

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION

This thesis seeks to answer the question “*What are the efforts of ILO through the BWI program in achieving SDG 8?*” and throughout the chapters, the answer to this question has been founded. With the help of Liberal Institutionalism theory and the concept of International Organizations by Clive Archer, the author have concluded that the BWI has successfully carried out five efforts in achieving the SDG 8, specifically on targets 8.5, 8.7, and 8.8 through indicators 8.5.1, 8.5.2, 8.7.1, 8.8.1, and 8.8.2.

Firstly, in attaining indicator 8.5.1, which is to create decent average hourly earnings of female and male employees by occupation, age, and person with disabilities, BWI has conducted five efforts which are making an assessment, doing advisory services, carrying out training, organizing industry seminars and forums, and creating the publication. Through these efforts, BWI has been a great help in socializing and informing factories regarding existing rules and regulations on the fixed-term workers and overtime wages. The workers and employers are now becoming more aware of their responsibilities and rights, resulting in a better payment rate for the workers which eventually will increase their effectiveness that will benefit the employers.

However, according to the Employers' Organization and the Factory, even though the help from the BWI has been great on the matter of socializing government's regulations, they feel like the national regulations – especially on the matter of overtime work and fixed-term workers – are currently unfair for the garment factories. Thus, they hope in the future BWI could further influence the policy and regulations-making. They demand an adjusted-regulation for their businesses and hope the BWI could accommodate this interest. As a note, it must be underlined that both parties also consider the workers' health. Even if there will be new regulation on this matter, they will not neglect the health and overall condition of the workers.

Responding to this comment, the BWI stated that it is beyond the mandate of the program. The program only refers to the existing regulations and further enhance the compliance rate of these regulations in the real world. In other words, the intention of the program is not to create a good regulatory environment, rather, to create a good implementation of the regulations. Adding on, BWI stated that BWI's main role is assisting every stakeholder. Meaning that the role of each stakeholder should be the responsibility of those stakeholders themselves. Nevertheless, considering that there is a growing concern of the stakeholders, the BWI has created forums to facilitate parties to discuss prevailing issues. Furthermore, the BWI has also done an effort to make the working climate better by providing the guidelines that refer to the existing regulations.

Secondly, regarding the indicator 8.5.2, this indicator aims to decrease the unemployment rate by sex, age, and person with disabilities. Also, it implicitly aims to

create decent work for everyone. On this matter, the BWI has done a series of efforts such as creating assessment reports, publications, pieces of training, industry seminars and forums and conducting advisory services. Here, the stakeholders stated that the BWI has stressed the government regulation which obliged the factories to hire at least 1% of people with disabilities on their workforces, making factories aware of this reality and encouraged to hire more people with disabilities. Adding on, as the gender equality issues are currently rising, the BWI has been a great help on this matter. It has conducted training, campaign, and creating publications so there is an increased awareness on this issue which makes the non-compliance level decreased and the progress in creating decent work could be seen.

From the field findings, every stakeholder agrees that BWI has played a crucial role in both matters – be it on hiring people with disabilities or gender equality. The Government is very thankful as the BWI has socialized the government regulation which requires factories to have at least 1% of people with disabilities as their workforces, and has also raised the awareness of related stakeholders on sexual harassment issue through its endless support although challenges are still remaining.

However, on this matter, the Workers' Union stated that in some factories, the sexual harassment cases remained high and ironically, it is perceived as a sensitive area, making the discussion of this issue is second to none. The victims are reluctant to make a complaint because this issue is very sensitive. In the future, the Workers' Union hopes the BWI could bring up and accommodate the discussion of this issue regularly

as the problem is getting severe and needs to be handled as soon as possible. From the BWI's perspective, it stated that the garment industry is indeed a gender-by-focus industry as the workers are mostly females (80-90%). Thus, BWI has recently enhanced its influence in realizing gender equality. They have created several discussions to eliminate the practice of sexual harassment.

Thirdly, in achieving indicator 8.7.1 that strives to lower the proportion and number of children aged 5-17 years engaged in child labor, the BWI has done three efforts which are creating an assessment, carrying out advisory services, and making publications. The issue of Child Labor is actually not a problem in the garment sector right from the beginning as the buyers demand factories to have zero non-compliance levels on this matter, thus, factories have no other choice rather than fulfilling such demand, making the non-compliance conduct hard to be seen. The BWI has also confirmed that it does not put its main focus on this issue, but through the efforts aforementioned, the BWI hopes to make the non-compliance rate reach 0%.

