

Chapter 5

Conclusion

This research discusses how China addresses its environmental problems in Tianjin through the development of the Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-city (SSTEC). Unlike the traditional approach of limiting or stopping urbanization and development as an attempt to tackle environmental issues, China finds a way to address their environmental problems without wavering from its urbanization interests.

To elaborate the answer to the question of ‘how does China address its environmental challenges in Tianjin through the Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-city (SSTEC)?’, there are two main points to make. First, China cooperated with Singapore to make up for its shortcomings. The Chinese government had identified the setbacks faced by China in addressing environmental issues: lack of expertise, knowledge and funding. They perceived Singapore as the ideal actor to guide them in the road of sustainability. Singapore’s reputation and achievement in sustainable development persuaded China into choosing them for the agreement.

Second, both China and Singapore established a set of standards in the form of key performance indicators (KPIs) to ensure the SSTEC agreement was carried out effectively and addressed the environmental problems faced by China. The previous chapter elaborated which KPIs address which problems. That chapter also uses the SWOT matrix to analyze the success of the SSTEC agreement in addressing Tianjin’s environmental concerns. The SWOT analysis showed how the

SSTEC is too small in size to address all of Tianjin's environmental concerns. The standards and KPIs are only applicable to SSTEC, though some are adhering to the national standard (and some adhering to international standards), and thus, will only affect to the surrounding areas of SSTEC and not all of Tianjin.

However, since this agreement is still under development—its completion is set in 2020, it is still inconclusive whether it's effective in the long run. And while SSTEC aims to be a 'role-model' for future eco-cities, its success still remains unknown. There are doubts circulating around the success of the eco-city, from the population number that has yet to reach its target (as most of the residential units are being bought by investors for property investment instead of personal use). There is no information to indicate how the numbers are calculated. If they are based on the number of registered households sold, then it might not be accurate as the calculation will include people who purchase the living space for its land value. It's difficult to determine the population exactly, and whether the speed growth of the population is symmetrical to the numbers reported.

Therefore, while the KPIs are developed and established to exactly address the environmental problems in Tianjin and ensure sustainability to be implemented in the city, it's still inconclusive whether it's effective in the long run. Furthermore, the SWOT analysis had shown how the KPIS of SSTEC failed in addressing *all* of Tianjin's environmental concerns due to the KPIs being only applicable to SSTEC and not all of Tianjin.

Bibliography

- “A Sustainable Population for a Dynamic Singapore.” Population White Paper, January 2013. <https://www.strategygroup.gov.sg/docs/default-source/Population/population-white-paper.pdf>.
- “About SSTECC - Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City (Sstec).” Accessed September 24, 2018. http://www.tianjineco-city.com/en/SinglePage.aspx?column_id=10304.
- “Agenda 21 - China - Institutional Aspects.” Accessed March 16, 2018. <http://www.un.org/esa/agenda21/natinfo/countr/china/inst.htm>.
- Andrew Flynn, Li Yu, Peter Feindt, and Chun Chen. “Eco-Cities, Governance and Sustainable Lifestyles: The Case of the Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City,” 2015.
- Bank, The World. “Cost of Pollution in China: Economic Estimates of Physical Damages.” Environmental. Washington, D.C: The World Bank, February 2007. www.worldbank.org/eapenvironment.
- Basiago, A.D. “Economic, Social, and Environmental Sustainability in Development Theory and Urban Planning Practice.” *Kluwer Academic Publishers, The Environmentalist*, no. 19 (1999).
- Berkel, Pien van. “From Red to Green: Let a Hundred Eco-Cities Blossom (The Case of Tianjin Eco-City).” Universiteit Utrecht, 2016. <https://dspace.library.uu.nl/bitstream/handle/1874/330488/final%20version%20thesis%20Tianjin%20Eco-city%20%28Pien%2C%20Bacchus%20and%20Anne%20Lotte%29.pdf?sequence=2&isAllowed=y>.
- Bureau, Tianjin Environmental Protection. “A General Survey of Tianjin City’s Environmental Quality.” Tianjin Municipal Government, 1989.
- . “Environmental Protection of Tianjin.” Tianjin Municipal Government, 1991.
- Cao, Shixiong. “Impact of China’s Large-Scale Ecological Restoration Program on the Environment and Society in Arid and Semiarid Areas of China: Achievements, Problems, Synthesis, and Applications.” *Taylor & Francis, Critical Reviews in Environmental Science and Technology*, 35, no. 5 (2011): 317–35.
- Caprotti, Federico. “Critical Research on Eco-Cities? A Walk through the Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City, China,” *Cities*, 36 (2014): 10–17.
- Caprotti, Federico, Cecilia Springer, and Nichola Harmer. “‘Eco’ For Whom? Envisioning Eco-Urbanism in the Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City, China.” *Urban Research Publications Limited, International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 2015.
- “Chapter 1: Overviews of Environmental Issues and Environmental Conservation Measures in China,” n.d. https://www.env.go.jp/earth/coop/oemjc/china/e/china_e_1.pdf.

