

## CHAPTER VI

### CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

#### 6.1 Conclusion

Based on what has been found by the researcher there are 35 ICT systems, 31 websites and 4 apps. These actions are all provided by 19 public organizations starting from national, province, and city level. This research questioned on how ICT as the panopticon vision enable transparency, accountability, and participation in Indonesia. Therefore, this research resulted that the use of ICTs by Indonesian Government has enabled transparency, accountability, and participation. It was because each indicator of transparency, accountability, and participation has been enabled by ICT systems that were identified in this research.

From transparency aspect, the researcher has found one indicator that has been provided only by one public institution, that was KPK. The indicator stands to identify all elected officials and civil servants who are under investigation for corruption and fraudulent activities. Based on the Inpres Number 7 of 2015, Indonesia Government has other 2 institutions that are supposed to be implementing this identification action, these institutions are Indonesian National Police (POLRI) and The Attorney General of Indonesia General of Indonesia. In fact, they did not provide what has been required as in the Inpres Number 7 of 2015. So, this has to be a reminder for those 2 institutions to work on what has been instructed in the Inpres. However, in general, transparency aspect has been enabled by the ICT systems in this research.

Meanwhile, for the accountability aspect, most of the actions in this research have attained to provide social media accounts. This means Indonesian Government has been doing a good work since it relates with the data that has been shown in the Chapter 1. Today, social media users have been becoming so massive even more than 50 percent of population in Indonesia are active social media users.<sup>200</sup> It was the same with participation aspect, the actions were relatively turned out successfully enabled by Indonesian Government. There was no an extreme gap between the enablement and disablement of each indicator either for accountability or participation.

This research also identified there were 13 websites; 3 unidentified and 10 unavailable. The unidentified ones mean that their operations indeed were not openly worked on the internet, but more like intern organization programs. Furthermore, the unavailable websites reflect ones that were supposed to be available publicly on the internet based on the Inpres, but it turned out otherwise.

Another important finding in this research was as if Heeks has been explained that ICT as panopticon vision could create new corruption opportunities.<sup>201</sup> Then, in this research also has found out three case examples of corruption which happened because of the use of ICT. So that even though the use of ICTs could help the Government fight corruption, but then the Indonesian Government also must cautious and aware of the new corruption modes.

---

<sup>200</sup> Hootsuite, 2019. Op.cit. Available at: <https://andi.link/hootsuite-we-are-social-indonesian-digital-report-2019/>.

<sup>201</sup> Heeks. 1999. op.cit., 186-187.

## **6.2 Recommendation**

Based on the findings in this research that there were 10 websites that were supposed to be provided, but in fact those were unavailable on the internet. Therefore, it is recommended that the Government of Indonesia continues to work on those 10 unavailable websites and more importantly, to be cautious and aware of the new corruption modes. So that, what Indonesian Government has been achieved in using ICT could be more improved, then it also could be eventually help fight corruption.

It is recommended for further research, since this research has relied on secondary data, then it has only succeeded to show the trend on how the use of ICTs by Indonesian Government can enable transparency, accountability, and participation. However, there should be other research that could give an evidence in a more detail way. It is hoped the research could explain on how each ICT system could really create changes either in the transparency, accountability, or participation. There also should be a clearer measurement that can measure the changes in transparency, accountability, and participation before and after using ICT. Then how these 3 aspects eradicate corruption.