Fourthly, on the efforts to decrease frequency rates of fatal and non-fatal occupational injuries, by sex and migrant status to attain indicator 8.8.1, there are five efforts conducted by BWI and those are creating an assessment, conducting pieces of training, making publications, organizing industry seminars and forum, and carrying out advisory services. From the field findings, stakeholders have confirmed that the BWI has done several activities and socialization for issues related to OSH, however, the awareness of both the factories and workers remained low. Thus, there needs to be

a greater effort of BWI in raising the awareness of each party. For the factories, many of them are not aware of the meaning of OSH and how it could affect productivity. Then, for the Labor Union, they highlighted that many workers are still not paying attention to this matter as they pay attention more to the traditional issues rather than the modern ones like the issue of OSH. Both of these stakeholders acknowledged the role of BWI in assisting this matter, however, there needs to be further efforts to solve this issue.

Lastly, in order to achieve indicator 8.8.2 which strives to increase the national compliance of Labor rights (freedom of association and collective bargaining) based on ILO textual sources and national legislation, by sex and migrant status, BWI has also executed five efforts. The efforts are the same as the previous indicator, which are conducting advisory services and creating an assessment, publications, pieces of training, and industry seminars and forums. Here, all stakeholders felt that these efforts have created improvement on the matter of freedom of association and collective bargaining as all stakeholders now have an increased understanding of how to communicate and negotiate with one another. Also, they feel really thankful for the forums held regularly by BWI as these forums have strengthened the cooperation and bond among parties and have become an effective method in solving the prevailing issues in the factories.

The Labor Union is the one who benefited the most from this conduct as they have gained a higher bargaining power than before from a series of efforts given by the BWI.

However, for them, this issue is still perceived as a serious one as there are still difficulties in attaining a proper collective bargaining activity. This concern was then also confirmed by the Employers' Organization. They stated that in factories, there is still a possibility where the management team and workers union in a factory are not coherent and disagree with one another. Thus, even though the efforts have been there, the BWI is totally aware of the non-compliances occurring in the workplaces and committed to working harder on this regard so conducive collective bargaining could be achieved.

From the findings, it is apparent that there are five efforts of BWI in attaining the SDG 8 and these efforts have fulfilled the Liberal Institutionalism theory as cooperation between international actors have been achieved. The ILO through the BWI program has succeeded to cooperate with the Indonesian Government on this matter, and even better, it has also maintained a good partnership with other actors such as the Factories, Employers' Organization, Labor Unions, and Buyers. Adding on, to facilitate cooperation between parties, all of the actors have agreed to comply under the international regime which is the International Labor Standards that complements the National Labor Law.

Also, the International Organizations' role and function concept is endorsed here as various roles and functions of International Organizations are fulfilled. The ILO through the BWI program has played a role as an instrument, forum, and actor in conducting its efforts in achieving the SDG 8. Further, it has also delivered several

functions such as articulation and aggregation, norms, recruitment, rule application, socialization, and operation. Thus, from these fulfillments, the ILO through the BWI program has worked hard as an international actor to help the attainment of SDG 8.

To conclude, there are five efforts conducted by BWI to achieve SDG 8 and those efforts are making an assessment, doing advisory services, carrying out training, organizing industry seminars and forums, and creating the publication. Through these efforts, even though some problems are still occurring, related stakeholders have admitted that the BWI has helped them in solving issues related to Compensation, Discrimination, Child Labor, Occupational Safety and Health, and Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining which further enable them in achieving the SDG 8.

ANNEX

1. Interview Guidelines for the Employers' Organization, Labor Union, Factory, and Government Representatives

1. So far, does the existence of the BWI has provided benefits for your institution?
2. The BWI has a range of services such as creating an assessment report, carrying out advisory services, conducting industry seminars and forums, executing pieces of training, and making publications. Thus,
 - a) How is the implementation in the field?
 - b) How is your organization's involvement in those services?
3. Regarding a specific topic such as:
 - a) Child Labor;
 - b) Compensation;
 - c) Discrimination;
 - d) Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining;
 - e) Occupational Safety and Health;

It is found that non-compliances practices are still prevailing. Thus,

- a) How do you respond to the findings?
 - b) How is the practice in your institution?
 - c) What is the assistance that has been given by the BWI in those aspects?
4. Overall, how satisfied are you with the services provided by the BWI on the specific issues that we have just discussed?

5. Do you have any suggestions for the BWI services on those issues?
6. Is there anything that I have not asked yet but you would like to share?

