#### **CHAPTER 5**

#### CONCLUSION

The War on Drugs is a program established by Rodrigo Duterte, entrusted to the Philippines National Police, which aims to combat the Philippines' drug problem through the capture and assassination of drug suspects. The extrajudicial killings of drug suspects are carried out by shootings during house or drug den raids and 'buy-bust' operations. Drug-related killings have also been done by unknown armed persons which have been proved to be affiliated with the government. The operation has resulted in thousands of victims, with data ranging from 7.000 to over 20.000 deaths. As a member of the UNHRC, the Philippines is receiving intense backlash from both domestic and international communities. Pressure is also placed on UNHRC, as an IGO responsible to tackle human rights violations all around the world. The UNHRC has taken measures in addressing cases of EJK in the Philippines' War on Drugs. Through the view of neoliberal institutionalism, the role of UNHRC as an IGO is imperative in solving cases of human rights violations that cannot be addressed by the Philippines independently. This research described the efforts of UNHRC in addressing human rights violations in the form of extrajudicial killings present in the Philippines' anti-drug campaign or as widely referred to as War on Drugs from 2017 to 2020

The first attempt is through UNHRC's UPR, a mechanism which reviews the human rights situation of states and facilitates discussion in regards to the review and produces recommendations for reviewed states. The UPR review of the Philippines was held in 2017 and addressed issues of human rights violations namely extrajudicial killings in War on Drugs. The UPR functions as the provider of information as well as the facilitator of information exchange which addresses human rights violations in the Philippines and raises

public awareness regarding the issue. The UPR also pushed the adoption of other measures such as the two resolutions that are also a part of discussion in this study.

The second effort of UNHRC is through resolution 4/12 for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights in the Philippines. This resolution called for Philippines; cooperation in complying to OHCHR and UNHRC's requests and mechanisms in addressing human rights situations in the Philippines. It also requested the OHCHR to arrange a report on the current state of human rights situation in the Philippines. The report itself highlighted issues of human rights violations and provided recommendations in regards to the issues mentioned. The resolution's function in rule-making added another layer of provision in the field human rights, complementing existing international human rights regulations, to ensure the commitment of the Philippines government in respecting human rights and the rule of law in the practice of War on Drugs. This resolution also becomes the basis of another resolution which supports technical cooperation of the Philippines with UNHRC along with OHCHR.

Lastly, UNHRC adopted a resolution which was established to complement the previous resolution. The resolution requests OHCHR and all relevant stakeholders to support and provide technical assistance and capacity building to the Philippines government in an objective of promoting and enhancing human rights situation in the Philippines.

Through the analysis of SWOC, strengths of UNHRC efforts are supported by the inclusivity of its stakeholders which allows ease of information gathering, creates peer-driven cooperation and monitoring by local NGOs. The weaknesses of the efforts however, lies in the legal status of the recommendations and resolutions, as it is non-legally binding and lacks punitive sanctions. Opportunities of UNHRC efforts is reflected in its capability in raising awareness to the public and encourages the cases to be addressed by other entities in the international system, especially one with bigger authority than the UNHRC. However, challenges that the UNHRC faces is the Duterte administration which distrust and is not

inclined to cooperation under UNHRC and IOs in general. Through an analysis of SWOC, the UNHRC must place its focus on seizing the strengths and opportunities while taking measures in countering its weaknesses and challenges in order to ensure the effectiveness of its efforts in addressing cases of EJK in the Philippines War on Drugs and strengthen the protection and promotion of human rights.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

## **Books**

Archer, Clive. "International Organizations," Routledge, 2001.

Barkin, J Samuel. "International Organization: Theories and Institutions," 2006

"Creswell, John W. "Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among five approaches", SAGE Publications, 2013.

Karns, Margaret P; Mingst, Margaret P; Stiles, Kendall W. "International Organizations the Politics and Processes of global governance," USA: Lynne Rienner Publisher Inc., 2015.

Lamont, Christopher K., "Research Methods in International Relations," SAGE Publications, 2015.

Mingst, Karen A. & Arreguín-toft, Ivan M. "Essentials of International Relations", W. W. Norton & Company, (1999-2017)

Mudde, C. and Kaltwasser, C. R., "Populism: A very short introduction." New York: Oxford University Press, 2017.