- “China Opens Office Here.” Accessed September 18, 2018. eresources.nlb.gov.sg/newspapers/Digitised/Article/straitstimes19810706-1.2.107.1.4.
- “China Suffers Severe Acid Rain Contamination -- China.org.cn.” Accessed November 19, 2018. <http://www.china.org.cn/english/environment/182071.htm>.
- “China’s Environmental Crisis.” Council on Foreign Relations. Accessed March 3, 2018. <https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/chinas-environmental-crisis>.
- “China’s Twelfth Five Year Plan (2011-2015) - the Full English Version.” China Direct. Accessed September 19, 2018. http://cbi.typepad.com/china_direct/2011/05/chinas-twelfth-five-new-plan-the-full-english-version.html.
- “Clean Air Act of 1971 | Infopedia.” Accessed September 26, 2018. http://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/infopedia/articles/SIP_2014-04-07_110024.html.
- Cresswell, John W. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches*. 2nd ed. Sage Publications Inc., 2003.
- Darel E. Paul. *Liberal Perspectives on the Global Political Economy*. Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Dixon, John A., and Louise A. Fallon. “The Concept of Sustainability: Origins, Extensions and Usefulness for Policy.” 1989, n.d.
- “Eco Vision - Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City (Sstec).” Accessed September 24, 2018. http://www.tianjineco-city.com/en/SinglePage.aspx?column_id=10316.
- Federico Caprotti, and Ziyue Gong. “Social Sustainability and Residents’ Experiences in a New Chinese Eco-City: SSTECS,” 2016.
- Geroe, S.J.W. “The Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City: A Case Study of Chinese Experimental Regulatory and Institutional Development.” *Sustainable Development Planning* 12, no. 6 (2017).
- Glasbergen, Pieter. “Understanding Partnerships for Sustainable Development Analytically: The Ladder of Partnership Activity as a Methodological Tool.” *Wiley Online Library, Environmental Policy and Governance*, 21, no. 1 (2010): 1–13.
- “Global Environment Facility Grant Agreement (Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City Project) between People’s Republic of China and International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (Acting as an Implementing Agency of the Global Environment Facility),” September 25, 2010. <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/921331468028859374/pdf/GEF0Grant0Agreement.pdf>.
- Herbert, Anne L. “Cooperation in International Relations: A Comparison of Keohane, Haas and Franck” 14, no. 1 (1996). <http://scholarship.law.berkeley.edu/bjil/vol14/iss1/5>.
- Jenna Allen, Yiran Lu, and Simon Paroutzoglou. “Tianjin Eco-City: Another Green Ghost Town?” *Johns Hopkins School of Advanced International Studies*, May 2015.