2. Interview Guidelines for the BWI

1. So far, how is the implementation of BWI services such as creating assessment report, carrying out advisory services, conducting industry seminars and forums, executing pieces of training, and making publications in the field related to SDG 8 especially on the aspects of:
 - a) Child Labor;
 - b) Compensation;
 - c) Discrimination;
 - d) Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining;
 - e) Occupational Safety and Health?
2. Are there any specific services from the BWI that cover the issues of:
 - a) Child Labor;
 - b) Compensation;
 - c) Discrimination;
 - d) Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining;
 - e) Occupational Safety and Health?
3. Based on the field findings, all of the stakeholders feel satisfied with the services provided by the BWI, however, the Factory and Employers' Organization representatives consider that in the future, the BWI needs to be more involved in the regulation-making process related to the garment industry. Thus, how do you respond to that?

4. Specifically, regarding findings on the matter of Child Labor, it appears that the non-compliance rate is very low (2%-3% in 2015-2018). Therefore:
 - a) Did the non-compliance rate on this aspect was already low from the beginning, or did the BWI play a significant role here?
 - b) What are the services provided by the BWI on this aspect?
5. To what extent has the BWI made efforts to attain SDG 8, specifically on the following aspects:
 - a) Child Labor;
 - b) Compensation;
 - c) Discrimination;
 - d) Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining;
 - e) Occupational Safety and Health?
6. In the future, what are the hopes of the BWI to reach SDG 8, specifically on the five aspects that I previously asked?
7. Is there anything that I have not asked yet but you would like to share?

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Book

Archer, Clive. *International Organizations*. 3rd edition. (London; New York: Routledge. 2001).

Jackson, Robert and Georg Sorensen. *Introduction to International Relations: Theories and Approaches* (United Kingdom: Oxford University Press, 2010).

Karns, Margaret P., Karen A. Mingst, and Kendall W. Stiles. *International Organizations: The Politics and Processes of Global Governance* (Boulder, Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2015).

Journal

Alois, Paul. "Lessons for Effective Governance: An Examination of the Better Work Program." *Global Governance; Leiden*. Vol. 24. Iss. 1. (Jan-Mar 2018): 139-157.

<https://search.proquest.com/docview/1992870724/fulltextPDF/5AA1D1AD4EC24403PQ/1?accountid=31495>.

Axelrod, Robert and Robert O. Keohane. "Achieving Cooperation under Anarchy: Strategies and Institutions." *World Politics Vol. 38*. No. 1. (Oct 1985): 249-250.
<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0043-8871%28198510%2938%3A1%3C226%3AACUASA%3E2.0.CO%3B2-A>).

- Carlson, Eric Stener. "The International Labour Organization's Innovative Approach to Ending Gender- Based Violence and Harassment: Toward a New International Framework for the World of Work." *ABA Journal of Labor & Employment Law; Chicago* Vol. 33. Iss. 2. (Winter 2018): 163-174.
<https://search.proquest.com/docview/2202113005/BE8622FFC892423FPQ/6?accountid=31495>.
- Herbert, Anne L. "Cooperation in International Relations: A Comparison of Keohane, Haas and Franck." *Berkeley Journal of International Law* Vol.14. Iss.1. (1996): 228,
<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/8bce/ecda283f5e33ac1f4d501b34bb825efc6c7f.pdf>.
- Keohane, Robert O. "International Institutions: Two Approaches." *International Studies Quarterly* Vol. 32. No. 4 (Dec 1988): 381.
- Pathak, Vibha, Bijayini Jena, and Sanjay Kalra. "Qualitative Research." *Perspectives in Clinical Research* Vol. 4. No. 3 (July 2013):192.
- Wysokińska, Zofia. "Millenium Development Goals/UN and Sustainable Development Goals/UN as Instruments for Realizing Sustainable Development Concept in the Global Economy." *Comparative Economic Research; Łódź* Vol. 20. Iss. 1. (2017): 101-118.
<https://search.proquest.com/docview/1876501474/3E3E2A9D6AE54A4CPQ/1?accountid=31495>.

Report

Afandi, Thohir. *Peluncuran Rencana Aksi Nasional Pencapaian Tujuan Pembangunan Berkelanjutan / Sustainable Development Goals*. (BAPPENAS, 2018)

Australian Government. *Australian Multilateral Assessment March 2012* (Australian Government, 2012).

Badan Pusat Statistik Indonesia, *Potret Awal Tujuan Pembangunan Berkelanjutan (Sustainable Development Goals) di Indonesia* (Badan Pusat Statistik Indonesia, 2016).

Better Work Indonesia (BWI). *Better Work Indonesia at a Glance* (Better Work Indonesia).

Better Work. *The Better Work Service Model* (BWI, 2015).

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-dhaka/documents/projectdocumentation/wcms_404161.pdf.