UNHRC, "Human Rights Council Handbook", https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/HRhandbooken.pdf

# **Journal Articles & Reports**

"Human Rights Advisory on the Accepted and Noted Recommendations by the Philippines During the Third Cycle of the Universal Periodic Review," Commision on Human Rights of the Philippines, CHR A2018-001

Aceves, William J. "When Death Becomes Murder: A Primer On Extrajudicial Killing," Columbia Human Rights Law Review, 50:1 2018

AFAD, FIND, "Joint Submission of AFAD and FIND (with the support of Misereor) Third Cycle of the UN Universal Periodic Review,"

 $https://www.upr-info.org/sites/default/files/document/philippines/session\_27\_-\_may\_2017/js 1\_upr27\_phl\_e\_main.pdf$ 

Agnello, Alexander. "Extrajudicial Killings and Human Rights Education in the Philippines," McGill Centre for Human Rights and Legal Pluralism Working Paper Series, Volume 5 no. 6, (2017)

Amnesty International, "'They Just Kill' Ongoing Extrajudicial Executions and Other Violations in The Philippines," 2019,

https://www.justice.gov/eoir/page/file/1180791/download

Amnesty International, ""Disappearances" and extrajudicial executions as violations of international human rights",

https://www.amnesty.org/download/Documents/188000/act330051993en.pdf

Amnesty International, "Assessment Of The Human Rights Situation In The Philippines Against Objective Criteria For Action By The Un Human Rights Council," 11 June 2019, IOR 40/0466/2019,

https://www.amnesty.org/download/Documents/IOR4004662019ENGLISH.PDF

Amnesty International, "If You Are Poor, You Are Killed: Extrajudicial Executions In The Philippines' War on Drugs," 2017.

Ateneo Human Rights Center (AHRC), "Summary and Extrajudicial Killing in the Philippines, A Submission to the United Nations Human Rights Council for the Universal Periodic Review of the Philippines," 2017.

Ateneo Human Rights Center, "Summary & Extrajudicial Killings in The Philippines,"https://www.ateneo.edu/sites/default/files/attached-files/Summary%20and%20E xtrajudicial%20Killings%20in%20the%20Philippines%20%28AHRC%29%20-%20UPR%203rd%20Cycle.pdf

Blanchfield, Luisa and Weber, Michael A. "The United Nations Human Rights Council: Background and Policy Issues," Congressional Research Service, 25 November 2020.

Eisentraut, Sophie; Tokhi, Alexandros; Berlin, Wissenschaftszentrum. "Authoritarian States and the Politicization of International Institutions," 2013.

https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Authoritarian-States-and-the-Politicization-of-Eisentraut-Tokhi/996800f6c6f85c15434dead2be91725128060ebc

Gallagher, Adrian; Raffle, Euan. & Maulana, Zain; "Failing to fulfil the responsibility to protect: the War on Drugs as crimes against humanity in the Philippines," The Pacific Review, 2019, https://doi.org/10.1080/09512748.2019.1567575

Gujadhur, Subhas & Lamarque, Toby. "Ensuring Relevance, Driving Impact: The evolution and future direction of the UN Human Rights Council's resolution system," Universal Rights Group, January 2015

Human Rights Watch, "License to Kill: Philippine police killings in Duterte's War on Drugs," 2 March 2017, https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/report\_pdf/philippines0317\_web\_1.pdf

Human Rights Watch, "License to Kill: Philippine Police Killings in Duterte's War on Drugs," March 2017,

https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/report\_pdf/philippines0317\_web\_1.pdf

Human Rights Watch, "You Can Die Anytime: Death Squad Killings in Mindanao," April 2009, https://www.hrw.org/report/

2009/04/06/you-can-die-any-time/death-squad-killings-mindanao

Ismail, Zenobia. "Technical Assistance and Capacity Building in International Development," K4D, 6 June 2019,

https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/5d1c7c14e5274a08d734b81a/607\_Technical\_ Assistance\_and\_Capacity\_Building\_in\_International\_Development.pdf

Lagon, Mark P. & Kaminski, Ryan. "Bolstering the UN Human Rights Council's Effectiveness," Council on Foreign Relations: International Institutions and Global Governance Program, 2017.