## References

### Book

- Bekkers, Victor, and Hein van Duivenboden: Marcel Thaens. 2006. "Public Innovation and Information and Communication Technology." In *Information and Communication Technology and Public Innovation*, by Victor Bekkers and Hein van Duivenboden: Marcel Thaens, 1-243. Amsterdam: IOS Press.
- CDT, and InfoDev. 2002. *THE E-GOVERNMENT HANDBOOK FOR COUNTRIES*. Washington, D.C.: THE WORLD BANK.
- Cresswell, John W. 2014. *Research Design*. Los Angeles: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Gray, David E. 2014. *Doing Research in The Real World*. London: SAGE Publication Ltd.
- OECD. 2011. "Austria." In *the Call for Innovative and Open Government: An overview of country initiatives*, by OECD, 39. OECD Publications.
- O'leary, Zina. 2017. *The Essential Guide to Doing Your Research Project*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Purian, Ronit, Niv Ahituv, and Phillip Ein-Dor. 2012. "A New Model for Transparency and E-Participation: Who Transforms What Policy into Whose Practice?" In *Public Sector Reform Using Information Technologies: Transforming Policy into Practice*, by Thanos Papadopoulos. Penagiotis Kanellis, 193. Derry: IGI Global.
- Stylios, George, Dimitris Christodoulakis, Jeries Besharat, Maria-Alexandra Vonitsanou, Ioannis Kotrotsos, Athanasia Koumpouri, and Sofia Stamou. 2012. "Data Mining Applications in the Service of E-Government." In *Public Sector Reform Using Information Technologies: Transforming Policy into Practice*, by Thanos Papadopoulos and Panagiotis Kanellis, 1-466. Hershey: IGI Global.

Yin, Robert K. 2011. *Qualitative Research from start to finish*. London: The Guilford Press.

### **Journal Article**

Alcaide-Muñoz, Laura, Antonio M. López Hernández, and Carmen Caba-Pérez. 2014. "Public Managers' Perceptions of e-Government Efficiency: A Case Study of Andalusian Municipalities." *Public Administration and Information Technology* (Springer Science+Business Media) 137.

Anechiarico, Frank, and James B. Jacobs. 1995. "Panopticism and financial controls." *Crime, Law & Social Change* (Kluwer Academic Publishers): 361-379.

Anechiarico, Frank, and James B. Jacobs. 1994. "Visions of Corruption Control and the Evolution of American Public Administration." *Public Administration Review*, Vol. 54, No. 5 (Wiley & American Society for Public Administration) 465-473.

Bannister, Frank, and Regina Connolly. 2014. "ICT, public values and transformative government: A framework and programme for research." *Government Information Quarterly* 119-128.

Bertot, John C., Paul T. Jaeger, and Justin M. Grimes. 2010. "Using ICTs to create a culture of transparency: E-government and social media as openness and anti-corruption tools for societies." *Government Information Quarterly* 27 (Elsevier Inc) 264-271.

Bertot, John Carlo, Paul T. Jaeger, and Justin M. Grimes. 2012. "Promoting transparency and accountability through ICTs, social media, and collaborative e-government." *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy* 78-91.

- Chene, Marie. 2011. "Good practice in strengthening transparency, participation, accountability and integrity." *U4 Expert Answer* (U4 Anti-Corruption Centre CHR. Michelsen Institute) 1-11.
- Chêne, Marie. 2016. *The use of ICTs in the fight against corruption*. Berlin: Transparency International, 1-16.
- Córdoba, José-Rodrigo. 2014. "Systemic Patterns of Practice to Improve." In *Measuring E-government Efficiency*, by Manuel Pedro Rodríguez-Bolívar, 9. New York: Springer Science+Business Media.
- Davies, Tim, and Silvana Fumega. 2014. "Mixed incentives: Adopting ICT innovations for transparency, accountability, and anti-corruption." *U4 Issue 2014 Anti-Corruption Resource Centre* (the Chr. Michelsen Institute (CMI)) 1-38.
- Denzin, Norman K., and Yvonna S. Lincoln. 2018. *Introduction: The Discipline and Practice of Qualitative Research*. California: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Dinas Kominfo Pemerintah Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta. 2019. "Pemda DIY Terbaik II Nasional SPBE Tahun 2018." Available at: <https://jogjaprov.go.id/berita/detail/7635-spbe-diy-terbaik-2-nasional>. Accessed November 21, 2019.
- Ear-Dupuy, Haidy, and Olivier Serrat. 2017. "Fighting Corruption with ICT: Strengthening Civil Society's Role." In *Knowledge Solutions*, by Olivier Serrat, 1-1127. Singapore: Springer Nature.
- Ganapati, Sukumar. 2015. *Using Mobile Apps in Government*. Research Report, Washington, DC : IBM Center for The Business of Government.
- Grimmelikhuijsen, Stephan G., and Eric W. Welch. 2012. "Developing and Testing a Theoretical Framework for Computer-Mediated Transparency of Local Governments." *Public Administration Review* 562-571.