- Jie Chen. "Rapid Urbanization in China: A Real Challenge to Soil Protection and Food Security." *Catena* 69, no. 1 (2007): 1–15.
- John W. Creswell. *Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. 2nd ed. California: Sage Publications Inc., 2007.
- Joss, Simon. "Eco-Cities - A Global Survey 2009." *WIT Transactions on Ecology and the Environment*, 2010, 239–50.
- Joss, Simon, and Arthur P. Molella. "The Eco-City as Urban Technology: Perspectives on Caofeidian International Eco-City (China)," *Journal of Urban Technology*, 20, no. 1: Eco-Cities in Pan-Asia (2013).
- Kaiman, Jonathan. "China's 'Eco-Cities': Empty of Hospitals, Shopping Centres and People." *The Guardian*, April 14, 2014, sec. Cities. <https://www.theguardian.com/cities/2014/apr/14/china-tianjin-eco-city-empty-hospitals-people>.
- Keohane, Robert O. *After Hegemony: Cooperation and Discord in the World Political Economy*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1984.
- Lee, Dave. "Tianjin in Profile." *BBC News*, August 13, 2015, sec. Business. <http://www.bbc.com/news/business-33900741>.
- Leitmann, Josef. "Tianjin." *Urban Environmental Profile*, *Cities*, 5, no. 11 (1994): 297–302.
- . "Tianjin: Towards an Improved Urban Environment," *The Urban Age*, 1, no. 1 (1992).
- "Location - Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City (Sstec)." Accessed March 19, 2018. http://www.tianjineco-city.com/en/SinglePage.aspx?column_id=10315.
- Mila Helena. "Kerjasama Ekonomi Bidang Investasi Singapura - RRC Dalam Membangun Township Di Suzhou, RRC (1993-1996)." Universitas Katolik Parahyangan, 1998.
- . "RRC-Singapore Economic Cooperation in Investment of Township Development in Suzhou (1993-1996)." Universitas Katolik Parahyangan, 1998.
- Nancy B. Grimm, Stanley H. Faeth, Nancy E. Golubiewski, Charles L. Redman, Jianguo Wu, Xuemei Bai, and John M. Briggs. "Global Change and the Ecology of Cities," *Science*, 319, no. 1 (March 2008): 756–60.
- National Bureau of Statistics (NBS). "Tianjin Statistic Yearbook 2013." China Statistics Press, 2013.
- Pow, Choon Piew, and Harvey Neo. "Seeing Red over Green: Contesting Urban Sustainabilities in China," *Urban Studies*, 50 (2013): 2256–74.
- Remi Curien. "Singapore, A Model for (Sustainable?) Urban Development in China: An Overview of 20 Years of Sino-Singaporean Corporation." *China Perspectives*, January 2017.
- Richardson, Michael, and International Herald Tribune. "Singapore Industrial Park Flounders : A Deal Sours in China." *The New York Times*, October 1, 1999, sec. International Business. <https://www.nytimes.com/1999/10/01/business/worldbusiness/singapore-industrial-park-flounders-a-deal-sours-in.html>.
- Robert Gilpin. *The Political Economy of International Relations*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1987.

- Roseland, Mark. "Dimensions of the Eco-City." *Elsevier Science, Cities*, 14, no. 4 (1997): 197–202.
- Shepard, Wade. "No Joke: China Is Building 285 Eco-Cities, Here's Why." *Forbes*. Accessed March 16, 2018. <https://www.forbes.com/sites/wadeshepard/2017/09/01/no-joke-china-is-building-285-eco-cities-heres-why/>.
- Shiuh-Shen, Chien. "Chinese Eco-Cities: A Perspective of Land-Speculation-Oriented Local Entrepreneurialism," *China Information*, 27 (2013): 173–96.
- Siitonen, Lauri. "Political Theories of Development Cooperation - A Study of Theories of International Cooperation." Finland: University of Helsinki, May 1990.
- Simeon, Louise Maureen. "China Lifts Import Ban on Philippine Bananas." *philstar.com*. Accessed November 29, 2016. <http://www.philstar.com/business/2016/10/07/1630958/china-lifts-import-ban-philippine-bananas>.
- "Singapore Establishes Formal Diplomatic Relations with China - Singapore History." Accessed September 18, 2018. <http://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/history/events/4181dd20-df08-4ff5-8d93-620350b639fd>.
- "Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City | Infopedia." Accessed September 24, 2018. http://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/infopedia/articles/SIP_2015-02-17_103920.html.
- Strange, Tracey, and Anna Bayley. *Sustainable Development: Linking Economy, Society, Environment*. OECD Insights, 2008. http://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/environment/sustainable-development_9789264055742-en.
- "Sustain | Define Sustain at Dictionary.com." Accessed March 16, 2018. <http://www.dictionary.com/browse/sustain>.
- "Sustainable Singapore Blueprint," 2015. <https://www.mewr.gov.sg/docs/default-source/module/ssb-publications/41f1d882-73f6-4a4a-964b-6c67091a0fe2.pdf>.
- The World Bank. "Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City: Case Study of an Emerging City in China." Technical Assistance (TA) Report. The World Bank, November 2009.
- "Tianjin Binhai New Area Sees Fast Economic Growth." Accessed November 20, 2018. <http://www.china.org.cn/english/2002/Nov/48896.htm>.
- "Tianjin, Tianjin Information, Tianjin China City Information-Tianjin." Accessed March 16, 2018. <http://www.chinatoday.com/city/tianjin.htm>.
- Tiara A.D. Sapan. "The Effectiveness of China's cooperation with Singapore in Suzhou Industrial Park Era 1994-2004 as Part of China's Open-Door Policy in Chinese Modernization." Universitas Katolik Parahyangan, 2014.
- Tiara Ayu Dwiwardhani Sapan. "Efektivitas Hubungan Kerja Sama Singapura Dan Cina Dalam Suzhou Industrial Park Tahun 1994-2004 Sebagai Bagian Dari Kebijakan Chinese Open-Door Policy Untuk Modernisasi Cina." Universitas Katolik Parahyangan, 2014.