BWI and Swiss Confederation's State Secretariat for Economic Affairs (SECO). *Factsheet Better Work – Phase III* (BWI and SECO, 2019).

BWI. *Child Labour and Young Workers Guidelines for Employers*. (BWI, 2014).

BWI. *Discussion Paper 28: Piece rate pay and working conditions in the export garment sector* (BWI, 2018).

ILO and Kementerian Ketenagakerjaan (Kemnaker). *Guidelines for the Implementation of Employment Contracts in the Export-Oriented Garment Sector* (ILO and Kemnaker, 2019).

ILO and International Finance Corporation (IFC). *Annual Report 2017: An Industry*

and Compliance Review Indonesia (ILO and IFC, 2017).

ILO and IFC. *Better Work Indonesia: Garment Industry 5th Compliance Synthesis Report* (ILO and IFC, 2015).

ILO. *A Vision Statement by Guy Ryder – Candidate for the Post of ILO Director-General* (ILO) https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---relconf/documents/genericdocument/wcms_477719.pdf.

ILO. *Decent Work Country Profile Indonesia* (ILO, 2011).

ILO. *The ILO in Indonesia* (ILO, 2018).

Kementerian Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional/ Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional (BAPPENAS). *Metadata Indikator SDGs: Pilar Pembangunan Ekonomi*. (Bappenas, 2017).

Suter, Sonya. *Background Paper: Goals, Targets and Indicators (Independent Research Forum, 2014)*.
https://www.irforum.org/sites/default/files/publications/Retreat%20%232_Ba ckground_Paper_2_and_3_GTI_and_Criteria.pdf.

UN. *Decent Work and Economic Growth: Why it Matters* (UN).

UN. *SDG 8 Infographic* (UN).

Legal

Peraturan Presiden Republik Indonesia Nomor 59 Tahun 2017.

Peraturan Menteri Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional Republik Indonesia Nomor 7 Tahun 2018.

Interview

APINDO. Interview. November 28, 2019.

KSBSI. Interview. November 28, 2019.

Indonesian Ministry of Manpower. Interview. November 26, 2019.

Pancaprima. Interview. November 12, 2019.

Official Website

Better Work. “The Programme.” Accessed February 9, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/about-us/the-programme/>.

Better Work. “Our Approach.” Accessed February 9, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/our-work/our-approach/#1474820075302-bc399c513092>.

Better Work. “Training.” Accessed December 20, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/our-work/training/>.

BWI. “7.8. Emergency Preparedness.” Accessed November 27, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/7-8-emergency-preparedness/>.

BWI. “9.1. Industrial Relations.” Accessed November 27, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/9-1-industrial-relations/>.

BWI. “9.4. Industrial Relations Disputes.” Accessed November 27, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/9-4-industrial-relations-disputes/>.

BWI. “Better Work Indonesia: Home.” Accessed October 22, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/>.

- BWI*. “Better Work Indonesia: Our Programme.” Accessed 9 October, 2019.
<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-programme/>.
- BWI*. “Better Work Indonesia: Our Partners.” Accessed October 2, 2019.
<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-partners/>.
- BWI*. “Better Work Indonesia: Our Services.” Accessed December 20, 2019.
<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-services/>.
- BWI*. “Certified OSH Expert Training.” Accessed November 18, 2019.
<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-services/bwi-training/#1484061131673-6a15b1c0-f9a97469-ad6166d2-6a42ef32-8382>.
- BWI*. “Disability Equality Training.” Accessed November 18, 2019.
<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-services/bwi-training/#1484061290328-e625cddd-77667469-ad6166d2-6a42ef32-8382>.
- BWI*. “Factory Services.” Accessed October 9, 2019.
<https://betterwork.org/our-work/factory-services/>.
- BWI*. “Internal Auditor of OSH Management System.” Accessed November 19, 2019.
<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-services/bwi-training/#1548747970497-63b7361c-61ae>.
- BWI*. “Occupational Safety and Health Management System.” Accessed November 19, 2019. <https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-services/bwi-training/#1484061317166-4fc90a03-02767469-ad6166d2-6a42ef32-8382>.
- BWI*. “Our Publications.” Accessed November 26, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-resources/>.

BWI. “Regional Minimum Wages Regulations.” Accessed November 26, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/blog/portfolio/regional-minimum-wages-regulations/>.

BWI. “Respectful Workplace (RESPECT).” Accessed November 18, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-services/bwi-training/#1548748801458-d8771260-6996>.

BWI. “Trade Union Training.” Accessed November 19, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-services/bwi-training/#1485700073030-6a348428-be12ef32-8382>.

BWI. “Workplace Cooperation and Communication.” Accessed November 19, 2019.