- Heeks, Richard. 1999. "Information technology and the management of corruption." *Development in Practice* (Routledge) 184-189.
- Intan, Ghita. 2019. *Berantas Korupsi dengan IT, Pemerintah Klaim Tingkat Korupsi Menurun*. Accessed February 28, 2019.
- Irawan, Ade. 2019. "Korupsi Bencana, Bencana Korupsi." *Reading Reflection KOMPAS*, January 28: 6.
- Jiang, Xiao, and Shaobo Ji. 2015. "E-Government Web Portal Adoption: The Effects of Service Quality." *e-Service Journal* 43-60. Accessed August 29, 2019. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2979/eservicej.9.3.43>.
- Kathy, Charmaz. 2006. *Constructing Grounded Theory*: London: Sage Publications.
- Kuy, Mearssamng. 2014. "Corruption in Indonesia." 1-9.
- Lambert, Vickie A., and Clinton E. Lambert. 2012. *Qualitative Descriptive Research: An Acceptable Design*. Nonthaburi: Pacific Rim Int J Nurs Res.
- Lee, Gwanhoo, and Young Hoon Kwak. 2012. "An Open Government Maturity Model for social media-based public engagement." *Government Information Quarterly* (Elsevier Inc.) 492–503.
- Long-Sutehall, Tracy, Magi Sque, and Julia Addington-Hall. 2010. "Secondary analysis of qualitative data." 335-344.
- Mahmood, Mohammed, Vishanth Waerakkody, and Weifeng Chen. 2019. "The role of information and communications technology in the transformation of government and citizen trust." *International Review of Administrative Sciences* (SAGE) 1-20.
- Meijer, Alber. 2013. "Understanding the Complex Dynamics of Transparency." *Public Administration Review* 429-439.

- Mistry, Jamshed J. 2012. "The Role of eGovernance in Mitigating Corruption." *Accounting and the Public Interest* 137–159.
- Morris, Stephen D., and Joseph L. Klesner. 2010. "Corruption and Trust: Theoretical Considerations and Evidence from Mexico." *Comparative Political Studies* (SAGE) 1258-1285.
- Nurmandi. 2013. "What Is the Status of Indonesia's E-Procurement?" *Journal of Government and Politics*. 350-394.
- Olken, Benjamin A. 2007. "Monitoring Corruption: Evidence from a Field." *journal of political economy* 201.
- Park, Chul Hyn, and Koomin Kim Florida. 2019. "E-government as an anti-corruption tool: panel data analysis across countries." *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 1-17.
- Pathak, R.D., Gurmeet Singh, Rakesh Belwal, and R.F.I. Smith. 2007. "E-Governance and Corruption-developments and Issue in Ethiopia." *Public Organiz Rev* 195-208.
- Peixoto, Tiago, and Jonathan Fox. 2016. *When Does ICT-Enabled Citizen Voice Lead to Government Responsiveness?* The World Bank, 1-28.
- Purón-Cid, Gabriel. 2014. "Measuring e-Government Efficiency from the Perspective of Implementers: The Case of e-Budgeting in Mexico." *Public Administration and Information Technology* 5 114.
- Rodríguez-Bolívar, Manuel Pedro. 2014. *Measuring E-Government Efficiency*. New York: Springer Science+Business Media.
- Seregig, I Ketut. 2018. "Motives Of Criminal Acts Of Corruption In Indonesia." *Motives Of Criminal Acts*. 228-246.
- Sinuraya, Caroline Gratia, and Tutik Rachmawati. 2016. "Does ICTs Matter For Corruption?" *Asia Pasific Fraud Journal* 50.



Srimarga, Ilham Cendekia, Agus Wibowo, and Siti Aisah. 2018. "Efektifitas Pemanfaatan Teknologi Informasi dan Komunikasi (TIK) untuk Memperkuat Transparansi, Akuntabilitas Dan Partisipasi (TAP) serta Bagaimana Keserasian Interaksi Antara Platform Online dan Platform Offline." In *Ruang Publik dan Teknologi Informasi*, by Revy Sjahrial, 1-171. Jakarta: Hivos Asia Tenggara.

