

BAB IV

KESIMPULAN

Kemiskinan adalah salah satu alasan utama yang menjerumuskan banyak warga negara India ke dalam lingkaran perdagangan manusia. Untuk menyelesaikan permasalahan perdagangan manusia, tentunya diperlukan tindakan secara menyeluruh baik mengentaskan kemiskinan sebagai faktor utama maupun menciptakan kebijakan dan peraturan ketat yang dapat menghalangi terjadinya *human trafficking*.

Trafficking meski tidak dilaporkan, sebenarnya terjadi dimana-mana. Kondisinya bahkan semakin parah apabila terjadi di daerah rural. Kurangnya kontrol pemerintah terhadap wilayah batas negara juga turut mempermudah terjadinya perdagangan ilegal ini.

Sementara faktor penarik tampaknya menjadi penyebab utama perdagangan manusia, faktor pendorong sebenarnya jauh lebih berpengaruh. Masyarakat yang terbelakang secara ekonomi tentu merasakan lebih banyak tekanan dan kesusahan dalam hidupnya. Ditambah dengan musim tekanan ekonomi akut seperti kekeringan, banjir, kekurangan pangan, dan lain-lain. Krisis utang akibat perampasan ekonomi serta jatuhnya sistem jaminan sosial telah mendorong migrasi, yang akhirnya juga berkontribusi terhadap perdagangan manusia.

Sambil mengeksplorasi hubungan antara migrasi dan perdagangan manusia, muncul bahwa pembatasan migrasi perempuan yang dilakukan oleh Nepal, ditambah dengan kurangnya tindakan perlindungan meningkatkan kerentanan mereka terhadap perdagangan manusia. Migrasi yang aman, pencegahan trafficking dan penahanan HIV / AIDS sangat penting bagi pembangunan kawasan Asia

selatan. Ini adalah parameter yang memiliki kaitan langsung dengan keamanan publik dan, oleh karena itu, pada keamanan nasional. Strategi anti perdagangan perlu mengenali hak masyarakat untuk bergerak dengan pilihan yang tepat.

Keseriusan pemerintah India terlihat melalui penyusunan berbagai kebijakan dan perundang-undangan yang bertujuan untuk melindungi korban serta mempersempit ruang gerak pelaku perdagangan manusia dan memberikan hukuman seberat-beratnya. Selain itu, dibentuk pula berbagai program untuk mengentaskan kemiskinan seperti penambahan jumlah lapangan kerja, bantuan tunai dan dana pensiun, program dalam rangka melindungi perempuan dan menambah keahlian kerja untuk masyarakat pedesaan, perbaikan dan penambahan fasilitas penting di pedesaan dan berbagai kerjasama dengan negara lain dalam menjaga perbatasan dan meregulasi perpindahan penduduk antaregara. Selain itu, untuk memberantas perdagangan manusia sampai tuntas dibutuhkan keterlibatan dari seluruh unsur negara untuk saling mengawasi.

LAMPIRAN

The Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act, 1956: An Overview

In India, the legal regime on sex work in India is laid down under the **Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act, 1956** ("ITPA"). ITPA does not proscribe sex work *per se* but penalises specific activities related to commercial sex. It also provides for rescue & rehabilitation of persons in sex work. The Act is implemented through Police & the Magistracy. Acts punishable under ITPA include:

- **Brothel keeping** (Section 3)
- **Living on earnings of sex work** (Section 4)
- **Procuring, inducing or detaining for prostitution** (Section 5 & 6) Penalties are higher where offences involve children (<16 yrs) & minors (< 18 yrs)
- **Prostitution in areas notified by Police & near public places** (Section 7)
- **Soliciting** (Section 8)

All offences are cognizable i.e. Police do not require a warrant to arrest or search. (Section 14)

Police personnel entrusted with the implementation of the Act locally (**Special Police Officers**) as well as at the national level (**Trafficking Police Officers**) are accorded **special powers** (Section 13) to **raid, rescue & search** premises suspected of serving as brothels (Section 15). Magistrates are authorized to **order arrests & removal, direct custody of rescued persons, close down brothels & evict sex workers** (Sections 16, 17, 18 & 20). The Act provides **institutional rehabilitation** for 'rescued' sex workers. (Sections 19, 21, 23 & ITPA State Rules)

