the conflict. Veronica Koman's activism in the conflict is also explored, along with the subsequent response of the Indonesia, and followed by Australia's response towards Koman's arrest warrant due to her

activism in 2019. This chapter also explores the West Papua Conflict in the domestic politics of Australia.

Chapter III "Veronica Koman's Activism As Representation Of Contradicting Domestic Pressure And Australia's Commitment To Indonesia" applies the concept of relative deprivation, political stability, and political support to the data explored in Chapter II. This chapter contains the analysis of Veronica Koman's activism as the response to the relative deprivation experienced by OAP. Included in the analysis is the external factors pushing Australia's commitment towards Indonesia and the internal factors of domestic politics pressuring Australia to act against the commitment. From the analysis, the nature of Australia's contradictory foreign policy and domestic politics is determined.

Chapter IV "Conclusion" concludes the case of Veronica Koman and its role in highlighting Australia's contradictory foreign policy and domestic politics. With Koman's activism gaining traction in Australia's domestic politics, the contradiction between the nation's official stance and its domestic pressure became more apparent.