Sohuturon, Martahan. 2017. Accessed November 8, 2019. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20170329135040-32-203420/kpk-POLRI-dan-kejaksaan-berbagi-data-penyidikan-online>.

Srivastava, Shirish C., Thompson S. H. Teo, and Sarv Devaraj. 2016. "You Can't Bribe A Computer: Dealing with the Societal Challenge of Corruption Through ICT." *Special Issue: ICT And Social Challenges A1-A9*.

Wescott, Clay G. 2001. "E-GOVERNMENT IN THE ASIA-PACIFIC REGION." *Asian Journal of Political Science* 1-31.

Yunita, Novi Prisma, and Rudi Dwi Aprianto. 2018. "Kondisi Terkini Perkembangan Pelaksanaan E-Government Diindonesia: Analisis Website." *Seminar Nasional Teknologi Informasi dan Komunikasi* 330.

## **Internet**

Anti-Corruption Clearing House. 2018. *Citizen's Complaints (Dumas "Pengaduan Masyarakat")*. Jakarta: The Corruption Eradication Commission (KPK). Accessed February 24, 2019. <https://acch.kpk.go.id/id/statistik/pengaduan-masyarakat>.

Batamnews. Batamnews.co.id.2015. "Modus Kunker Fiktif dan Mark Up Tiket Pesawat di DPRD Batam." Available at: <https://www.batamnews.co.id/berita-4255-modus-kunker-fiktif-dan-mark-up-tiket-pesawat-di-dprd-batam--.html> . Accessed December 10, 2019.

- Beritasatu. 2012. "KPK: Kasus Suap Buol Sudah Dilaporkan Sejak 2010." Available at: <https://www.beritasatu.com/nasional/58594/kpk-kasus-suap-buol-sudah-dilaporkan-sejak-2010>. Accessed February 24, 2019.
- Chin, Charlene. 2016. *US\$96 million losses revealed in Indonesian education*. Accessed April 13, 2019. <https://govinsider.asia/inclusive-gov/us96-million-losses-revealed-in-indonesian-education/>.
- Coconuts Jakarta. 2019. *Indonesian mayor says he's firing everybody in his city's Transport Agency over corruption*. Accessed April 13, 2019. <https://coconuts.co/jakarta/news/indonesian-mayor-says-hes-firing-everybody-citys-transport-agency-corruption/>.
- CNN Indonesia. 2019. *Cable News Network, Inc*. Accessed September 16, 2019. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/teknologi/20190922100718-384-432656/smart-sim-dan-aplikasi-sim-online-resmi-diluncurkan>.
- CNN Indonesia. 2019. *Cable News Network, Inc*. Accessed November 26, 2019. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20190703135335-12-408724/ott-kpk-dua-jaksa-kejati-dki-terbukti-langgar-kode-etik>.
- CNN Indoneisa. 2019. Available at: <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20191101201027-20-444975/anies-bentuk-tim-bongkar-dugaan-manipulasi-anggaran-lem-aibon>. Accessed December 12, 2019.
- Danieli, Andrea Bardelli. 2008. *The "eGovernment for Development Information Exchange" Project*. Accessed August 20, 2019. <http://www.egov4dev.org/websites/basics/why.shtml>.
- Ferrissa, Winda. 2015. *60 persen desa di Indonesia sudah tersentuh TIK*. [https://kominfo.go.id/content/detail/11556/60-persen-desa-di-indonesia-sudah-tersentuh-tik/0/sorotan\\_media](https://kominfo.go.id/content/detail/11556/60-persen-desa-di-indonesia-sudah-tersentuh-tik/0/sorotan_media).
- Forum Pengadaan Indonesia. 2013. Available at: <https://forum.pengadaan.id/viewtopic.php?t=6919>. Accessed December 12, 2019.