Implications

- Sex work *per se* is not illegal under the Act, but its *de facto* criminalization through prohibition of soliciting, brothel & street work, has effectively undermined sex workers' ability to claim protection of law
- Absence of safeguards has intensified violence & exploitation by brokers, agents & the mafia.
- Punitive provisions are inimical to public health interventions to reduce HIV.
- Fear of arrest, infringement by Police makes negotiation of safer sex difficult
- Peer educators carrying condoms are apprehended for 'promoting sex work'
- Attempts to promote condom use in brothels have been aborted.
- Disempowerment of sex workers increases harms of HIV & Trafficking

Specific Problems

I. Prohibition of Brothels: Section 2(a) defines 'brothel' as "any house, room, conveyance or place or any portion of any house, room, conveyance or place which is used for purposes of sexual exploitation or abuse for the gain of another person or for the mutual gain of two or more prostitutes." Section 3 provides punishment for keeping, running & managing a brothel. The term "mutual gain of two or more sex workers", renders premises shared by sex workers illegal, including their residence. There have been several instances where sex workers have lost their homes & earnings under the guise of 'closing down brothels'. As long as brothels remain illegal, universal condom use cannot be achieved.

II. Criminalisation of Earnings of Sex Work: Section 4 punishes adult persons being economically supported by sex workers including those living with sex workers. Therefore, aged parents, siblings, partner(s), children over 18 yrs, who are dependent on sex workers are treated as criminals. In reality, a significant majority of persons, particularly women, turn to sex work to support their families including children & parents. Ironically, these very persons are punishable by law.

III. Penalties for Soliciting: Section 8 punishes a sex worker drawing attention of potential customers from a visible, conspicuous site, whether in a street or private dwelling. The criminalisation of soliciting is one of the most obvious legal problems for sex workers, who are faced with arrests, court hearings & convictions on a routine basis. Sex workers are arrested even when they're not soliciting. Most plead guilty finding themselves in a vicious cycle of criminalization. Though this provision does nothing to prevent or abate trafficking, it is 'most-used', with maximum arrests & convictions being reported under Section 8, ITPA.

IV. Statutory Powers & Procedures: ITPA confers wide powers on Police to conduct & Magistrates to order:

- **Raid**
Police can enter and search any premises on suspicion. Raids are often carried out in breach of statutory procedure for public witness, female Police etc. Violence, abuse & humiliation of sex workers is common. Raids impair sex workers' ability & result in increased harm.
- **Medical examination**
Section 15 (5A) mandates medical examination of persons removed from brothels for, *inter alia* detection of sexually transmitted diseases. Sex workers are reportedly forcibly tested for HIV & their results disclosed in open Court. This is contrary to national policy, which requires consent, confidentiality & counselling for HIV Testing.
- **Rescue & Rehabilitation**
Police can remove any person found in premises where sex work is carried out regardless of age & consent. Rehabilitation is synonymous with detention in State run homes for indefinite periods. Viable economic alternatives are either non-existent or unavailable to sex workers on account of stigma.
- **Expulsion of sex workers**
Sections 18 & 20 authorize Magistrates to close down brothels & expel persons from premises where sex work is being carried out, including their residence. Threatened with eviction, sex workers are forced to relocate with no access to health & HIV services.