- “Tree Planting Day | Infopedia.” Accessed September 26, 2018. http://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/infopedia/articles/SIP_565_2004-12-29.html.
- “UNdata | Record View | Life Expectancy at Birth, Total (Years).” Accessed March 3, 2018. http://data.un.org/Data.aspx?d=WDI&f=Indicator_Code%3ASP.DYN.LE00.IN.
- US EPA, OA. “Global Greenhouse Gas Emissions Data.” Overviews and Factsheets. US EPA, January 12, 2016. <https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/global-greenhouse-gas-emissions-data>.
- . “Sources of Greenhouse Gas Emissions.” Overviews and Factsheets. US EPA, December 29, 2015. <https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/sources-greenhouse-gas-emissions>.
- “Water and Energy Sustainability.” United Nations, n.d. http://www.un.org/waterforlifedecade/pdf/01_2014_sustainability_eng.pdf.
- Wen, Kui, and Erjuan Zhu. *Report on Development of Beijing, Tianjin and Hebei Province (2013): Measurement of Carrying Capacity and Countermeasures*. Springer, n.d.
- “What Is Green Building? | World Green Building Council.” Accessed September 21, 2018. <http://www.worldgbc.org/what-green-building>.
- “White Paper on Environmental Protection Published -- China.org.cn.” Accessed November 19, 2018. <http://www.china.org.cn/english/2006/Jun/170355.htm>.
- Wilmoth, David, and Dean Forbes. “Opportunities for Urban Planning in Tianjin, China,” *Australian Planner*, 26, no. 4 (1988): 19–33.
- Winston T.H. KOH. “Singapore’s Transition to Innovation-Based Economic Growth: Infrastructure, Institutions and Government’s Role.” *R&D Management*, Research Collection School of Economics, 36, no. 2 (2006): 143–60.
- World Commission on Environment and Development. “Report of the World Commission on Environment and Development: Our Common Future.” Oxford University Press, n.d.
- Yun, Liu. “Urban Growth in Tianjin, 1993-2003.” International Institute for Geo-Information Science and Earth Observation, 2004. https://webapps.itc.utwente.nl/librarywww/papers_2004/msc/upla/liu_yun.pdf.
- Zhan, Changjie, and Martin de Jong. “Financing Sino-Singapore Tianjin Eco-City: What Lessons Can Be Drawn for Other Large-Scale Sustainable City-Projects?” *MDPI*, Sustainability, February 1, 2017.
- Zhu, Hongqing, Xiaoling Ge, Yang Wang, and Zequn Ding. “Analysis and Forecast of Tianjin’s Industrial Energy Consumption.” *Emerald Publishing*, International Journal of Energy Sector Management, 11, no. 1 (2017).

Appendix