- Hootsuite. 2019. *Indonesian Digital Report 2019*. Hootsuite (We are Social). Accessed April 13, 2019. <https://andi.link/hootsuite-we-are-social-indonesian-digital-report-2019/>.
- Haqu, Angga. 2018. Accessed December 3, 2019. <https://medium.com/@haqu/2018-edelmen-trust-index-indonesia-summaries-c06dad98b898>.
- Indonesian National Police or Kepolisian Negara Republik Indonesia (POLRI) 2019). Available: <https://www.POLRI.go.id/> Accessed November 26, 2019.
- Jati. 2019. "KPK Antisipasi Modus Korupsi Baru Lewat Fintech." C88 Financial Technologies Pte. Ltd. CekAja.com. Available at: <https://www.cekaja.com/info/kpk-antisipasi-modus-korupsi-baru-lewat-fintech/> Accessed December 5, 2019.
- Jurnaliston, Reza. 2019. *Permudah Layanan, Mulai Hari Ini KPK Buka Call Center 198*. Accessed February 25, 2019. <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2019/01/02/12340981/permudah-layanan-mulai-hari-ini-kpk-buka-call-center-198>.
- Kementerian Komunikasi dan Informatika Republik Indonesia. 2018. *Jumlah Pengguna Internet 2017 Meningkat, Kominfo Terus Lakukan Percepatan Pembangunan Broadband*. Accessed Februari 5, 2019. [https://kominfo.go.id/index.php/content/detail/12640/siaran-pers-no-53hmkominfo022018-tentang-jumlah-pengguna-internet-2017-meningkat-kominfo-terus-lakukan-percepatan-pembangunan-broadband/0/siaran\\_pers](https://kominfo.go.id/index.php/content/detail/12640/siaran-pers-no-53hmkominfo022018-tentang-jumlah-pengguna-internet-2017-meningkat-kominfo-terus-lakukan-percepatan-pembangunan-broadband/0/siaran_pers).
- Keuffer, Nicolas, and Vincent Mabillard. 2019. "Administrative openness and diversity in Swiss municipalities: how does local autonomy influence transparency practices?" *International Review of Administrative Sciences* (SAGE) 1-17.

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/332353829\\_Administrative\\_ openness\\_and\\_diversity\\_in\\_Swiss\\_municipalities\\_how\\_does\\_local\\_autonomy\\_influence\\_transparency\\_practices/download](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/332353829_Administrative_ openness_and_diversity_in_Swiss_municipalities_how_does_local_autonomy_influence_transparency_practices/download).

Kompas.com. 2018. *PT. Kompas Cyber Media*. Accessed October 12, 2019. <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2018/02/12/10562421/dpr-dan-kpk-resmikan-klinik-e-lhkpn>.

Kompas.com. 2018. *PT. Kompas Cyber Media*. Accessed November 12, 2019. <https://kilasdaerah.kompas.com/semarang/read/2018/04/26/000247128/pe-merintah-kota-semarang-berkinerja-terbaik-se-indonesia>.

Kompas.com. 2018. *PT. Kompas Cyber Media*. Accessed November 12, 2019. <https://kilasdaerah.kompas.com/semarang/read/2018/04/26/000247128/pe-merintah-kota-semarang-berkinerja-terbaik-se-indonesia>.

Kompas.com. 2016. “*Banyak Modus Kunjungan Kerja Fiktif*.” Available at: <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2016/05/15/08482901/Banyak.Modus.Kunjungan.Kerja.Fiktif?page=all>. Accessed December 18, 2019.

Linhartová, Veronika. 2017. "The Role of E-Government in Mitigating Corruption." 120-131. <https://dk.upce.cz/bitstream/handle/10195/67932/Linhartov%C3%A11.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y> .

LKPP. 2018. “*Urgensi Pengusutan Kasus Korupsi Pengadaan Barang/Jasa Melalui Tindak Pidana Pencucian Uang dan Kejahatan Korporasi*.” Available at: <http://www.lkpp.go.id/v3/#/read/5068>. Accessed December 12, 2019.