Netipatalachoochote, Stanati; Ciacchi, Aurelia Colombi; Holzhacker, Ronald. "Human Rights Norm Diffusion in Southeast Asia: Roles of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) in Ending Extrajudicial Killings in the Philippines," Journal of Southeast Asian Human Rights, Vol. 2 No. 1 June 2018.

Pernia, Robert A. "Human Rights in a Time of Populism: Philippines under Rodrigo Duterte" Asia-Pacific Social Science Review 19(3), 2019.

Rana, Sameer . "Review or Rhetoric? An Analysis of the United Nations Human Rights Council's Universal Periodic Review" Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection. 2239, 2015. https://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp\_collection/2239

Reyes, Danilo Andro. "The Spectacle of Violence in Duterte's "War on Drugs", Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs, 35, 3, 111–137. 2016.

Weyland, K. "Clarifying a contested concept: Populism in the study of Latin American politics." Comparative Politics, 34(1), https://doi.org/10.2307/422412, 2011

# **UN Documents, Conventions & Resolutions**

OHCHR, "International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights" https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/ccpr.aspx

OHCHR, "Report of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights on the Situation of human rights in the Philippines," A/HRC/44/22, 29 June 2020

Ourworldindata, "Human Rights Scores, 1946 to 2017," https://ourworldindata.org/human-rights

Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, (last amended 2010), 17 July 1998.

UN Economic and Social Council, "Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions", 24 May 1989, https://www.un.org/ruleoflaw/blog/document/principles-on-the-effective-prevention-and-investigation-of-extra-legal-arbitrary-and-summary-executions/.

UN General Assembly, "International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights," 23 March 1976, https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/ccpr.aspx.

UN General Assembly, "Note verbale dated 9 October 2015 from the Permanent Mission of the Philippines to the United Nations addressed to the President of the General Assembly," 15 October 2015, A/70/424, https://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=A/70/424

UN Human Rights Council, "UN Human Rights Council: Preliminary Note on the Visit of the Special Rapporteur on Extrajudicial, Summary or Arbitrary Executions, to the Philippines (12-21 February 2007)," 22 March 2007, A/HRC/4/20/Add.3, https://www.refworld.org/docid/462390f62.html

UNHRC, "Compilation on the Philippines: Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights," 27 February 2017, A/HRC/WG.6/27/PHL/2

UNHRC, "Philippines Addendum to the Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, Views on conclusions and/or recommendations, voluntary commitments and replies presented by the State under review," 19 September 2017, A/HRC/36/12/Add.1

UNHRC, "Promotion and protection of human rights in the Philippines: resolution / adopted by the Human Rights Council on 11 July 2019," 17 July 2019, A/HRC/41/L.20.

UNHRC, "Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review Philippines," A/HRC/36/12, 18 July 2017, https://undocs.org/en/A/HRC/36/12.

UNHRC, "Summary of stakeholders' submissions - the Philippines: Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights," 27 February 2017,A/HRC/WG.6/27/PHL/3

UNHRC, "Technical cooperation and capacity-building for the promotion and protection of human rights in the Philippines," 28 September 2020, A/HRC/45/L.38.

United Nations General Assembly, "Resolution 60/251: Human Rights Council", 3 April 2006, A/RES/60/251, https://undocs.org/en/A/RES/60/251.

United Nations, "United Nations Manual on The Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions," 1991, E/ST/CSDHA/.12.

United Nations, Charter of the United Nations, 24 October 1945, 1 UNTS XVI, https://www.un.org/en/about-us/un-charter/full-text

University of minnesota, "Principles Of Management" <a href="https://open.lib.umn.edu/principlesmanagement/chapter/4-3-the-roles-of-mission-vision-and-values/">https://open.lib.umn.edu/principlesmanagement/chapter/4-3-the-roles-of-mission-vision-and-values/</a>

## **Official Websites**

"Government's outrageous defense of human rights onslaught slammed," FIDH, 25 September 2017,

https://www.fidh.org/en/region/asia/philippines/government-s-outrageous-defense-of-human-rights-onslaught-slammed

"UN Human Rights Council recommends suspension of Libya" OHCHR, 25 February 2011, https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/HRCSpecialSessionLibya.aspx

Center for Innovation in Research and Teaching, "Overview of Descriptive Research", Grand Canyon University, 1949,

https://cirt.gcu.edu/research/developmentresources/research ready/descriptive/overview.