Over the last 50 years, ITPA has failed to prevent & intercept trafficking. On the contrary, it has become a source of repression for sex workers, who face routine harassment & repeated arrests. **The Act is an abject failure & requires a complete overhaul.**



DAFTAR PUSTAKA

8 Reasons Why India Is so Poor”, <https://soapboxie.com/social-issues/Reasons-Why-India-is-So-Poor>, diakses pada 6 Desember 2017

Ajaz, Taufeeq, *The Reality of India's Rising GDP Numbers*, <http://thewire.in/22519/the-reality-of-indias-rising-gdp-numbers/> Diakses pada 15 Oktober 2016

Annual Report, Ministry of Rural Development 2012-13 http://www.nird.org.in/NIRD_Docs/cwepa040912.pdf diakses pada 11 Juni 2017

Awareness and education are key to beating human trafficking, <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/frontpage/2011/February/awareness-and-education-are-key-to-beating-human-trafficking.html> diakses pada 11 November 2017

B. R. Tomlinson, *The Economy of Modern India, 1860–1970* (1996)

Causes of Child Trafficking in India”, <https://www.savethechildren.in/articles/causes-of-child-trafficking-in-india> diakses pada 8 November 2017

Central Government Act, Article 23 in *The Constitution Of India 1949*”, <https://indiankanoon.org/doc/1071750/>, diakses pada 10 November 2017

Child Marriage in India (An Analysis of Available data) 2012”, <http://www.unicef.in/documents/childmarriage.pdf> diakses pada 3 Juni 2017

Childline India Foundation, *Child Protection & Child Rights*, <http://www.childlineindia.org.in/child-trafficking-india.htm>, Diakses pada 15 Oktober 2016

Community Participation in Border Management: Challenges and Options, https://idsa.in/system/files/jds_3_3_osjha.pdf

Cooperation to Combat Cross Border Trafficking: India-Nepal-Bangladesh, <http://wiscomp.org/Publications/38%20-%20Perspectives%2031%20-%20Cooperation%20to%20Combat%20Cross%20Border%20Trafficking%20India-Nepal-Bangladesh.pdf>

Dalby, S., (1992), “*Security, Modernity, Ecology : The Dilemmas of Post Cold War Security Discourse*”, *Alternatives* Vol. 17

Dunne, Tim & Schmidt, Brian C., 2001. *Realism*. In: Baylis, John & Smith, Steve, eds. *The Globalization of World Politics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press,

pp.141-155, dari *TEORI DAN PERSPEKTIF REALISME DALAM HUBUNGAN INTERNASIONAL* (week 2), [http://luqman-saputro-fisip13.web.unair.ac.id/artikel_detail-94233-SOH201-TEORI%20DAN%20PERSPEKTIF%20REALISME%20%20DALAM%20HUBUNGAN%20INTERNASIONAL%20\(week%202\).html](http://luqman-saputro-fisip13.web.unair.ac.id/artikel_detail-94233-SOH201-TEORI%20DAN%20PERSPEKTIF%20REALISME%20%20DALAM%20HUBUNGAN%20INTERNASIONAL%20(week%202).html)

Dougherty, James E. & Robert L. Pfaltzgraff. 1997. *Contending Theories*. New York : Harper and Row Publisher.

Encyclopedia Britannica, <https://www.britannica.com/place/India>, diakses pada tanggal 17 Mei 2017

Elizabeth Ivana Yuko Theories, 2009, *United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime*

Fiotti, Paul R, Sauppi, Mark F, *International Relations Theory: Realism, Pluralism, Globalism*, 1990, Macmillan Publishing Company, a division of Macmillan Inc

Five Years Plans in India, <http://vle.du.ac.in/mod/book/view.php?id=12068&chapterid=24300>

Human Trafficking in India, <http://borgenproject.org/human-trafficking-india/>, Diakses pada 16 Oktober 2016

Human trafficking In India: An analysis, <http://www.allresearchjournal.com/archives/2016/vol2issue6/PartC/2-6-41-698.pdf>

Human Trafficking the Fact”, Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking, 2008, 1-2.

HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN SOUTHEAST ASIA: CAUSES AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS, <http://www.dtic.mil/dtic/tr/fulltext/u2/a501444.pdf>

Human trafficking a serious organised crime: CBI chief, TIMES OF INDIA, May 12, 2009, available at: http://articles.timesofindia.indiatimes.com/2009-05-12/india/28164967_1_human-trafficking-dance-barsprostitution

Husaini Usman dan Purnomo Akbar, *Metode Penelitian Sosial* (PT. Bumi Aksara)

How many cities, towns, and villages are there in India? <https://www.quora.com/How-many-cities-towns-and-villages-are-there-in-India>

India's Border Management", Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses New Delhi https://idsa.in/system/files/book/book_IndiasBorderManagement.pdf, diakses pada 3 Juli 2017

India ranks fourth in global slavery survey", <http://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-nation/india-ranks-fourth-in-global-slavery-survey/articleshow/52528778.cms> diakses pada 18 Mei 2017

India ratifies the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime (UNTOC) and deposits its three Protocols with the United Nations Secretary General.", <http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/home/India-ratifies-the-United-Nations-Convention-against-Transnational-Organised-Crime-UNTOC-and-deposits-its-three-Protocols-with-the-United-Nations-Secretary-General-/articleshow/8684145.cms>

INDIA TOPS GLOBAL SLAVERY INDEX WITH OVER 14 MILLION PEOPLE ENSLAVED, <http://www.newsweek.com/india-tops-global-slavery-index-over-14-million-people-enslaved-284950>

Indicators of Poverty & Hunger", http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unyin/documents/ydiDavidGordon_poverty.pdf diakses pada 17 Mei 2017

Index of Economy Freedom: India, <http://www.heritage.org/index/country/india>

Jan Dhan Yojana – An Era Of Financial Inclusion Begins", <https://www.mapsofindia.com/my-india/business/pm-jan-dhan-yojana-an-era-of-financial-inclusion>, diakses pada 30 November

J. A. Scholte, *The Globalization of World Politics*. in J. Baylis & S. Smith, *The Globalization of World Politics* (Oxford University Press)

Jeffrey D. Sachs, *The End of Poverty*

Jujun S. Suriasumantri, *Filsafat Ilmu: Sebuah Pengantar Populer* (Pustaka Sinar Harapan, Jakarta, 1984)

John W. Creswell, *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches 4th Edition* (California: Sage Publications, 2014)

Journal of Pakistan Medical Association, http://www.jpma.org.pk/full_article_text.php?article_id=3618, diakses pada 8 November 2017
Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI), <https://kbbi.web.id/upaya>, diakses pada 2 September 2017

Koledziej, Edward A. 2007. 'Testing security theories: explaining the rise and the demise of the Cold War', dalam *Security and the International Relations*,

Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 127-259, dari *Pendekatan dalam Keamanan dan Perdamaian: Realisme, Liberalisme, dan Konstruktivisme*
[http://tara-wardhani-fisip14.web.unair.ac.id/artikel_detail-170455-SOH302%20\(Politik%20dan%20Keamanan%20Internasional\)-Pendekatan%20dalam%20Keamanan%20dan%20Perdamaian:%20Realisme,%20Liberalisme,%20dan%20Konstruktivisme.html](http://tara-wardhani-fisip14.web.unair.ac.id/artikel_detail-170455-SOH302%20(Politik%20dan%20Keamanan%20Internasional)-Pendekatan%20dalam%20Keamanan%20dan%20Perdamaian:%20Realisme,%20Liberalisme,%20dan%20Konstruktivisme.html)

Kaur, Ramandeep, *Why India is Still a Poor Country?*
<http://www.mapsofindia.com/my-india/society/why-india-is-still-a-poor-nation>,
Diakses pada 15 Oktober 2016

Logan Walker & Hunt, 2009, seperti tertulis di “A Comparative Study of Child Trafficking in India and the United States” hal.131,
<file:///C:/Users/user/Downloads/48-145-1-PB.pdf>, diakses pada 9 November 2017

Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme,
<http://www.socialprotection.org/gimi/gess/RessourcePDF.action?ressource.ressourceId=53846>

M. Barnett & K. Sikkink, (2008), *From International Relations to Global Society*, in C. Reus-Smit & D. Snidal, *The Oxford Handbook of International Relations* (Oxford University Press)

Ministry of External Affairs Government of India”,
<http://www.mea.gov.in/human-trafficking.htm> diakses pada 2 Juni 2017