McGee, Rosie, Duncan Edwards, Colin Anderson, Hannah Hudson, and Francesca Feruglio. 2018. "Appropriating technology for accountability: messages from Making All Voices Count." <https://www.makingallvoicescount.org/publication/appropriating-technology-accountability-messages-making-voices-count-2/>

National Secretariat - Indonesian Forum for Budget Transparency. 2012. *Corruption (already happened) Happens Since Budget Planning*. Accessed

- April 13, 2019. <http://seknasfitra.org/korupsi-sudah-terjadi-sejak-perencanaan-anggaran/?lang=en>.
- Open Knowledge International. n.d. *Open Data handbook*. Accessed May 4, 2019. <http://opendatahandbook.org/glossary/en/terms/machine-readable/>.
- Pikiran Rakyat. 2018. *Cegah Korupsi, Perizinan di Jabar Kelak Serba Online*. Accessed April 13, 2019. <https://www.pikiran-rakyat.com/jawa-barat/2018/11/13/cegah-korupsi-perizinan-di-jabar-kelak-serba-online-433443>.
- Rahadian, Lalu. 2017. *KPK: E-Budgeting Bikin Daerah Sulit Main Anggaran*. Accessed April 11, 2019. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20170918140758-20-242455/kpk-e-budgeting-bikin-daerah-sulit-main-anggaran>.
- Rights, The Office of the High Commissioner for Human. 2000. *Development is a Human Right*. Accessed Maret 17, 2019. <https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Development/Pages/Introduction.aspx>.
- REPORTASEPAPUA.COM. 2019. "Mulai dari Tiket Palsu Hingga Bagi Bagi uang Terkuak dari dugaan Kasus Korupsi Dana Hibah di KPU Sarmi 2016." Available at: <https://reportasepapua.com/mulai-dari-tiket-palsu-hingga-bagi-bagi-uang-terkuak-dari-dugaan-kasus-korupsi-dana-hibah-di-kpu-sarmi-2016/>. Accessed December 18, 2019.
- Setiawan & Diah. 2019. Kompas.com. dengan judul "Per Juni 2019, LBH Jakarta Terima 4.500 Aduan soal Pinjaman Fintech." Available at: <https://money.kompas.com/read/2019/07/29/154700526/per-juni-2019lbh-jakarta-terima-4.500-aduan-soal-pinjaman-fintech>. Accessed September 25, 2019.
- Transparency International Indonesia. 2018. *Indeks Persepsi Korupsi Indonesia 2017*. Survey Report, Jakarta: Transparency International Indonesia. Accessed November 3, 2019. <https://riset.ti.or.id/corruption-perceptions-index-2017/>.

Water Integrity Global Outlook. 2019. *Transparency, Accountability & Participation*. Accessed March 17, 2019. <https://www.waterintegritynetwork.net/wigo/special-topics/transparency-accountability-participation/>.

Widowati, Dyah Puspito Dewi. 2018. *Survei PBB 2018: Peringkat E-Government Indonesia*. Accessed March 8, 2019. <https://bpptik.kominfo.go.id/2018/08/23/5938/survei-pbb-2018-peringkat-e-government-indonesia/>.

## **Report**

Indonesian Corruption Watch. 2017. *The Trend of Corruption Cases in 2017*. Jakarta: ICW.

Indonesian Corruption Watch. 2018. *The Trends of Corruption Cases in 2018*. Jakarta: ICW.

Indonesian Corruption Watch. 2016. *The Failure of Bureaucratic Reform and Rise of the Local Elite Capture Phenomenon*. Jakarta: Indonesian Corruption Watch.

TEKNOPRENEUR, and APJII. 2017. *Infografis Penetrasi & Perilaku Pengguna Internet Indonesia 2017*. Jakarta: TEKNOPRENEUR; APJII.

The Conversation. 2017. *The Conversation*. September 12. Accessed February 26, 2019. <https://theconversation.com/responsive-leaders-needed-to-encourage-citizen-participation-82583>.

Transparency International. 2018. *Transparency International*. Accessed May 6, 2019. <https://www.transparency.org/cpi2018>.

*Transparency International*. 2018. *Transparency International*. Accessed May 2019, 6. <https://www.transparency.org/country/IDN>.

## **Other Sources:**

The President Instruction (INPRES) Number 3 of 2003 about The Policy and E-Government Strategic Development.

The Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 95 of 2018 about Government System with Electronic based

Law of The Republic of Indonesia Number 31 Year 1999 regarding Eradication of Criminal Acts of Corruption)

The President Instruction (INPRES) Number 7 of 2015 about Action of Corruption Prevention and Eradication of 2015