Frans Viljoen, "International Human Rights Law: A Short History," United Nations, https://www.un.org/en/chronicle/article/international-human-rights-law-short-history

Harvard Law School, "Intergovernmental Organizations (IGOs)",

https://hls.harvard.edu/dept/opia/what-is-public-interest-law/public-service-practice-settings/public-international-law/types-of-igos/

Mary Aileen Diez-Bacalso, "An unattainable dream: Why the Philippines did not, and will not, ratify the Convention on Enforced Disappearances," Völkerrechtsblog, 21 December 2020, doi: 10.17176/20210107-182237-0.

OHCHR, "Human Rights Bodies",

https://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/Pages/HumanRightsBodies.aspx

OHCHR, "The Philippines' human rights record to be reviewed by Universal Periodic Review," 3 May 2017,

https://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/HRC/Pages/NewsDetail.aspx?NewsID=21574&LangID=C.

UN, "Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions",

https://www.un.org/ruleoflaw/blog/document/principles-on-the-effective-prevention-and-investigation-of-extra-legal-arbitrary-and-summary-executions/

UNHRC, "Background information on the Advisory Committee," https://www.ohchr.org/en/hrbodies/hrc/advisorycommittee/pages/aboutac.aspx

UNHRC, "Human Rights Council Complaint Procedure,"

https://www.ohchr.org/en/hrbodies/hrc/complaintprocedure/pages/hrccomplaintprocedureinde x.aspx

UNHRC, "Human Rights Council",

https://www.ohchr.org/en/hrbodies/hrc/pages/aboutcouncil.aspx

UNHRC, "Officers of the Human Rights Council's Twelfth Cycle (2018)," https://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/HRC/Pages/Bureau12thCycle.aspx

UNHRC, "Universal Periodic Review,"

https://www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/UPR/Pages/PHindex.aspx

United Nations, "Human Rights,"

 $https://www.un.org/en/sections/issues-depth/human-rights/\#:\sim:text=Human\%20 rights\%20 are \%20 rights\%20 inherent, and \%20 education \%2C\%20 and \%20 many\%20 more.$ 

United Nations, "UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights", 1948. https://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/

UNODC, "World Report on Drugs 2016",

https://www.unodc.org/doc/wdr2016/WORLD\_DRUG\_REPORT\_2016\_web.pdf.

UNODC, World Report on Drugs 2016,

https://www.unodc.org/doc/wdr2016/WORLD\_DRUG\_REPORT\_2016\_web.pdf.

# **News Articles**

Agence France-Presse, "UN envoy warns on human trafficking in Philippines," Philippine Daily Inquirer, 9 November 2012,

https://globalnation.inquirer.net/55726/un-envoy-warns-on-human-trafficking-in-philippines

Al Jazeera, "Duterte attacks rights officials Callamard and Bensouda," 9 March 2018, https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/3/9/duterte-attacks-rights-officials-callamard-and-bensouda

Alexis Romero, "Rody wants 6 more months for War on Drugs, crime," The Philippine Star, 19 September 2016

Ariel Paolo Tejada, "Duterte vows to end criminality in 3 months," Philstar Global, 20 February 2016,

https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2016/02/20/1555349/duterte-vows-end-criminality-3-months

BBC News, "Jewish leaders react to Rodrigo Duterte Holocaust remarks," 30 September 2016, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-37515642

BBC News, "Philippines election: Maverick Rodrigo Duterte wins presidency," 10 May 2016, bbc.com/news/world-asia-36253612

BBC News, "Philippines President Rodrigo Duterte in Quotes," 30 September 2016, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-36251094

BBC News, "Philippines President Rodrigo Duterte in Quotes," 30 September 2016, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-36251094

BBC News, "UN creates new human rights body," 15 March 2006, http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/europe/4810538.stm

Christina Mendez, "Duterte to PNP: Kill 1,000, I'll protect you," The Philippine Star, 2 July 2016.