Mohammad Rosyid, *Metodologi Penelitian Hubungan Internasional*

National Crime Records Bureau data, 2015: Slight dip in rape, crime against women, <http://indianexpress.com/article/explained/national-crime-records-bureau-data-2015-slight-dip-in-rape-crime-against-women-3004980/>

Nizmi, Yuznarida, *Regionalisme dan Globalisme: kajian tematik: (perdagangan orang di berbagai belahan dunia)*, Pusat Pengembangan Pendidikan Universitas Riau: Pekanbaru

Parents Selling Their Own Children,
<https://www.modernghana.com/news/111976/1/parents-selling-their-own-children.html> diakses pada 8 November 2017

Penjajahan India”, http://www.academia.edu/4120187/Penjajahan_India

Performance of Indian Economy during 1970-2010: A Productivity Perspective”,
https://editorialexpress.com/cgi-bin/conference/download.cgi?db_name=FEMES12&paper_id=481

Philips Jusario V. (2002). *Transnational Organized Crime : Isu dan Permasalahannya* Dalam analisis CSIS Isu-isu non-tradisional : Bentuk Baru Ancaman Keamanan

Pradhan Mantri Jan Dhan Yojana (PMJDY)", <https://www.pmjdy.gov.in/about> diakses pada 30 November 2017

Rajeev Dhavan, "India's Refugee Law and Policy", http://www.refugeelawreader.org/1184/Refugee_Law_and_Policy_in_India.pdf diakses pada 12 Juni 2017

Shamim I. State of Trafficking in Women and Children and their Sexual Exploitation in Bangladesh. Dhaka: Centre for Women and Children Studies", (CWCS), 2010. 7. "TIP Protocol Ratified status. UN.

Smith S. & J. Baylis (2001). Introduction. In Smith S. & J. Baylis, *The Globalization of World Politics* (Oxford University Press)

Social Inequality Threatening India's Economic Stability", <https://www.fastcompany.com/659400/social-inequality-threatening-indias-economic-stability> diakses pada 6 Desember 2017

Sur, Priyali, <http://www.womenundersiegeproject.org/blog/entry/silent-slaves-stories-of-human-trafficking-in-india>, Diakses pada 16 Oktober 2016

The developmental challenge in rural India", <http://www.thehindu.com/todays-paper/tp-opinion/The-developmental-challenge-in-rural-India/article14744156.ece>, diakses pada 10 November 2017

The Global Slavery Index 2016, <https://www.globalslaveryindex.org/findings/>

The richest 1% of Indians now own 58.4% of wealth", <http://www.livemint.com/Money/MML9OZRwaACyEhLzUNImnO/The-richest-1-of-Indians-now-own-584-of-wealth.html> diakses pada 6 Desember 2017

The State of Economic Freedom in India, <https://object.cato.org/economic-freedom-india/Chapter1.pdf>

The World Bank, Executive Summary in *Perspectives on Poverty in India: Stylized Facts from Survey Data*, 2011

The World Factbook, Central Intelligence Agency, <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/fields/2051.html#in>, diakses pada tanggal 13 Mei 2017

Trafficking in women and children in India: nature, dimensions and strategies for prevention,

http://www.academia.edu/4343319/Trafficking_in_women_and_children_in_India_nature_dimensions_and_strategies_for_prevention

UNODC report on human trafficking exposes modern form of slavery, <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/global-report-on-trafficking-in-persons.html> diakses pada 17 Mei 2017

Vinay Bahl, "The Emergence of Large-Scale Steel Industry in India Under British Colonial Rule, 1880–1907," *Indian Economic and Social History Review*, (Oct 1994) 31#4 pp 413–460

What is Transnationalism?", <http://internationalrelations.org/transnationalism/>, diakses pada 10 November 2017

Why does India have so much poverty? <https://www.quora.com/Why-does-India-have-so-much-poverty>

Woman Trafficking in India, an Anthropological View, file:///C:/Users/user/Downloads/Women_Trafficking_In_India_An_Anthropological_View.pdf

Yanuar Ikbar, *Ekonomi Politik Internasional Konsep dan Teori (1)* (PT Refika Aditama, Bandung) 2006