<https://betterwork.org/where-we-work/indonesia/bwi-our-services/bwi-training/#1485700074552-93f6f3a3-1e61ef32-8382>.

International Labour Organization (ILO). “Decent Work.” *International Labour*

Organization (ILO). Accessed February 9, 2019.

<https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/decent-work/lang--en/index.htm>.

ILO. “About the ILO.” Accessed February 9, 2019.

<https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/lang--en/index.htm>.

ILO. “About the Office.” Accessed September 22, 2019.

<https://www.ilo.org/jakarta/aboutus/lang--en/index.htm>.

ILO. “Better Work Programme in Indonesia – stage III.” Accessed October 15, 2019.

https://www.ilo.org/jakarta/whatwedo/projects/WCMS_180290/lang--en/index.htm.

ILO. “Decent Work.” Accessed October 20, 2019.

<https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/decent-work/lang--en/index.htm>.

ILO. “Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) Indonesia.” Accessed February 19,

2019. https://www.ilo.org/jakarta/country/indonesia/WCMS_507515/lang--en/index.htm.

ILO. “History of the ILO.” Accessed September 18, 2019.

<https://libguides.ilo.org/c.php?g=657806&p=4636553>.

ILO. “How the ILO works.” Accessed September 20, 2019.

<https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/lang--en/index.htm>.

ILO. “ILO Director-General.” Accessed September 20, 2019.

<https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/how-the-ilo-works/ilo-director-general/lang--en/index.htm>.

ILO. “ILO in Indonesia.” Accessed September 22, 2019.

<https://www.ilo.org/jakarta/country/indonesia/lang--en/index.htm>.

ILO. “ILO report highlight slow progress towards SDG 8 (decent work) & calls for urgent acceleration of efforts to meet targets.” *Business & Human Rights Resource Centre*. July 18, 2019.

<https://www.business-humanrights.org/en/ilo-report-highlights-slow-progress-towards-sdg-8-decent-work-calls-for-urgent-acceleration-of-efforts-to-meet-targets>.

ILO. “Mission and impact of the ILO.” Accessed September 16, 2019.

<https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/mission-and-objectives/lang-en/index.htm>.

ILO. “Mission and Impact of the ILO.” Accessed September 21, 2019.

<https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/mission-and-objectives/lang-en/index.htm>.

International Monetary Fund (IMF), “About the ILO: the Challenges of Growth, Employment, and Social.” Accessed September 20, 2019.

<https://www.imf.org/external/NP/seminars/eng/2010/oslo/ilo.htm>.

United Nations (UN). “About the Sustainable Development Goals.” Accessed February

9, 2019. <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/>.

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). “Goal 8: Decent work and economic growth.” Accessed February 24, 2019.

<https://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/sustainable-development-goals/goal-8-decent-work-and-economic-growth.html>.

UN. “About the Sustainable Development Goals.” Accessed October 22, 2019.

<https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/>.

UN. “Funds. Programmes. Specialized Agencies and Others.” September 14, 2019.

<https://www.un.org/en/sections/about-un/funds-programmes-specialized-agencies-and-others/index.html>.

UN. “History of the UN.” Accessed September 12, 2019.

<https://www.un.org/un70/en/content/history/index.html>.

UN. "Overview of the UN." Accessed September 12, 2019.

<https://www.un.org/en/sections/about-un/overview/index.html>.

UN. "Promote inclusive and sustainable economic growth, employment and decent work for all." Accessed February 9, 2019.

<https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/economic-growth/>.

UN. "Sustainable Development Goal 8." Accessed February 9, 2019.

<https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/sdg8>.

UNDP. "The Sustainable Development Agenda." Accessed October 29, 2019.

<https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/development-agenda/>.

UN. "UN Main Bodies." Accessed September 14, 2019.

<https://www.un.org/en/sections/about-un/main-bodies/index.html>.

UNDP. "What are the Sustainable Development Goals?" Accessed October 18, 2019.

<https://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/sustainable-development-goals.html>.

Website

Iryanti, Rahma. "Indonesia Employment Policies: Problems and Challenges."

Kementerian PPN/Bappenas. February 24, 2015.

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-jakarta/documents/presentation/wcms_346598.pdf.

The Global Goals for Sustainable Development. "Decent Work and Economic

Growth.” Accessed October 8, 2019. <https://www.globalgoals.org/8-decent-work-and-economic-growth>.

Warrington, Kate. “SDG 8: Creating Decent Work and Sustainable Economic Development.” *IMPAKTER*. Accessed February 20, 2019. <https://impakter.com/sdg-8-creating-decent-work-sustainable-economic-development/>.