Christine O. Avendaño, "Duterte tells drug suspects to stay in jail if they want to live longer," Philippine Daily Inquirer, 24 May 2018

https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/993827/duterte-tells-drug-suspects-to-stay-in-jail-if-they-want-to-live-longer.

Eimor Santos, "UN rights council approves 'technical assistance' to PH amid killings," CNN Philippines, October 7 2020,

https://cnnphilippines.com/news/2020/10/7/united-nations-technical-assistance-philippines-rights-abuses-killings-.html

Euan McKirdy, "Philippines' Rodrigo Duterte: Public 'can kill' criminals," CNN, 6 June 2016.

Father Amado Picardal, "The Victims of the Davao Death Squad: Consolidated Report, 1998-2015," CBCP News, http://www.cbcpnews.com/cbcpnews/?p=76531.

https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/politics/1985/08/08/davao-known-as-philippines-m urder-capital/ce938055-0f5d-451c-9420-c2da95277dad/?utm term=.5da6587255c8

Jodesz Gavilan, "As situation worsens, groups urge UN Human Rights Council to act vs killings in PH," Rappler, September 14 2020,

https://www.rappler.com/nation/worsen-situation-groups-urge-un-human-rights-council-act-vs-killings-philippines.

Jodesz Gavilan, "As situation worsens, groups urge UN Human Rights Council to act vs killings in PH," Rappler, September 14 2020,

https://www.rappler.com/nation/worsen-situation-groups-urge-un-human-rights-council-act-vs-killings-philippines.

Jodesz Gavilan, "DDB: Philippines has 1.8 million current drug users," Rappler, September 19, 2016.

https://www.rappler.com/nation/drug-use-survey-results-dangerous-drugs-board-philippines-2 015

Jodesz Gavilan, "PH can be kicked out of UN council if killings continue – HRW," Rappler, October 9 2017,

https://www.rappler.com/nation/philippines-kicked-out-united-nations-human-rights-council-if-drug-war-killings-continue-hrw

Michael Bueza, "IN NUMBERS: The Philippines' 'War on Drugs'," Rappler, 21 January 2017.

Param Preet-Singh, "ICC One Step Closer to Probe of Philippines Murderous 'War on Drugs'," Human Rights Watch, 14 June 2021

https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/06/14/icc-one-step-closer-probe-philippines-murderous-wardrugs

Patricia Denise M. Chiu, "DOJ chief tells UN rights body new panel to probe 5,000 deaths in police anti-drug operations," Inquirer, June 30 2020,

https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1299804/doj-chief-tells-un-rights-body-new-panel-to-probe-500 0-deaths-in-police-anti-drug-operations

Patricia Lourdes Viray, "Philippine NGOs to raise drug war at UN rights council," The Philippine Star, 13 September 2019,

https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2019/09/13/1951495/philippine-ngos-raise-drug-war-un-rights-council.

Pia Ranada, "Duterte bares details of 3-to-6-month anti-crime plan," Rappler, 14 April 2016.

Rappler, "EXPLAINER: How serious is the PH drug problem? Here's the data," 27 August 2016, https://www.rappler.com/newsbreak/iq/data-drug-problem-philippines.

Rappler, "Rise in Central Luzon drug kills? Commanders were 'hardworking' – PNP", 27 February 2019,

https://www.rappler.com/nation/224501-rise-drug-killings-central-luzon-pnp-says-commanders-hardworking.

Reuters, "Filipinos give thumbs up to Duterte's 'excellent' drugs war: poll," 23 September 2019, https://www.reuters.com/article/us-philippines-drugs-idUSKBN1W803M.

The Manila Times, "Duterte drug war necessary to protect rights of Filipinos -Cayetano," 24 September 2017,

http://www.manilatimes.net/duterte-drug-war-necessary-protect-rights-filipinos-cayetano/352 534/.

The Philippine Daily Inquirer, "PH wins new term to UN rights council," https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/7947/ph-wins-new-term-to-un-rights-council

United Nations Press, "General Assembly Elects 47 Members of New Human Rights Council," 9 May 2006, https://www.un.org/press/en/2006/ga10459.doc.htm

William Branigin, "Davao Known as Philippines' 'Murder Capital," Washington Post, August 8 1985.